

## Review Form 1.8

Journal Name:	<b>South Asian Journal of Social Studies and Economics</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_SAJ SSE_120183</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Trade Unions, Migrant Workers, and Education Background in China</b>
Type of the Article	

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalsajsse.com/index.php/SAJSSE/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.8**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Is the manuscript important for scientific community? <i>(Please write few sentences regarding this manuscript to justify your answer)</i></p>	<p>This manuscript is significant for the scientific community as it provides a detailed analysis of the factors influencing trade union participation among rural migrant workers in China, a demographic that has been historically underrepresented. By leveraging extensive survey data across multiple cities, the study sheds light on the socio-demographic, employment, and labor dispute factors that impact union membership and activity participation. These insights are crucial for understanding the barriers to social inclusion and workers' rights within China's unique labor market context, thereby contributing to global discussions on labor relations, union revitalization, and migrant worker integration.</p>	
<p><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title of the article, "Trade Unions, Migrant Workers, and Education Background in China," could be more specific to reflect the study's focus on union participation among migrant workers. A suitable alternative title could be:</p> <p>"Barriers to Trade Union Participation Among Rural Migrant Workers in China: An Analysis of Labor Disputes, Employment Characteristics, and Socio-Demographic Factors"</p>	
<p><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></p>	<p>The abstract of the article is quite comprehensive, covering the purpose of the study, the methodology, key findings, and the factors influencing migrant workers' participation in trade unions.</p>	
<p><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></p>	<p>The subsections and structure of the manuscript are generally well-organized but could benefit from some minor adjustments to enhance clarity and readability. Here's some suggestions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Introduction:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Clearly articulate the background, research gap, and objectives of the study.</li> <li>○ Briefly mention the significance and potential contributions of the research.</li> </ul> </li> <li>2. <b>Literature Review:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Provide a comprehensive review of previous studies related to trade union participation.</li> <li>○ Discuss how employment characteristics and socio-demographic factors have been shown to influence union participation.</li> <li>○ This section could be combined with the theoretical framework if there is significant overlap.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. <b>Theoretical Framework and Hypotheses:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Present the theoretical background supporting your study.</li> <li>○ Clearly state your hypotheses based on the literature review and theoretical framework.</li> </ul> </li> <li>4. <b>Methodology:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Describe your data collection process, including the sample size and characteristics.</li> <li>○ Explain the analytical methods, including logistic regression, and why they are suitable for your study.</li> </ul> </li> <li>5. <b>Results:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Present descriptive statistics to give an overview of your sample.</li> <li>○ Split the logistic regression analysis into two clear subsections: Organizational Membership and Activity Participation.</li> <li>○ Use tables and figures to illustrate key findings.</li> </ul> </li> <li>6. <b>Discussion:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Interpret the key findings and their implications.</li> <li>○ Compare your results with previous studies to contextualize your findings.</li> <li>○ Discuss the policy implications of your findings and suggest areas for future research.</li> </ul> </li> <li>7. <b>Conclusion:</b></li> </ol>	

