

**Review Form 1.7**

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:            | <b>International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</b>  |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_IJPSS_111483</b>  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Assessment of Micronutrient Status in Jasmine (<i>Jasminum azoricum</i> L.) Growing Soils of Huvina Hadagali Taluk, Vijayanagara District of Karnataka</b> |
| Type of the Article      |   |

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|   | Reviewer's comment  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b><br/>(Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b><br/>(If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</b></p> |   |   |
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>   |   |   |
| <p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>   | <p><b>Report on Ms_IJPSS_111483, "Assessment of Micronutrient Status in Jasmine (Jasminum azoricum L.) Growing Soils of Huvina Hadagali Taluk, Vijayanagara District of Karnataka"</b></p> <p>The manuscript reports on soil characterization and the correlation between fertilizers and micronutrient concentration in the context of improving jasmine crops. The data collection is quite large and well documented through many tables. The introduction state the importance of the work in the context of the massive use of jasmine for mny cultural and medicinal usages. So, the paper deserves publication in the International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science but after consideration of the 12 following comments. Please consider method descriptions and reference addings with specific care.</p> <p><b>C1 Abstract</b><br/>"The results showed that soil micronutrient status of Jasmine growing area of Huvina Hadagali taluk was found in the range of deficit, sufficient and excess"<br/>Authors should briefly mention that depending on the nutrient nature, their concentration was either found in the range of deficit, or sufficient or in excess. Same holds true with more details in the conclusion section.</p> <p><b>C2 Introduction, page 3/13</b><br/>"from each village five Jasmine growing farmers are selected based on highest area and more than five years of experiences in Jasmine cultivation"<br/>Do authors mean the largest area or the highest altitude?</p> <p><b>C3 Material and methods</b><br/>"A total of 60 soil samples from two depth 30 surface (020 cm) and 30 subsurface (0–20 cm and 20–40 cm depth) soil samples were collected."<br/>Probably (0-20 cm) for surface and (20-40 cm) for subsurface as expressed in the abstract.</p> <p><b>C4 Soil pH</b></p> |   |

## Review Form 1.7

|  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
|  | <p>Authors should mention how they measure pH and the accuracy for such measurement.<br/>At what period of the year were the measurement performed. Authors mention soil leaching so that dependence on the rain period should be expected? Please comment and eventually add some data in the manuscript on the seasonal modulation of pH values on the different sites.<br/>Do pH value on the different village sites is finally a critical parameter or should one consider that the pH is almost constant whatever the soil samples?</p> <p><b>C5 Salt content</b><br/>How was this soil feature measured and what was the accuracy?</p> <p><b>C6 Carbon content</b><br/>Can authors comment why the V4S1 sample exhibits such a large deviation between the surface and subsurface value while all other samples do not?</p> <p><b>C7 Micronutrient concentrations</b><br/>Again, authors should mention how such measurements were performed and their accuracies.</p> <p><b>C8 DTPA</b><br/>Please mention the meaning of this acronym at the first occurrence in the text body of the manuscript.</p> <p><b>C9 Conclusion</b><br/>The two following sentences appear contradictory, please clarify:<br/>"It was concluded that, micronutrient status in Jasmine growing area of Huvina Hadagali taluk was found in the range of deficit, sufficient and excess, due to improper nutrient management practices"<br/>"On the basis of soil test report, the micronutrients are applied in proper mode."</p> <p><b>C10 Conclusion</b><br/>"Hence it is suggested to apply organic manures with biofertilizers and judicious use of chemical fertilizers"<br/>Please clarify whether bio-, chemical or combination of both fertilizers should be favored?<br/>In the different villages where soil sampling were performed what were the practices for the use of fertilizers?</p> <p><b>C11 Conclusion</b><br/>Can authors summarize if some of the village soil characteristics are very distinct from each other and the correlation with the Jasmin crop yield?</p> <p><b>C12 Conclusion</b><br/>As authors refer to soil pH, irrigation and fertilizing practices in agriculture with the focus of jasmine crop yield optimization in the context of green processes, they should mention as a perspective the recent developments and beneficial evidence of so-called "cold-plasma technology" for seed vigor, disinfection, spray fertilization and their coupling with data-driven, machine learning approaches. The nine review, perspective and topical following references dealing with such promising developments would be relevant to be introduced to broaden the scope of the present work:</p> <p>XP Lu et al, Frontiers in Physics, 1036 (2022)</p> <p>N Puač, et al, Plasma processes and polymers 15 (2), 1700174 (2018)</p> <p>G Busco, et al, Journal of Physics D: Applied Physics 52 (24), 24LT01 (2019)</p> <p>AV Omran, et al, Plasma Sources Science and Technology 29 (10), 105002 (2020)</p> <p>A Stancampiano, et al, Applied Sciences 9 (18), 3861 (2019)</p> <p>T Maho, et al, Applied Sciences 11 (20), 9598 (2021)</p> <p>F Do Nascimento, et al, Plasma Chemistry and Plasma Processing, 1-27 (2023)</p> <p>Lin L, et al, Seed vigor of soybean treated by corona discharge plasma. Plant Science Today (Early Access). <a href="https://doi.org/10.14719/pst.2288">https://doi.org/10.14719/pst.2288</a> (2023)</p> <p>W Chen et al, Mathematical Biosciences and Engineering 20 (6), 10223-10243 (2023)</p> |  |
|--|---|--|

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 2:**

|   | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| <b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |   |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |  |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name:                            | <b>Eric Robert</b>                       |
| Department, University & Country | <b>CNRS, Université' Orléans, France</b> |