A Review on Impact of Modern Agricultural Extension Services on Smallholder Farm Productivity and Sustainability in Developing Countries

Abstract

The impact of modern agricultural extension services on smallholder farm productivity and sustainability in India, focusing on various dimensions such as farm productivity, sustainability, and social outcomes. Agricultural extension services are crucial for disseminating knowledge and technology from research institutions to farmers' fields, thus playing a pivotal role in improving agricultural productivity and promoting sustainable practices. Despite their significance, the effectiveness of these services varies across regions due to financial constraints, cultural and educational barriers, and inconsistent policy support. The paper explores case studies and statistical data to illustrate the changes in farm outputs and trends in productivity enhancements linked to the adoption of modern farming technologies and practices facilitated by extension services. It also addresses the role of these services in fostering sustainable agricultural practices, enhancing environmental sustainability through improved soil health and water use, and contributing to economic sustainability by increasing cost-effectiveness and profitability. Furthermore, the review highlights the social impact of extension services, particularly in empowering women and youth, fostering community development, and enhancing social equity among farmers. Despite the positive impacts, the review identifies significant challenges that hinder the effective implementation of extension services and outlines opportunities for improvement. Innovations such as integrating digital tools and community-led extension programs are discussed as strategies to overcome existing challenges and enhance the efficiency and reach of these services. The paper concludes with recommendations for policy enhancements, the potential for international cooperation, and future research directions aimed at better understanding and improving the delivery and impact of agricultural extension services in India. This comprehensive analysis not only sheds light on the current state of agricultural extension in India but also serves as a guide for policymakers, researchers, and practitioners aiming to optimize the benefits of such services for smallholder farmers.

Keywords: *Extension, Sustainability, Smallholder, Technology, Innovation, Empowerment*

I. Introduction

Modern agricultural extension services are pivotal in transferring knowledge and innovative technologies from agricultural research institutions to farmers' fields. These services play a crucial role in addressing issues of food security, farmer income, and agricultural sustainability. In developing countries like India, where agriculture forms the backbone of the rural economy and sustains the livelihood of a significant portion of the population, effective extension services can lead to improved agricultural productivity and sustainability. Moreover, extension services are instrumental in educating farmers about sustainable agricultural practices, thus contributing to environmental conservation and enhanced food production without depleting natural resources [1]. This review focuses geographically on India, a country where agriculture is a critical component of the economy, providing employment to about 58% of the population [2]. India presents a unique case study due to its diverse climatic regions, ranging from arid to tropical,

and a variety of cropping patterns. The Indian government has recognized the importance of agricultural extension; however, the reach and effectiveness of these services vary widely across different states and need thorough evaluation. The demographic focus of this review is on smallholder farmers in India, who typically own or cultivate less than two hectares of land. Smallholder farmers are particularly vulnerable to economic shifts and climatic changes due to their limited access to technology, capital, and land [3]. Despite their small individual scale, collectively, smallholder farmers produce a substantial portion of the country's food grains and other agricultural products. Understanding the impact of extension services on this demographic is crucial as they represent a significant segment of the rural population and are pivotal in the nation's pursuit of agricultural sustainability and increased productivity.

This review is timely and critical due to several converging factors affecting the agricultural sector in India. Firstly, the increasing pressure from a growing population, projected to reach 1.5 billion by 2030, necessitates a significant increase in agricultural productivity [4]. Additionally, the sector faces immense challenges due to climate change, with increasing incidences of droughts, floods, and other climatic extremities affecting crop yields [5]. At the same time, there is a growing need to shift towards sustainable agricultural practices to ensure long-term viability of farming and conservation of resources. Modern agricultural extension services are pivotal in addressing these challenges by providing farmers with the knowledge and tools necessary to improve productivity sustainably. Thus, reviewing the effectiveness of these services is essential for strategizing future agricultural policies and programs in India. The expected impact of this comprehensive review is multifaceted. Primarily, it aims to inform policymakers and stakeholders about the effectiveness of current agricultural extension programs and what changes or enhancements are needed to make them more impactful [6]. It will also provide insights into how extension services can be optimized to facilitate the adoption of sustainable agricultural practices among smallholder farmers, ultimately leading to improved food security, farmer income, and resource conservation. Moreover, this review can serve as a baseline for future research and development in agricultural extension methodologies, specifically tailored for the socio-economic and ecological contexts of India.

