

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Journal of Experimental Agriculture International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_119220
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECT OF IBA AND ROOTING MEDIA ON AIR LAYERING IN KINNOW (CITRUS SPP)
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> The paper investigates the effect of different combinations of IBA (Indole-3-butyric acid) and rooting media on air layering in Kinnow (Citrus spp.). The study is structured well and provides detailed experimental procedures and results. However, there are several areas that need clarification and improvement to enhance the scientific rigor and clarity of the paper. The title should be more specific and concise. For example, specify the main findings or the specific aspect of air layering (e.g., "Optimizing IBA Concentration and Rooting Media for Air Layering in Kinnow"). Provide more quantitative results in the abstract. Summarize key findings in a structured manner. Mention the significance of the findings in practical terms (e.g., economic benefits for farmers). The introduction provides good background information on Citrus species and Kinnow, but lacks a clear statement of the aim and objectives of the research. <p>The materials and methods are mentioned in detail but lacks clarity in several aspects. Specify the concentration of IBA used and its method of application, Provide details on the preparation of rooting media (e.g., ratio of soil:cocopeat)</p> <p>Results are presented in tabular form, which is good, but some tables lack clarity in terms of headings and units. Ensure consistency in reporting units (e.g., cm for root length, mm for root thickness).</p> <p>The discussion should interpret the results in the context of existing literature. Compare findings with previous studies on similar species or crops. Discuss practical implications and recommendations for farmers. Address limitations of the study and suggest future research directions.</p> <p>Figures should be labelled sequentially and referenced appropriately in the text. Ensure all tables have clear headings, units, and are easy to interpret.</p> <p>In the conclusion, avoid introducing new information or interpretations not covered in the results.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? 	<p>Some of the sentences need restructuring for clarity and conciseness, which would improve the readability of the content.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The study provides valuable insights into optimizing air layering techniques for Kinnow using IBA and different rooting media. However, revisions are needed to enhance clarity, rigor, and scientific impact. Addressing the above points will improve the manuscript's quality and make it suitable for publication in the scientific journal.</p>	

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Manju Thomas
Department, University & Country	ICAR- KVK, India