

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Agricultural Extension, Economics &amp; Sociology</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJAEES_111194</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Analyzing the seasonal variations and price trends in major onion markets of India</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Yes, to some extent, manuscript is important for the specific area and specific product of the Scientific research and policy making community.</b></li> <li>2. <b>Yes, Title is suitable according to the research objectives of the author.</b></li> <li>3. <b>The way abstract has been written is not suitable for a journal article, it must be start in a proper manner, that what was the gap, and how the author identify the gap as well as objective for the study. Abstract should be written in scientific manner.</b></li> <li>4. <b>No, the subsections is not showing the Gaps, research problems, and why the seasonal variation identification is necessary for the policy making or for trade policies in a specific field.</b></li> <li>5. <b>Yes, it is fine, but not fully correct, author needs to focus on more scientific way of research and writing a research paper, rather than writing an assignment.</b></li> <li>6. <b>Author should focus on latest article as reference rather than 20 years old paper, when the techniques are developed in this time of 15-20 years.</b></li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p>Language is not enough as for the journal article, author should focus on more scientific language writing.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. There are many issues in the writings, the title is about onion production variation, but in model, author is using sugar export and import model.</li> <li>2. Secondly, the observations to run the regression are around 20, So as a researcher the time series analysis needs at least 30 observations to run the basic regression, so the results in this manuscripts are biased a the observations are not enough to run the regression.</li> <li>3. R2 is not enough indicator to clarify the goodness of fit, author haven't mentioned the econometrics issues, like multicollinearity, Heteroskedasticity and serial correlation. As time series analysis must have these basic issues.</li> <li>4. Author must go for the forecasting or projection by following the seasonal pattern.</li> <li>5. In correlation table, all values are around 0.9, it means there is the issue of multicollinearity, if correlation value is greater than 0.7-0.8. You have to resolve the multicollinearity issue.</li> <li>6. The models author has been used for the analysis are the basic steps for analysing the variation, author should go for the latest techniques following the basics. These models are not enough.</li> <li>7. Author never mentioned the shock of COVID-19, which effects the import and export all over the world, specifically, south Asian countries.</li> <li>8. Author should also focus on how to visualize the Data, the graphs are not eye catching and not in proper shape for a viewer.</li> </ol>	

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Muhammad Nadir Shabbir</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Renmin University of China, China</b>