Methodology

The methodology for this review involves a comprehensive literature survey using multiple databases to ensure a broad and thorough exploration of the subject. The databases searched include Scopus, Web of Science, and Google Scholar, which are rich sources of peer-reviewed articles, conference papers, and reports. The keywords used in the search strategy are "agricultural extension services," "farm productivity," "sustainable agriculture," "smallholder farmers," and "India [7]." These keywords were combined using Boolean operators to refine and focus the search. The selection criteria for literature inclusion were based on several factors: Only papers that directly discuss agricultural extension services in India and their impact on smallholder farmers were included. Preference was given to studies published in the last ten years to ensure that the review reflects current trends and data. To ensure credibility and reliability, only peer-reviewed articles and official government or NGO reports were considered. Given the scope of this review, articles published in English were primarily considered. The analytical framework for this review is structured around a mixed-methods approach, integrating both quantitative and qualitative research findings [8]. This approach allows for a more comprehensive understanding of the impacts of agricultural extension services on various outcomes. The framework is divided into several components: This involves statistical review of data pertaining to productivity measures, adoption rates of

agricultural practices, and changes in income levels among farmers who have participated in extension programs. This includes thematic analysis of qualitative data from case studies, interviews, and focus groups to understand the perceptions and experiences of farmers with extension services. Where applicable, comparisons are made between different regions within India to highlight disparities in the effectiveness of extension services. This component evaluates the direct and indirect impacts of extension services on sustainability metrics such as soil health, water usage, and biodiversity.

II. Background

Agricultural extension services encompass a range of activities aimed at transferring agricultural technology, providing training and management practices, and disseminating useful agricultural research information to farmers, typically through a network of trained professionals [9]. These services are designed to assist farmers in increasing their productivity, managing their resources more efficiently, and improving their overall livelihoods. In India, these services have been a fundamental component of agricultural development strategies, seeking to bridge the gap between farmers and agricultural research institutions. A 'Smallholder Farm' refers to a farming enterprise characterized by a small-scale family farming operation involving family labor and management, predominantly reliant on family capital, and using a relatively small plot of land which is often less than two hectares [10]. In India, smallholder farms are critical to rural livelihoods and national food security, contributing significantly to agricultural output. The, 'Productivity' generally refers to the ratio of agricultural outputs to agricultural inputs [11]. Higher productivity means more crop yield per unit of input such as seeds, fertilizer, labor, and land. Improving agricultural productivity in smallholder farms is crucial for enhancing food security and enabling farmers to move out of poverty. Sustainability' in agriculture involves practices that meet the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. This encompasses environmental health, economic profitability, and social and economic equity [12]. For smallholder farmers, sustainability not only implies environmental conservation but also encompasses the viability of agricultural practices that enhance food security and livelihood resilience against economic and climatic shocks.

History

The concept of agricultural extension originated in the early 19th century with agricultural societies and clubs in the United Kingdom and the USA. However, in developing countries, formal government-supported extension services began to take shape in the early 20th century, aimed at introducing and promoting improved agricultural practices through demonstration and visitation by extension agents [13]. In India, the establishment of the Imperial Department of Agriculture in 1905 marked the beginning of organized agricultural extension services, which later expanded significantly post-independence in 1947. Over the decades, the scope and methodology of agricultural extension in India and other developing countries have evolved significantly. The traditional transfer of technology model, which dominated through the mid-20th century, gradually gave way to more participatory approaches in the 1980s and 1990s, such as the Training and Visit (T&V) system, which emphasized the role of farmers as active participants in the learning process [14]. In recent years, the focus has shifted towards integrating information and communication technologies (ICTs) into extension services, with mobile phones, radio broadcasts, and online platforms becoming vital tools for delivering extension services [15]. These modern approaches are designed to overcome geographical and socio-economic barriers, providing

tailored and timely information to farmers, thus enhancing the reach and effectiveness of agricultural extension services. The evolution of agricultural extension services is marked by a transition from a top-down approach of technology transfer to more integrated, participatory, and technology-driven models. This shift is crucial for addressing the diverse and complex challenges faced by smallholder farmers in India, ensuring that extension services contribute effectively to agricultural productivity and sustainability [16].

