

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJPSS_118700</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Response of different level of Nitrogen and Foliar application of Nano Zinc on Soil health in cultivation of Wheat (Triticum aestivum L.) Var. PWB-373</b>
Type of the Article	

## Review Form 1.7

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Importance:</b> The authors aimed to conduct a field experiment during the spring of 2023-24 to investigate the impact of different levels of nitrogen and foliar nano zinc on soil health and yield attributes of wheat.</li> <li><b>Title:</b> Very long and preferred to be modified into <b>"Nitrogen and Foliar Nano Zinc Concerning Soil health in Wheat cultivation"</b>.</li> <li><b>Abstract:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide an opening statement of one or two short sentences as a background on the problem.</li> <li>Use the international names for the seasons instead of the Hindi names.</li> <li>Provide some details on the treatments used.</li> <li>Add the P-value for the significant results.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Structure of the manuscript:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Keywords:</b> Re-arrange in alphabetical order and modify as suggested.</li> <li><b>Introduction:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Improperly arranged in four paragraphs.</li> <li>The introduction has to be re-arranged into three paragraphs i.e. 1. Introduction 2. Significance of the study, and 3. Aim of the study.</li> <li>Re-check the writing style of the scientific names.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>The aim:</b> Not listed. The aim has to be listed by the end of the introduction section.</li> <li><b>Materials and methods:</b> Defective, please notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide the institutional ethical approval for the study.</li> <li>Use the international expressions for the seasons instead of the Hindi expressions.</li> <li>Provide the model and source of pH meter, EC meter, U.V. Spectrophotometer, and Metzer Flame Photometer.</li> <li>MUST add a separate section for the statistical analysis with the software used and a reference for it, as well as the used model for the analysis.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Results:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Reduce the illustration of numbers among the text as they are listed in the tables and figures.</li> <li>Must add the P-value for the significant results.</li> <li>Do not list the detailed composition of each treatment all over the text and use their abbreviations instead.</li> <li>Do not use the sign "@" and either delete it or use "at a rate of" for more scientific meaning.</li> <li>Re-check the writing style of the scientific names.</li> <li>Many modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Discussion:</b> Clear to a certain extent with moderate comparisons and speculation.</li> <li><b>Conclusion:</b> Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> <li><b>Tables:</b> Properly arranged and well organized.</li> <li><b>Figure:</b> Properly arranged and well organized.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Scientific Soundness:</b> highlighted that treatment involved 100% nitrogen, phosphorus, and potassium fertilizers, along with two sprays of nano nitrogen and nano zinc (4 ml/l) at 25-30 DAS, resulted in the highest gross return (₹1,31,711 ha<sup>-1</sup>), net return (₹89,872 ha<sup>-1</sup>), and BC ratio (2.15), as well as N 100 + P 100% + K 100% + N Zn (2ml l<sup>-1</sup>) which is almost the second-best treatment combination in all aspects proven to be economically optimal. These findings suggest that nano fertilizers can effectively enhance soil health and wheat productivity.</li> <li><b>References:</b> MUST BE UPDATED as 26.3% (5 out of 19) of the listed references were published in the past five years. The percentage has to increase to at least 35-40%. Old references and lack of updates indicate that the study is no longer a point of interest.</li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p><b>General view:</b> The manuscript was expressed in moderate English and grammar. Professional copyediting, proofreading, proper display of the abstract and the introduction, declaring some explanations in the materials and methods section, and necessarily updating the references have to be carried out before resubmission to achieve publishing value.</p>	

**Review Form 1.7**

<b>Optional/General</b> comments		
----------------------------------	--	--

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Essam Samir Soliman</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Suez Canal University, Egypt</b>