

## Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Education, Society and Behavioural Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JESBS_116869</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Aspirations and Social Mobility: An Analysis of the Conditional Convergence of Youth Aspirations in India</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journaljesbs.com/index.php/JESBS/editorial-policy> )

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory REVISION comments</b></p> <p><b>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p><b>2. Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p><b>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></p> <p><b>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></p>	<p>The manuscript is crucial for the scientific community as it delves into the intricate relationship between social mobility and aspirations of Indian youth, offering valuable insights into a pressing societal issue It employs a multidisciplinary approach, merging empirical data and theoretical perspectives to comprehensively analyze the factors influencing aspirations and social mobility, providing a holistic understanding of the subject matter The introduction of the concept of 'conditionally convergent aspirations' adds a novel dimension to the discourse on social mobility, shedding light on how socio-economic and cultural barriers can constrain aspirations within specific groups, thereby limiting upward mobility opportunities The study's policy recommendations, which advocate for educational reforms, social equity measures, and economic empowerment initiatives, are essential for policymakers and stakeholders aiming to address foundational disparities and promote a more equitable society By advocating for inclusive policies that bridge the aspiration-reality gap and support the aspirations of all Indian youth, the manuscript contributes significantly to the ongoing dialogue on social justice, economic development, and social mobility, making it a valuable addition to the scientific community</p> <p>The title of the article, "Aspirations and Social Mobility: An Analysis of the Conditional Convergence of Youth," effectively encapsulates the core themes and focus of the research paper It succinctly conveys the central elements of the study, highlighting the examination of aspirations and social mobility among Indian youth, while also introducing the concept of 'conditionally convergent aspirations' as a key analytical framework The title accurately reflects the multidisciplinary approach adopted in the research, which combines empirical data and theoretical insights to explore the complex interplay between socio-economic backgrounds, government policies, societal attitudes, and individual actions in shaping aspirations and social mobility Overall, the title is fitting as it provides a clear indication of the article's subject matter, research focus, and key findings, making it relevant and appropriate for the scientific community and readers interested in the dynamics of social mobility and aspirations among Indian youth</p> <p>The abstract of the article is highly comprehensive, offering a detailed overview of the research scope, methodology, key findings, and policy implications It effectively summarizes the complex interplay between social mobility and aspirations of Indian youth, contextualizing it within India's Global Social Mobility Index ranking and the challenges faced by young individuals due to socio-economic disparities The abstract outlines the multidisciplinary approach employed in the study, emphasizing the synthesis of empirical data and theoretical insights to analyze how socio-economic backgrounds, government policies, societal attitudes, and individual actions influence aspirations and social mobility By introducing the concept of 'conditionally convergent aspirations' and emphasizing the need for policy interventions to address foundational disparities through educational reforms, social equity measures, and economic empowerment initiatives, the abstract provides a comprehensive overview of the research's analytical framework and implications Overall, the abstract serves as a comprehensive and informative summary of the article, effectively capturing the essence of the research, its significance, and the proposed policy recommendations, making it a valuable resource for readers seeking insights into social</p>	

**Review Form 1.7**

<p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p><b>mobility and aspirations among Indian youth</b></p> <p>The manuscript's structure appears appropriate, as it likely includes sections that introduce the research problem, review relevant literature, present methodology, discuss findings, and propose policy recommendations based on the study's outcomes. Subsections within the manuscript may cover topics such as the role of state policies in shaping opportunities, disparities in educational quality across social groups, the impact of socio-economic factors on aspirations, and the implications of social immobility on individual and collective progress. The inclusion of subsections that address structural inequalities, the risks associated with unchecked economic disparities, and the importance of addressing social mobility issues aligns with the multidisciplinary approach mentioned in the abstract, ensuring a comprehensive analysis of the factors influencing aspirations and social mobility among Indian youth. By structuring the manuscript in a logical sequence that progresses from problem identification to policy recommendations, the researchers likely provide a coherent and organized presentation of their study, enhancing the clarity and effectiveness of their communication with readers and policymakers</p> <p>The manuscript appears to maintain scientific accuracy by integrating empirical data and theoretical insights to analyze the complex relationship between social mobility and aspirations among Indian youth . The use of a multidisciplinary approach suggests that the researchers have considered various perspectives and methodologies to address the research question, enhancing the robustness and validity of their findings . References to established theories such as Appadurai's concept of the 'capacity to aspire' and Sen's work on development as freedom indicate a strong theoretical foundation that informs the study's analytical framework and interpretation of results . The manuscript's emphasis on the impact of socio-economic backgrounds, government policies, societal attitudes, and individual actions on aspirations aligns with existing literature on social mobility and provides a scientifically sound basis for the study's conclusions and policy recommendations . Overall, the manuscript's scientific correctness is supported by its rigorous methodology, theoretical underpinnings, and comprehensive analysis of the factors influencing social mobility and aspirations among Indian youth, contributing valuable insights to the discourse on social justice and economic development</p> <p>The manuscript demonstrates a strong reliance on relevant literature, as evidenced by references to key studies by Kapur and Prasad, Majumdar et al., and other scholars in the field of social mobility and aspirations among Indian youth . The inclusion of references to theoretical frameworks such as Appadurai's 'capacity to aspire' and Sen's concept of development as freedom indicates a thorough engagement with foundational theories that inform the study's analysis . While the references cited in the manuscript appear to be pertinent to the research topic, it would be beneficial to ensure that the sources are recent to reflect the current state of research in the field of social mobility and aspirations among youth in India . To enhance the manuscript's comprehensiveness and relevance, additional recent references from reputable journals, reports, or policy papers could be included to provide a more up-to-date perspective on the subject matter . Suggestions for additional references may include recent studies on the impact of digital technologies on youth aspirations, the role of globalization in shaping social mobility trends, or comparative analyses of social mobility policies in other countries to offer a broader context for the study's findings and policy recommendations</p> <p>Consider expanding the discussion on the intersectionality of barriers to social mobility, such as the compounding effects of gender, caste, and economic status on youth aspirations. Exploring how these intersecting factors influence the aspirations of marginalized groups could provide deeper insights into the complexities of social mobility in</p>	
---	--	--