C. Current Trends and Statistics

In India, the integration of modern agricultural technologies and practices has become increasingly significant due to the need to enhance farm productivity and sustainability while addressing the challenges posed by a rapidly growing population and changing climatic conditions. Modern technologies include precision agriculture, genetically modified crops, drip irrigation, and mobile-based technology applications that provide real-time data to farmers. These technologies are tailored to increase crop yields, reduce waste, and improve resource efficiency. This technology involves the use of GPS, IoT (Internet of Things), drones, and remote sensing to monitor field conditions and manage agricultural operations efficiently. Precision agriculture allows farmers to optimize their inputs such as water, fertilizers, and seeds, thereby reducing costs and enhancing yields [17]. GM crops have been a controversial yet integral part of modern agricultural practices in India. Bt cotton, for example, has been widely adopted across India, significantly increasing cotton yields and profitability for farmers [18]. This method has gained popularity particularly in water-stressed regions of India. Drip irrigation conserves water by delivering it directly to the plant roots through a network of valves, pipes, and emitters, reducing evaporation and leakage [19]. The use of mobile phones and applications in agricultural extension is one of the most significant trends in recent years. Platforms such as KisanSuvidha and mKisan provide weather forecasts, market prices, and expert advice directly to farmers' mobile phones [20].

Prevalence and Types of Extension Services Offered in Different Regions

The types and prevalence of extension services vary significantly across different regions of India, reflecting the diverse agricultural environments and socio-economic conditions of the states. The government of India runs numerous schemes under the Ministry of Agriculture & Farmers Welfare, such as the KrishiVigyanKendras (KVKs) and Agricultural Technology Management Agency (ATMA) [21]. These agencies are pivotal in providing training and demonstrations to farmers. Each state tailors its extension services to local needs, with states like Punjab and Haryana focusing more on wheat and rice, while southern states like Tamil Nadu and Kerala focus on spices and coconuts. Besides government efforts, many private companies, especially in the seeds and agrochemical sectors, provide extension services to promote their products. These services are often more efficiently managed and provide highly specialized advice but are mostly accessible to relatively affluent farmers. NGOs play a crucial role in filling the gaps left by public and private extension services, especially in remote and underserved areas. Organizations such as the BAIF Development Research Foundation work extensively in tribal and rural areas, providing services tailored to local conditions and focusing on sustainable practices. These groups often undertake extension activities among their members. Examples include the Amul model in Gujarat for dairy farming, which provides veterinary services and advice on feed and nutrition, thereby operating as a form of cooperative extension service. The major challenge in extension services in India is the sheer scale and diversity of needs across different regions. While technology has helped bridge some gaps,

issues like language barriers, illiteracy, and lack of access to technology persist. However, the increasing penetration of smartphones and the internet presents a significant opportunity for digital extension platforms [22]. The adaptation and effectiveness of agricultural extension services vary significantly across India due to regional disparities in economic conditions, climatic zones, and crop patterns. As such, a nuanced understanding of regional needs and the integration of local knowledge into extension programs are crucial for the success of these services.

III. Impact of Agricultural Extension Services

A. On Farm Productivity

One of the most significant impacts of agricultural extension services in India can be observed through case studies from various states. For instance, in Andhra Pradesh, the introduction of the Zero Budget Natural Farming (ZBNF) through extension services has shown considerable promise. A study conducted across 50 farms documented an average yield increase of 20% across different crops after adopting ZBNF techniques introduced by local extension agents [23]. Another case is from Punjab, where extension services focusing on rice-wheat cropping systems introduced laser land leveling and Direct Seeded Rice (DSR) technologies. Reports from Punjab Agricultural University (PAU) and the Department of Agriculture show a 10-15% increase in crop yields due to reduced water usage and more precise seed placement [24]. The systematic collection and analysis of data on farm outputs before and after the introduction of extension services have revealed positive trends in productivity. The Government of India's Ministry of Agriculture & Farmers Welfare reports a consistent improvement in yield rates per hectare for major crops such as wheat, rice, and pulses, correlating with increased adoption rates of modern farming practices and technologies disseminated through extension programs [25]. Quantitative analysis over the last decade indicates a productivity growth rate of approximately 3.6% per annum in regions actively participating in government-sponsored extension initiatives, compared to 2.1% in regions with limited or no access to such services [26]. The role of technology transfer in enhancing farm productivity is crucial. Extension services facilitate this by conducting on-farm demonstrations, providing training sessions, and distributing materials on new agricultural technologies. In states like Gujarat and Maharashtra, extension services have successfully introduced drip irrigation systems and solar-powered pumps through these methods, which have significantly increased the efficiency of water and energy use on farms, leading to higher crop yields [27].

