Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	**Asian Journal of Probability and Statistics**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_AJPAS_118093**
Title of the Manuscript:	**ASYMPTOTIC PROPERTIES OF A THREE PARAMETERS GUMBEL DISTRIBUTION ESTIMATORS USING SIMULATED DATA**
Type of the Article	

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: **Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments **1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?** (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) **2. Is the title of the article suitable?** (If not please suggest an alternative title) **3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?** **4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?** **5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?** **6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.** **(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)**	**This research work will become more relevant if a real time data analysis is done along with Simulation Study.** **The title is relevant since they are testing the asymptotic properties of the parameters** **The authors must more precise on the methodology.** **The authors have provided the theorems and properties but they have not derived it for this particular distribution.** **The work is scientifically incorrect because the sample generation should be from the Quantile function of the 3parmeter Gumbel distribution. The quantile function must be equation with Uniform (0,1). They not mentioned about how they draw the samples. The samples must come from the distribution presented in equation (1). They must report the coverage probability for the simulation work. A real time data analysis must be done to show that the asymptotic properties are satisfied for both simulated data as well as real time data analysis.** **The reference need to be much more comprehensive. The authors must do more research in this area. They can also test the other estimation techniques such as method of moments and Bayesian inference. "E**stimating parameters of Gumbel distribution using the methods of moments, probability weighted moments and maximum likelihood." By Smail Mahdi and Myrtene Cenac. This work is completely ignored in the reference. **The authors need to completely change the simulation techniques especially how they drawn the samples. A Quantile function must be established and through the quantile function they have to generate the samples.**	
Minor REVISION comments **1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?**	The language is poorly articulated in some areas. I have identified lot of grammar and spelling mistakes. The notations are not followed uniformly.	
Optional/General comments	This research work needs complete revamp. Make it more scientifically relevant.	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Review Form 1.7

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Vincent Raja Anthonisamy**
Department, University & Country	**University of Guyana, India**