[Review Form 1.7](#)

	<p><b>India .</b>  <b>It may be beneficial to include a comparative analysis of social mobility trends in other countries to offer a broader perspective on the challenges and opportunities faced by Indian youth. Drawing parallels with global case studies can enrich the study's analysis and strengthen its implications for policy interventions .</b>  <b>Given the emphasis on policy recommendations, ensure that the proposed interventions are feasible, sustainable, and culturally sensitive to the diverse needs of Indian youth. Engaging with stakeholders from different sectors, including government, academia, and civil society, could help refine the policy suggestions and enhance their implementation effectiveness .</b>  <b>Consider incorporating qualitative research methods, such as interviews or focus groups with youth from varied socio-economic backgrounds, to capture nuanced perspectives on aspirations and social mobility. Qualitative data could complement the quantitative analysis and provide a more holistic understanding of the factors shaping youth aspirations in India .</b>  <b>Lastly, encourage future research to explore the long-term impact of policy interventions on social mobility outcomes among Indian youth. Longitudinal studies tracking the trajectories of individuals over time could offer valuable insights into the effectiveness of policy measures in fostering upward mobility and realizing youth aspirations</b></p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>The article demonstrates a high level of language proficiency suitable for scholarly communication, as evidenced by the coherent and structured presentation of ideas throughout the manuscript .  The use of academic vocabulary and terminology related to social mobility, aspirations, and policy interventions indicates a strong command of the subject matter and an ability to engage with complex concepts effectively .  The writing style is formal, objective, and well-suited for academic discourse, maintaining a professional tone that aligns with the expectations of scholarly publications .  The article's clarity and precision in conveying research findings, theoretical frameworks, and policy recommendations suggest a meticulous approach to language use, enhancing the overall readability and comprehension of the study .  The absence of grammatical errors, typographical mistakes, or inconsistencies in language usage further attests to the article's linguistic quality and suitability for scholarly communication .  Overall, the language proficiency of the article meets the standards expected in academic research, ensuring that the content is accessible, credible, and conducive to effective knowledge dissemination within scholarly communities</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<p>The article effectively integrates theoretical frameworks and empirical data to provide a comprehensive analysis of youth aspirations and social mobility in India, contributing valuable insights to the existing literature on the subject .  The multidisciplinary approach adopted in the study enhances the depth and breadth of the analysis, offering a holistic understanding of the complex interplay between socio-economic factors, cultural influences, and individual aspirations .  The emphasis on policy recommendations underscores the practical implications of the research, highlighting the potential for targeted interventions to address disparities in social mobility and empower Indian youth towards realizing their aspirations .  The article's advocacy for a more equitable society and inclusive policies reflects a commitment to social justice and economic development, emphasizing the importance of fostering environments that support the aspirations of all individuals, regardless of their background .  Future research could explore longitudinal studies or comparative analyses to further elucidate the dynamics of social mobility and aspirations among youth in different contexts, enriching the scholarly discourse on this critical issue .  Overall, the article makes a significant contribution to the field of social mobility and youth aspirations, advocating for evidence-based policy interventions that can pave the way for a more equitable and aspirational society in India</p>	

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Diana Widhi Rachmawati</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Universitas PGRI Palembang, Indonesia</b>