B. On Sustainability

Extension services in India actively promote sustainable agricultural practices, focusing on long-term ecological balance and minimizing inputs like chemical fertilizers and pesticides. Practices such as Integrated Pest Management (IPM), organic farming, and the use of biofertilizers are commonly taught. For instance, in Kerala, extension programs have been pivotal in promoting spice cultivation using organic practices, which has not only helped preserve soil health but also increased market value [28]. The impact of extension services on environmental sustainability is evident in improved soil health, efficient water use, and enhanced biodiversity. In Telangana, soil testing initiatives introduced through extension services have led to better soil health management practices among farmers, showing a 50% reduction in the indiscriminate use of fertilizers [29]. Similarly, the introduction of micro-irrigation systems has resulted in a 30% increase in water use efficiency in semi-arid regions of Karnataka [30]. Biodiversity has benefited from extension services promoting crop diversification and the cultivation of

indigenous varieties. This is particularly visible in the northeastern states, where extension efforts have helped preserve traditional crops like black rice and medicinal plants, enhancing agro-biodiversity [31]. The economic impact of extension services is reflected in their cost-effectiveness and contribution to farm profitability. Studies indicate that for every rupee spent on agricultural extension services in India, there is a return of approximately four rupees in terms of increased farm income [32]. This is largely due to reduced input costs from improved resource management and higher yields from better farming techniques. Additionally, farmers who adopt sustainable practices often gain access to premium markets, further enhancing profitability.

C. On Social Outcomes

Agricultural extension services have significantly influenced community development and promoted social equity in rural India. These programs often serve as platforms for collective learning and community engagement, contributing to enhanced social cohesion among farmers. For instance, extension services facilitate farmer field schools and community seed banks that encourage collective problem-solving and resource sharing. This approach not only spreads agricultural knowledge but also strengthens community bonds, essential for collaborative development initiatives. Studies indicate that villages with active extension services show improved social infrastructure, such as better roads and irrigation systems, due to increased collective action. For example, the development of micro-irrigation projects in Tamil Nadu, facilitated through extension services, has not only improved agricultural productivity but also led to enhanced community water management practices, promoting equitable water distribution [33]. Extension services play a crucial role in reducing disparities by targeting marginal and small-scale farmers, who are often left out of mainstream agricultural advancements. By providing these groups with tailored training and resources, extension programs help level the playing field, thereby enhancing social equity within agricultural communities. The educational role of agricultural extension services is foundational, equipping farmers with the necessary skills to improve their agricultural practices and manage their resources more effectively [34]. These services often include training on modern farming techniques, financial literacy, and market knowledge, which are crucial for running a successful farming enterprise. In states like Maharashtra and Karnataka, extension programs have incorporated modules on sustainable farming practices and pest management techniques, significantly enhancing farmers' knowledge and skills [35]. These educational programs are designed not only to transmit knowledge but also to foster critical thinking and decision-making skills among farmers, empowering them to innovate and adapt to changing circumstances. Digital extension services, such as Kisan Call Centers and mobile apps like 'KisanSuvidha,' provide farmers with access to timely information and advice, further enhancing their educational opportunities. These digital platforms have proven particularly effective in reaching young farmers and those in remote areas, providing them with the same level of access to information as those in more developed regions [36]. Targeted agricultural extension programs have been instrumental in empowering specific demographic groups, particularly women and youth. In India, where farming is often male-dominated, extension programs designed for women promote their participation in agriculture, providing them with resources and knowledge tailored to their unique needs and constraints. For example, the MahilaKisanSashaktikaranPariyojana (MKSP), a government initiative, focuses on empowering women farmers by enhancing their access to inputs, resources, and land rights. Evaluations of this program show that women who participate have higher yields and better access to markets, significantly improving their economic status and decision-making power within their households [37]. Youth empowerment is also a critical focus of extension services, as engaging young people in agriculture is

essential for the sector's sustainability. Initiatives like Agri-Clinics and Agri-Business Centers (ACABC) scheme aim to train and motivate young graduates to take up agri-entrepreneurship. This not only provides them with livelihood opportunities but also injects innovation and new ideas into the agricultural sector [38].

