

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Engineering Research and Reports
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JERR_118346
Title of the Manuscript:	Evaluating the Compaction Behavior of Oil-Contaminated Soils for Civil Engineering Applications
Type of the Article	

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) 2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) 3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? 4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This manuscript is of critical importance to the scientific community because of the effect of varying concentrations of petroleum products on the physical properties of the environment, such as wetting and compaction. An important point is to determine the classification of soil type based on the experiment, which contributes to general scientific knowledge about soil behaviour in regions of oil pollution. In addition, the article discusses the possibility of quickly solving the problem of disposal of oil-contaminated waste by using it in civil construction. 2. The title of the article fully reflects the essence of the article and can be used without correction in the final version of the article recommended for publication. 3. The abstract of the article, in general, is comprehensive and presents experimentally proven research results. But, on the other hand, the abstract is presented in general phrases; it could be recommended to specify the results with the provision of statistically reliable data on changes in soil density and moisture as a result of the influence of various concentrations of petroleum products. 4. The structure of the article must be changed according to the requirements of the journal, using titles, subtitles etc and numbers to separate parts of the article: 2; 2.1; 2.1.1, etc. In addition, authors must enter data on Competing Interests, Authors' contributions. The list of references must be prepared in accordance with the requirements of this journal. 5. In general, the experiments and comparative analysis were carried out scientifically correctly, but the language used is verbally poor, especially in the discussion part. The conclusion contains general phrases without presenting the specific results of this study. 6. Most of the literature used is generally quite recent. But out of 20 sources, 6 references to the works of the authors Ajayi, N. D., Ajayi, S. A., Oladoyinbo, O. B., & Olaniyi, O. O. In my opinion, it is necessary to expand the literature search to other geographical, weather-climatic and soil conditions of the influence of similar petroleum products on compaction indicators and soil moisture and experience of their use in civil engineering. For example: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Nwachukwu, Alphonso & Okoro, Bon & Osuagwu, Joachim & Levi, Nwkwasi Ngozi & Onyechere, Chigozie. (2020). Index and Compaction Properties of Oil Contaminated Clay Soils in Niger - Delta Region of Nigeria. Saudi Journal of Engineering and Technology. 05. 81-85. 10.36348/sjet.2020.v05i02.007. • Hernández-Hernández, Víctor & Joya-Cárdenas, Diego & Equihua, Luisa & Leal-Vaca, Julio & Diosdado De la Peña, José Angel & Pérez-Moreno, Luis & Robles, Noé & Saldaña-Robles, Alberto. (2021). Experimental and numerical analysis of triaxial compression test for a clay soil. Chilean journal of agricultural research. 81. 357-367. 10.4067/S0718-58392021000300357. • Devic, Gordana & Bulatović, Sandra & Ilic, Mila & Knudsen, Tatjana & Maric, Nenad & Avdalovic, Jelena & Vrvic, Miroslav. (2022). Geoderma Organic Geochemical Biomarkers for Estimation of Petroleum Inputs in Soil of Alluvial Area Near Sava River, New Belgrade (Serbia). SSRN Electronic Journal. 10.2139/ssrn.4192419. • Adedokun, Solomon & Nnabugwu, U. & Iuremi, J.. (2023). Geotechnical Stabilization Potential of Cement Admixed with Rice Husk Ash on the Crude Oil Polluted Laterite Soil: A Case Study of Ebendo, Delta State, Nigeria. LAUTECH Journal of Civil and Environmental Studies. 10. 10.36108/laujoces/3202.01.0260. 	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? 	<p>The academic style of writing an article is poor; it is necessary to enrich the text with scientific descriptive phrases. The text of the article should represent a complete scientific work with the author's view of the formulation and solution of the problem, with a comparative analysis with</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	literary data.	
Optional/General comments	<p>The research results presented in the article are original, but for publication in the form of an article, adjustments are necessary in the following areas:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• according to the structure of the article;• on the analysis of literature data with the inclusion of studies in a similar direction in different geographical, weather, climatic and soil conditions;• it is necessary to strengthen the discussion part;• it is necessary to specify the Conclusion with the presentation of specific data from this study;• it is necessary to expand the list of references and prepare it at the request of the journal. <p>After making changes, the article can be recommended for publication.</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Akmaral U. Issayeva
Department, University & Country	Shymkent University, Kazakhstan