

Review Form 1.7

| | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name: | Journal of Experimental Agriculture International |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_JEAI_118372 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Feeding and Biotic Potential of Coccinellid Predators on Coriander Aphid |
| Type of the Article | |

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journaljeai.com/index.php/JEAI/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <p>The paper is very relevant. It falls within the field of agroecology and bio-pest control, two very important areas for agriculture and human and animal health. however, in its current form, I'd advise publishing it as a short note. for a full and powerful paper, all these parts would need to be expanded.</p> <p>For the title, I propose: Contribution to studying the feeding and biotic potential of Coccinellidae, predators of coriander aphids.</p> <p>The sections of the paper are well laid out and organised</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Introduction, <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Can you add a sales performance to understand the economic importance of coriander? Can you please add the name of the aphid species used? Material and methods <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Material and method are not sufficiently detailed The statistical study method is missing Information on the conditions and exact duration of rearing is missing. Give an idea of the density of aphids supplied and the density of ladybirds per rearing box for all age categories. It would be very important to add figures relating to the animals used and the rearing conditions. To indicate the number of replicates during the food weighting experiment Results and discussion <ul style="list-style-type: none"> I suggest that information's on environmental conditions should be summarised as averages over the experimental period and that this should be included in the Materials and Methods section. I suggest that the environmental conditions be summarised as an average and included in the Material and Methods section. To specify whether aphid consumption is per individual or per batch Between 7 and 13 aphids there is a clear difference. I suggest that this should be reported as biomass if at all possible (in all the remainder of this section) You can't say fo C. septempunctata "the main predator" if you haven't compared it with at least one other predator Conclusion The conclusion is very short and includes a repetition of one part of the results, it needs to be written out completely. <p>REFERENCES</p> <p>The references are within the standards but old in several cases. I ask if the authors can add new references. I give as examples:</p> <p>Pawan Kumar Choudhary, KC Kumawat and Suresh Jakhar 2022, Seasonal abundance of aphid, Rhopalosiphum maidis (Fitch) and its natural enemies on barley (Hordeum vulgare Linn.) and Predatory potential of major Coccinellid predators on aphid (Rhopalosiphum maidis) The Pharma Innovation Journal 2022; 11(2): 2760-2764</p> <p>Liu Zhang, Abstract Zifang Qin, Xinxin Zhao, Xinzheng Huang and Wangpeng Shi 2021, Effects of aphid-induced semiochemicals from coverplantsonHarmoniaaxyridis(Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) Pest Manag Sci 2022; 78: 3305–3313</p> <p>PEDRO HENRIQUE BRUM TOGNI, 2014. HABITAT MANIPULATION FOR CONSERVATION BIOLOGICAL CONTROL IN ORGANIC VEGETABLE CROPS Tese apresentada à Universidade Federal de Viçosa, como parte das exigências do Programa de PósGraduação em Entomologia, para obtenção do título de Doctor Scientiae. Pp90</p> <p>RUDRA N. BORKAKATI, D. K. SAIKIA AND VENKATESH, M. R. 2019. HABITAT MANIPULATION FOR MANAGING INSECT PESTS OF BRINJAL. Indian Journal of</p> | |

Review Form 1.7

| | | |
|---|--|--|
| | <p>Entomology, 81(4): 717-720 Nazia Ehsan1, Naureen Rana, Muhammad Asghar, Muhammad Afzal and Muhammad Yaseen 2020, EX-SITU PREDATION POTENTIAL OF APHIDOPHAGOUS COCCINELLIDS, Pak. J. Agri. Sci. 57(5), 1279-1286. EDIRISINGHE H. M., LESCHEN R. A. B., DALE J. AND WIGNALL A. E. 2021, INSIGHTS INTO THE ESTABLISHMENT OF INTRODUCED SPECIES USING COCCINELLINES (COLEOPTERA:COCCINELLIDAE) AS A MODEL SYSTEM; The Coleopterists Bulletin, 75(1): 121–149. Kellil H., Khalissa, Mohguen K. & Si Bachir A., 2020, Relation entre les populations de Coccinella septempunctata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) et les espèces aphidiennes ravageuses des céréales dans la région de Sétif (Nord-Est algérien) (Relationship between populations of Coccinella septempunctata (Coleoptera: Coccinellidae) and aphid pests of cereals in the Sétif region (north-east Algeria)) Commission for IP and Biocontrol in North-African Countries IOBC-WPRS Bulletin 151. 28-34</p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|---------------------------------|
| Name: | El Gtari Mohamed |
| Department, University & Country | University of Carthage, Tunisia |