IV. Challenges and Limitations

A. Barriers to Effective Implementation

The implementation of effective agricultural extension services in India is significantly hampered by financial constraints. Government budgets allocated to agricultural extension are often inadequate, leading to limitations in covering the vast geographical and demographic diversity of Indian agriculture. A 2020 report by the Indian Council for Agricultural Research (ICAR) highlights that funding shortfalls directly impact the frequency and quality of extension activities, with many rural areas receiving insufficient support [39]. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs), which often complement governmental efforts, also face similar financial challenges. Dependence on external funding, which can be unstable and unpredictable, affects the continuity and effectiveness of extension programs. According to a study by the Nonprofit Finance Fund, NGOs involved in agricultural development in India reported that over 75% had faced financial distress that hindered their operational capabilities at least once in the past five years [40].

2. Cultural and Educational Barriers Among Farmers

Cultural norms and educational levels among farmers pose significant barriers to the effective implementation of agricultural extension services. In many rural areas of India, traditional farming methods are deeply ingrained, and skepticism towards modern agricultural techniques can be high. This resistance is often compounded by a lack of formal education among smallholder farmers, which can hinder their understanding and adoption of complex agricultural innovations. In a study conducted in Uttar Pradesh, it was observed that the adoption rate of bio-fertilizers was notably low among older farmers who preferred traditional farming practices and viewed new methods with distrust [41]. Additionally, language barriers and literacy levels influence the effectiveness of training and educational programs, as most scientific agricultural content is available in English, which many farmers do not understand fluently.

B. Limitations of Current Research

One of the critical limitations in the field of agricultural extension research in India is the lack of comprehensive, high-quality data. Current research often relies on short-term studies and small sample sizes that do not adequately capture the long-term impacts and sustainability of extension interventions. There is a significant need for longitudinal studies that can provide insights into the long-term benefits and potential drawbacks of various extension strategies. Data gaps exist in the disaggregation of results by gender, age, and socio-economic status, which are crucial for understanding how different groups benefit from extension services. The need for such detailed studies is emphasized by experts who argue that without longitudinal and granular data, policy-making remains uninformed and potentially ineffective [42]. Another limitation of current research is the variability in the effectiveness of different extension models across various regions and crops. India's diverse agricultural sector encompasses a wide range of

climates, crops, and farming practices, which means that an extension model that works well in one context may not be suitable in another. The Training and Visit (T&V) system, widely implemented in the 1980s and 1990s, was found to be less effective in tribal and hilly regions compared to the plains due to geographical and cultural differences that were not adequately accounted for in the program design [43]. Similarly, digital extension services have shown great promise in some regions but are less effective in areas with low internet penetration and digital literacy.

V. Opportunities for Improvement and Future Research

A. Innovative Models of Extension Services

The integration of digital technologies into agricultural extension services offers tremendous potential for improving the efficiency and reach of these programs in India. Tools such as mobile apps, SMS-based services, and interactive voice response systems (IVRS) can provide farmers with real-time information on weather forecasts, market prices, and crop management techniques. A prominent example is the 'KisanSuvidha' app launched by the Government of India, which serves as a one-stop solution for farmers seeking information on various agricultural aspects [44]. Further innovation could involve the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) and machine learning algorithms to tailor advice based on specific farm conditions and historical data, enhancing the precision of recommendations made to farmers. Implementing blockchain technology could also improve the traceability and transparency of agricultural supply chains, thereby assuring quality and boosting farmer incomes [45]. Community-led extension programs, where local farmers play a central role in both the dissemination and generation of knowledge, represent another area ripe for development. These programs can be particularly effective in addressing the specific needs and challenges of local farming communities. For example, participatory research approaches where farmers are involved in the design and testing of agricultural technologies can lead to higher adoption rates and greater satisfaction among participants. In Karnataka, the use of Farmer Field Schools (FFS) as a part of community-led extension programs has proven successful in promoting sustainable agricultural practices and enhancing crop yields. Farmers participating in FFS have shown improved skills in integrated pest management and resource-efficient farming techniques [46].

