Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	**Asian Journal of Probability and Statistics**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_AJPAS_118093**
Title of the Manuscript:	**ASYMPTOTIC PROPERTIES OF A THREE PARAMETERS GUMBEL DISTRIBUTION ESTIMATORS USING SIMULATED DATA**
Type of the Article	**Research article**

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments **1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?** (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) **2. Is the title of the article suitable?** (If not please suggest an alternative title) **3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?** **4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?** **5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?** **6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.** **(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)**	**No, the manuscript's importance is limited due to its reliance on simulated data, lack of real-world application examples, and insufficient empirical validation.** **The title is suitable as it accurately describes the focus on the asymptotic properties of estimators for a three-parameter Gumbel distribution using simulated data.** **No, the abstract is not comprehensive. It lacks details on the practical implications, specific results of the simulations, and potential applications of the three-parameter Gumbel distribution.** **No.** **Not at all.** **No. very short and brief.**	
Minor REVISION comments **1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?**		
Optional/General comments	The document "ASYMPTOTIC PROPERTIES OF A THREE PARAMETERS GUMBEL DISTRIBUTION ESTIMATORS USING SIMULATED DATA" introduces a three-parameter Gumbel distribution to enhance the traditional model's flexibility and robustness in extreme value theory. It employs the Marshall and Olkin method to add a shape parameter, with parameters estimated via Maximum Likelihood Estimation (MLE). The study claims the estimators are unbiased, consistent, and efficient, particularly with larger sample sizes, supported by simulation studies. However, as a reviewer, I must reject the paper due to insufficient empirical validation, lack of real-world application examples, and an over-reliance on simulated data without demonstrating practical utility in diverse extreme value scenarios.	

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**Jaber Kazempoor**
Department, University & Country	**Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Iran**