

## Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJEE_120042
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessing the Sustainability of Kilongo Forest Reserve under Community-Based Forest Management in Wangingómbe District, Njombe Region, Tanzania
Type of the Article	

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajee.com/index.php/AJEE/editorial-policy> )

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p><b>TITLE:</b> "Assessing the Sustainability of Kilongo Forest Reserve under Community-Based Forest Management in Wangingómbe District, Njombe Region, Tanzania ". The word "forest" appears twice within the title and this should be corrected. Hence, I suggest this title: "Assessing the Sustainability of Kilongo Forest Reserve under Community-Based Management in Wangingómbe District, Njombe Region, Tanzania"</p> <p><b>ABSTRACT:</b> The abstract effectively communicates the study's purpose, methodology, key findings, and recommendations. However, it could improve by providing more detailed insights into the measurement of forest conditions, the specific factors affecting villagers' livelihoods, and more precise recommendations for addressing governance issues and promoting sustainability.</p> <p><b>INTRODUCTION:</b> There are too many short paragraphs. Hence, paragraphs should either be linked with preceding or successive ones depending on the thought flow.</p> <p><b>LITERATURE REVIEW:</b> There is no review of relevant literature on the subject matter. The purpose of a literature review in the study is to synthesize existing research on the topic to identify gaps, contextualize findings, and provide a foundation for the current research.</p> <p><b>SIGNIFICANCE OF THE STUDY:</b> The significance of the study is to highlight its contribution to the field, its potential impact on practice or policy, and the advancement of knowledge or understanding in the subject area. Hence this also should be included.</p> <p><b>STATEMENT OF RESEARCH PROBLEM:</b> This is also missing in the study. This is essential in any study because it provides the research gap/problem necessitating the study.</p> <p><b>Figure 1: Location of Kilongo Forest Reserve:</b> This is not referenced to any cited source.</p> <p><b>DESCRIPTION OF THE STUDY AREA:</b> The first paragraph is not referenced to any cited source(s).</p> <p><b>SAMPLE SIZE/SAMPLING PROCEDURE:</b> This is not backed up with cited sources of similar studies that the author(s) used as guide to validate the sampling procedure.</p> <p><b>PAGINATION:</b> The pages of the manuscript are not numbered.</p> <p><b>OBSERVATION METHOD:</b> The author(s) relied exclusively on the perceptions of the respondents in drawing up their conclusions. On the contrary, it is expedient for the author(s) to validate the research findings by having a first-hand observation of the study area.</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p>Adequate</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Tolulope Ayodeji Olatoye</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Sol Plaatje University, South Africa</b>