B. Policy Recommendations

To enhance the effectiveness of agricultural extension services, policy recommendations include increasing government funding and support for these programs, ensuring that they can reach a wider audience and provide more comprehensive services. Specifically, policies aimed at subsidizing the cost of advanced technologies for small and marginal farmers can play a crucial role in ensuring wider access to these innovations. Government policies should encourage private sector participation and public-private partnerships in the provision of extension services. This approach can leverage the strengths and resources of both sectors, leading to better service delivery and innovation [47]. International cooperation is crucial for the advancement of agricultural extension services in India. Collaborations with international agricultural research institutions and extension networks can facilitate the exchange of knowledge, technologies, and best practices. Such partnerships can also provide Indian farmers and extension workers with access to training programs and advanced research findings that can be adapted to local conditions. The involvement of international bodies like the Food and Agriculture Organization (FAO) in Indian agricultural extension initiatives has already shown positive results in areas such as

organic farming and water management practices. Expanding these collaborations could further enhance the capabilities of Indian extension services [48].

C. Future Research Directions

Significant areas needing further research include the long-term impacts of extension services on farm profitability and sustainability, the effectiveness of digital extension tools in different regional contexts, and the socio-economic impacts of extension services on marginal communities. Research in these areas can help refine extension strategies and ensure that they are both effective and equitable. Interdisciplinary research that combines insights from agronomy, sociology, economics, and information technology can provide a more holistic understanding of the factors that influence the success of extension services. For instance, integrating social science research can help understand farmer behavior and decision-making processes, which are crucial for designing effective extension interventions [49]. The potential for integrating environmental science to assess the ecological impacts of agricultural practices promoted by extension services is also significant. This approach can help ensure that extension programs promote not only economically viable but also environmentally sustainable farming practices [50].

Conclusion

Agricultural extension services play a crucial role in enhancing farm productivity, sustainability, and socio-economic outcomes for smallholder farmers in India. By bridging the gap between research and practice, these services help to disseminate vital knowledge and technologies that are essential for modern farming. However, challenges such as financial constraints, cultural barriers, and the need for more robust data and research methodologies must be addressed to fully realize the potential of these services. Innovative models like digital tools, community-led programs, and stronger policy support can significantly improve the effectiveness and reach of agricultural extension services. Moreover, international cooperation and interdisciplinary research approaches are essential for advancing these services to meet the evolving needs of the agricultural sector. By overcoming existing barriers and leveraging new opportunities, agricultural extension services can continue to be a pivotal force for sustainable development in India's agrarian landscape.

References

1. Pretty, J., & Bharucha, Z. P. (2014). Sustainable intensification in agricultural systems. *Annals of botany*, *114*(8), 1571-1596.
2. Filmer, D., & Fox, L. (2014). *Youth employment in sub-Saharan Africa*. World Bank Publications.
3. Harvey, C. A., Rakotobe, Z. L., Rao, N. S., Dave, R., Razafimahatratra, H., Rabarijohn, R. H., ... & MacKinnon, J. L. (2014). Extreme vulnerability of smallholder farmers to agricultural risks and climate change in Madagascar. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, *369*(1639), 20130089.
4. Kickbusch, I., Brindley, C., & World Health Organization. (2013). *Health in the post-2015 development agenda: an analysis of the UN-led thematic consultations, High-Level Panel report and sustainable development debate in the context of health*. World Health Organization.