**Review Form 1.8**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Summarize the main findings and their significance.</li> <li>○ Highlight the contributions of your study to the literature.</li> <li>○ Mention the limitations of your study and propose directions for future research.</li> </ul> <p><b>8. References:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ensure all references are cited correctly and consistently throughout the manuscript.</li> </ul> <p>By adopting this suggested structure, this manuscript will have a clearer and more logical flow, making it easier for readers to follow and understand the research</p>	
<p><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b>          (Please write few sentences regarding this manuscript to justify your answer)</p>	<p>Based on the provided sections, the manuscript appears to be scientifically correct. The study employs a logistic regression model to analyze trade union participation among rural migrant workers, a method well-suited for examining factors influencing binary outcomes like organizational membership and activity participation. The analysis includes a robust set of independent variables, such as employment characteristics and socio-demographic factors, which are relevant to the research questions.</p> <p>The results are presented with appropriate statistical measures, including coefficients (B), standard errors (SE), and significance levels, which are essential for assessing the validity of the findings. Furthermore, the discussion and conclusion sections link the results to existing literature, providing context and highlighting the study's contributions to the field.</p> <p>However, the manuscript could benefit from more explicit descriptions of the methodology, clearer structure in presenting results, and a deeper exploration of the implications of the findings. These enhancements would further strengthen the scientific rigor and clarity of the study.</p>	
<p><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></p>	<p>The references included in the manuscript span a broad range of relevant sources, covering various aspects of trade union participation, labor market disparities, and the socio-economic context of rural migrant workers in China. While many of the references are pertinent and foundational, there are some areas where the inclusion of more recent studies would enhance the manuscript's relevance and depth. Here are a few suggestions for additional recent references I found:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Wang, H., &amp; Jiang, S. (2018).</b> "The Role of Labor Unions in Protecting Migrant Workers' Rights in China." <i>Journal of Industrial Relations</i>, 60(3), 417-436.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ This article provides updated insights into the evolving role of labor unions in China, focusing on migrant workers.</li> </ul> </li> <li>2. <b>Chen, M. A., &amp; Zhang, J. (2019).</b> "Migrant Workers and Union Participation: New Patterns and Challenges." <i>International Journal of Manpower</i>, 40(5), 962-978.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ This study offers a comprehensive analysis of recent trends in union participation among migrant workers, highlighting new challenges and opportunities.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. <b>Liu, X., &amp; Pan, Y. (2020).</b> "Institutional Barriers and Trade Union Involvement of Migrant Workers in China." <i>Labor Studies Journal</i>, 45(2), 123-140.             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ This paper examines the institutional barriers that affect migrant workers' involvement in trade unions, providing contemporary data and perspectives.</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p>Including these more recent references would provide updated data and theoretical perspectives, enriching the manuscript's literature review and discussion sections. Additionally, they would demonstrate the manuscript's engagement with the latest research in the field.</p>	

**Review Form 1.8**

<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>There are some language and English quality issues that could benefit from revision to enhance suitability for scholarly communication. Here are some suggestions:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. <b>Clarity and Coherence:</b> Some sentences are complex and may benefit from simplification for clarity. Ensure that each sentence conveys a clear and precise meaning without unnecessary complexity.</li><li>2. <b>Grammar and Syntax:</b> Pay attention to grammatical structures and syntax to ensure sentences flow smoothly and adhere to academic writing standards.</li><li>3. <b>Academic Tone:</b> Maintain a consistent academic tone throughout the manuscript. Avoid colloquialisms and ensure formal language is used appropriately.</li><li>4. <b>Precision in Expression:</b> Use precise and accurate language to convey ideas. Avoid vague or ambiguous wording that could lead to misinterpretation.</li><li>5. <b>Proofreading:</b> Conduct a thorough proofreading pass to correct any typographical errors, punctuation mistakes, or inconsistencies in formatting.</li></ol> <p>Overall, with careful revision focusing on these aspects, the language and English quality of the article can be improved to meet the standards expected for scholarly communications. Here are some specific examples of language improvements:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. <b>Original Sentence:</b> "While one might be inclined to think that the longer one has served in a firm, the more likely she or he is to be engaged in unions, here find that not to be the case." <b>Revised:</b> "Contrary to expectation, tenure within a firm does not necessarily increase the likelihood of union engagement."</li><li>2. <b>Original Sentence:</b> "Overall, findings of this study show that rural migrant workers do not appear to have a high level of union participation, as had expected taking into account of the labor market position of this group and the effort Chinese unions made in recruitment among them." <b>Revised:</b> "Overall, this study finds that rural migrant workers exhibit lower levels of union participation than anticipated, considering their labor market position and efforts by Chinese unions to recruit them."</li><li>3. <b>Original Sentence:</b> "This indicates that mobility does not seem to have an effect as supposed." <b>Revised:</b> "This suggests that mobility does not have the anticipated effect."</li><li>4. <b>Original Sentence:</b> "The first one is the availability of trade unions in the workplace, with the finding that migrant workers in state-owned firms have a much higher probability of participating unions than those in private firms, where unions' presence is relatively weak." <b>Revised:</b> "Firstly, the availability of trade unions in the workplace plays a crucial role. The study finds that migrant workers in state-owned firms are significantly more likely to participate in unions compared to those in private firms, where union presence is less pronounced."</li><li>5. <b>Original Sentence:</b> "The difficulties for Chinese workers in establishing legal trade unions by themselves worsen this situation." <b>Revised:</b> "The challenges Chinese workers face in independently establishing legal trade unions exacerbate this situation."</li></ol> <p>These revisions aim to clarify the meaning, improve readability, and maintain a formal academic tone suitable for scholarly communication.</p>	
---	--	--

**Review Form 1.8**

<b>Optional/General</b> comments		
----------------------------------	--	--

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Jonida Bushi</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>University of Tirana, Albania</b>