Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	**Journal of Agriculture and Ecology Research International**
Manuscript Number:	**Ms_JAERI_112087**
Title of the Manuscript:	**APPLICATION OF PROPOLIS SOLUTIONS IN PREVENTION OF THE OCCURRENCE AND DEVELOPMENT OF Phytophthora infestans IN ECOLOGICAL AGRICULTURAL PRODUCTION OF TOMATOES (Solanum lycopersicum)**
Type of the Article	**Original Research Article**

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Compulsory REVISION comments **1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?** (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) **2. Is the title of the article suitable?** (If not please suggest an alternative title) **3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?**	***The following points have been deemed acceptable by the scientific community through review**********:*** **1. Phytophthora infestans is a common disease that causes significant losses in the production of tomatoes and other plants belonging to the Solanaceae family. If left untreated, the fungus can spread rapidly and destroy entire crops. The main objective of agricultural production is to achieve stable crops with no diseases, pests, or weeds, in order to obtain high yields and generate higher income. To achieve this goal, it is crucial to consider the climate and choose appropriate plant neighbors from the beginning of the production process.** **2. Controlling pathogens to prevent their development is best done by combining preventive measures and agrotechnical measures with solutions made from propolis and other organic solutions. Propolis, a natural substance made by bees, can be used to protect plants from fungal growth and pests such as aphids and flies. The concentration of propolis used on plants can inhibit the growth of phytopathological fungus and improve the plant's overall health and vigor.** **3. Using propolis solutions in organic agricultural production has numerous benefits. They are all-natural and not harmful to the environment. Compared to other bio-solutions, alcoholic solutions of propolis have a stronger effect on plants without harmful effects on the environment. Propolis solutions have been proven to have an indirect impact on preventing the occurrence of aphids by creating an invisible barrier on leaves and other plant parts that disables insects from penetrating into the plant.** **4. In summary, the use of propolis solutions in organic agricultural production can increase the sustainability of plant crops and reduce the use of harmful chemicals.** **Suggest Alternative Title: Application of Propolis Solutions for Preventing and Managing *Phytophthora infestans* in ecological tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*) production.** **90% Good*****. But In the abstract section, the author should clarify the research goals understandably in a simple manner.** **Please find below the suggested points for the author's conclusion section.** **The research concludes that using alcoholic solutions as a preventative measure impacts the likelihood of *Phytophthora infestans* development and growth while being environmentally-friendly. Additionally, using propolis solutions is more profitable and efficient compared to other organic solutions as it improves produce growth speed and energy requirement. Moreover, using a propolis solution increases produce yield compared to other organic solutions, whereas a combined alcoholic propolis solution has further benefits in preventing and neutralizing aphids.** **I kindly ask the author to remove the conclusion that was written in the abstract section.** **The following are the conclusions central to this paper: (1) preventative usage of alcoholic**	

4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. (Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)	solutions impacts the likelihood of development of Phytophthora infestans and its subsequent growth while having a reduced environmental impact (2) a comparison of propolis solutions with other staple organic solutions found improvements in profitability, produce growth speed and energy requirement (3) produce yield was increased with the use of a propolis solution compared to other organic solutions, however, a combined alcoholic propolis solution was found to have further benefits, specifically in the prevention and neutralization of aphids. Yes Yes Author requested to add research articles published in 2021, 2022, and 2023 related to this research in the discussion part and also reference section. Additional Suggestions**** Important**** 1. Request to add a photocopy of propolis collected from Apis mellifera, a European honey bee, was made by the author. 2. The author needs to replace the caption of Picture number, Graph number to Fig. 1, 2, 3 etc., 3. In the introduction section, the author should highlight the importance of the research study to emphasize its significance. 4. In the table caption, write "Table 1, 2, 3. etc." instead of "Table of contents number." 5. The author has presented their results in the results and discussion section, but they have not compared their findings with those of other researchers. Therefore, I kindly request the author to include a comparison of their results with those of other relevant research articles to complete the discussion section. It is important to mention why the author did not focus on completing this aspect of their research.********** 5. In the table of contents, Number 5, the Average Weight Table shows that the control weight per plant is 0g, followed by Biosolutions at 2580g and Alcoholic Solutions of Propolis at 4920g average weight per plant. However, the overall total average weight per plant mentioned as 9258g does not tally with the calculation of the average weight per plant once the three parameters are calculated. Therefore, kindly check the total parameter of 9258g and explain the exact calculation for Table 5's total conclusion. Is it a total mistake for the overall range for average weight calculation once you tally Control + Biosolutions + Alcoholic Solutions of Propolis? 6. Authors are required to adhere to the guidelines provided for creating a research article.	
Minor REVISION comments 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Can be improved	
Optional/General comments	The paper's objective is appreciated, but it requires some improvements to be accepted. Author, complete all changes mentioned in the review form for paper acceptance.	

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	**Author's comment** *(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)*
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	*(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)*	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	**S. Vijayalakshmni**
Department, University & Country	**Sri Sarada College for Women, India**