5. Shahzad, A., Ullah, S., Dar, A. A., Sardar, M. F., Mehmood, T., Tufail, M. A., & Haris, M. (2021). Nexus on climate change: Agriculture and possible solution to cope future climate change stresses. *Environmental Science and Pollution Research*, *28*, 14211-14232.
6. Davis, K., Swanson, B., Amudavi, D., Mekonnen, D. A., Flohrs, A., Riese, J., ... & Zerfu, E. (2010). In-depth assessment of the public agricultural extension system of Ethiopia and recommendations for improvement. *International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) Discussion Paper*, *1041*, 193-201.
7. Ferroni, M., & Zhou, Y. (2011). Review of agricultural extension in India. *Syngenta Foundation for Sustainable Agriculture*, 1-49.
8. Guetterman, T. C., & Fetters, M. D. (2018). Two methodological approaches to the integration of mixed methods and case study designs: A systematic review. *American Behavioral Scientist*, *62*(7), 900-918.
9. Antwi-Agyei, P., & Stringer, L. C. (2021). Improving the effectiveness of agricultural extension services in supporting farmers to adapt to climate change: Insights from northeastern Ghana. Climate Risk Management, 32, 100304.
10. Cousins, B. (2010). What is a 'smallholder'? Class-analytic perspectives on small-scale farming and agrarian reform in South Africa. In *Reforming land and resource use in South Africa* (pp. 102-127). Routledge.
11. van Ittersum, M. K., & Rabbinge, R. (1997). Concepts in production ecology for analysis and quantification of agricultural input-output combinations. *Field crops research*, *52*(3), 197-208.
12. Roseland, M. (2000). Sustainable community development: integrating environmental, economic, and social objectives. *Progress in planning*, *54*(2), 73-132.
13. Mbaga-Semgalawe, Z., & Folmer, H. (2000). Household adoption behaviour of improved soil conservation: the case of the North Pare and West Usambara Mountains of Tanzania. *Land use policy*, *17*(4), 321-336.
14. Isubikalu, P. (2007). *Stepping-stones to improve upon functioning of participatory agricultural extension programmes: farmer field schools in Uganda*. Wageningen University and Research.
15. Naika, M. B., Kudari, M., Devi, M. S., Sadhu, D. S., & Sunagar, S. (2021). Digital extension service: quick way to deliver agricultural information to the farmers. In *Food technology disruptions* (pp. 285-323). Academic Press.
16. Fan, S., & Rue, C. (2020). The role of smallholder farms in a changing world. *The role of smallholder farms in food and nutrition security*, 13-28.
17. Bongiovanni, R., & Lowenberg-DeBoer, J. (2004). Precision agriculture and sustainability. *Precision agriculture*, *5*, 359-387.
18. Kathage, J., & Qaim, M. (2012). Economic impacts and impact dynamics of Bt (Bacillus thuringiensis) cotton in India. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, *109*(29), 11652-11656.
19. Sijali, I. V. (2001). Drip irrigation. *Options for smallholder farmers in eastern and southern Africa. Published by Sida's Regional and Land Management Unit*.
20. Meena, R. L., Jirli, B., Kanwat, M., & Meena, N. K. (2018). Mobile applications for agriculture and allied sector.
21. Sahoo, A. K., Sahu, S., Meher, S. K., Begum, R., Panda, T. C., & Barik, N. C. (2021). The role of krishi vigyan kendras (kvk) in strengthening national agricultural research extension system in india. *Insights into Economics and Management*, *8*(9), 43-45.

22. Neumeyer, X., Santos, S. C., & Morris, M. H. (2020). Overcoming barriers to technology adoption when fostering entrepreneurship among the poor: The role of technology and digital literacy. *IEEE Transactions on Engineering Management*, *68*(6), 1605-1618.
23. Veluguri, D., Bump, J. B., Venkateshmurthy, N. S., Mohan, S., Pulugurtha, K. T., & Jaacks, L. M. (2021). Political analysis of the adoption of the Zero-Budget natural farming program in Andhra Pradesh, India. *Agroecology and Sustainable Food Systems*, *45*(6), 907-930.
24. Mahajan, G., Chauhan, B. S., & Gill, M. S. (2013). Dry-seeded rice culture in Punjab State of India: lessons learned from farmers. *Field Crops Research*, *144*, 89-99.
25. Pal, S. (2017). Agricultural R&D policy in India. *ICAR-National Institute of Agricultural Economics and Policy Research*.
26. Davis, K., Swanson, B., Amudavi, D., Mekonnen, D. A., Flohrs, A., Riese, J., ... & Zerfu, E. (2010). In-depth assessment of the public agricultural extension system of Ethiopia and recommendations for improvement. *International Food Policy Research Institute (IFPRI) Discussion Paper*, *1041*, 193-201.
27. Levidow, L., Zaccaria, D., Maia, R., Vivas, E., Todorovic, M., & Scardigno, A. (2014). Improving water-efficient irrigation: Prospects and difficulties of innovative practices. *Agricultural Water Management*, *146*, 84-94.
28. Balachandran, V. (2004). Future in the Past: A study on the status of organic farming in Kerala. *Kerala Research Programme on Local Level Development, Centre for Development Studies, Thiruvananthapuram*.
29. Ramappa, K. B., Kannan, E., & Lavanya, B. T. (2015). Adoption of recommended doses of fertilisers on soil test basis by farmers in karnataka. *Institute for Social and Economic Change*.
30. Kumar, M. D., Turral, H., Sharma, B., Amarasinghe, U., & Singh, O. P. (2008). Water saving and yield enhancing micro irrigation technologies in India: When and where can they become best bet technologies. *Managing water in the face of growing scarcity, inequity and declining returns: Exploring fresh approaches*, *1*, 1-36.
31. Negi, V. S., & Maikhuri, R. K. (2013). Socio-ecological and religious perspective of agrobiodiversity conservation: issues, concern and priority for sustainable agriculture, Central Himalaya. *Journal of agricultural and environmental ethics*, *26*, 491-512.
32. Frankel, F. R. (2015). *India's green revolution: Economic gains and political costs*. Princeton University Press.
33. Namara, R. E., Hanjra, M. A., Castillo, G. E., Ravnborg, H. M., Smith, L., & Van Koppen, B. (2010). Agricultural water management and poverty linkages. *Agricultural water management*, *97*(4), 520-527.
34. Swanson, B. (Ed.). (2005). Improving agricultural extension.
35. Ferroni, M., & Zhou, Y. (2011). Review of agricultural extension in India. *Syngenta Foundation for Sustainable Agriculture*, 1-49.
36. Deichmann, U., Goyal, A., & Mishra, D. (2016). Will digital technologies transform agriculture in developing countries?. *Agricultural Economics*, *47*(S1), 21-33.
37. Goetz, A. M., & Gupta, R. S. (1996). Who takes the credit? Gender, power, and control over loan use in rural credit programs in Bangladesh. *World development*, *24*(1), 45-63.
38. Scoones, I. (2013). Livelihoods perspectives and rural development. In *Critical perspectives in rural development studies* (pp. 159-184). Routledge.

39. Farrington, J., & Pal, S. (1998). Improving the effectiveness of agricultural research and extension in India: An analysis of institutional and socio-economic issues in rainfed areas.
40. Wiggins, S., & Cromwell, E. (1995). NGOs and seed provision to smallholders in developing countries. *World Development*, *23*(3), 413-422.
41. Tomer, G., Chauhan, G. S., & Panigrahi, P. K. (2016). Feasibility of m-governance in agriculture: insights from a multimodal study in rural India. *Transforming Government: People, Process and Policy*, *10*(3), 434-456.
42. Mansfield, D. (2016). *A state built on sand: How opium undermined Afghanistan*. Oxford University Press.
43. Pounds, N. J. (1990). *An historical geography of Europe*. Cambridge University Press.
44. Ganguly, K., Gulati, A., & von Braun, J. (2017). Innovations spearheading the next transformations in India's agriculture.
45. Kamble, S. S., Gunasekaran, A., & Sharma, R. (2020). Modeling the blockchain enabled traceability in agriculture supply chain. *International Journal of Information Management*, *52*, 101967.
46. Muilerman, S. (2019). *Innovating service delivery andaligning with the State: The co-creation of scaling mechanisms for cocoa extension in Africa* (Doctoral dissertation, Wageningen University and Research).
47. Kindström, D., Kowalkowski, C., & Sandberg, E. (2013). Enabling service innovation: A dynamic capabilities approach. *Journal of business research*, *66*(8), 1063-1073.
48. Utz, A., & Dahlman, C. (2007). Promoting inclusive innovation. *Unleashing India's innovation*, 105.
49. Singh, C., Dorward, P., & Osbahr, H. (2016). Developing a holistic approach to the analysis of farmer decision-making: Implications for adaptation policy and practice in developing countries. *Land use policy*, *59*, 329-343.
50. National Research Council, Division on Earth, Life Studies, & Committee on Twenty-First Century Systems Agriculture. (2010). *Toward sustainable agricultural systems in the 21st century*. National Academies Press.