

Review Form 1.7

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Asian Journal of Environment & Ecology |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_AJEE_112606 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | WATER DEMAND AND AVAILABILITY IN THE TARUTUNG DISTRICT, NORTH TAPANULI REGENCY, INDONESIA |
| Type of the Article | Original Research Article |

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) 2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) 3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? 4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Yes, the manuscript is significant for the scientific community as it comprehensively analyzes the water demand and availability in Tarutung District until 2032. The research provides essential insights into managing water resources sustainably, addressing current and future needs. It offers valuable information for policymakers, environmentalists, and communities to make informed decisions for effective water resource planning and protection. 2. The title "WATER DEMAND AND AVAILABILITY IN THE TARUTUNG DISTRICT, NORTH TAPANULI REGENCY, INDONESIA" is suitable for the topic discussed in the manuscript. It accurately reflects the focus on water demand and availability in a specific geographic region. 3. The abstract of the article provides a good overview of the key points discussed in the manuscript, including the population growth, water sources, facility conditions, and rainfall data in the Tarutung District. However, it could be enhanced by specifying the methodologies used in the analysis and briefly summarizing the main findings. Adding a sentence on the significance of the study and potential implications would also contribute to making the abstract more comprehensive. 4. Yes 5. Yes 6. The references provided seem relevant to the topic, covering aspects of drinking water treatment technology, rainwater utilization, environmental quality analysis, and analyses of water needs and availability in various regions. However, the list could be strengthened by including more recent sources to ensure that the information is up-to-date. Consider adding references from the last five years, especially if there have been significant developments or advancements in the field of water resource management during that period. <p>The manuscript effectively addresses the crucial issue of water demand and availability in the Tarutung District, providing valuable insights for local policymakers and the scientific community. To enhance clarity, incorporating visual aids could improve data interpretation. Additionally, a dedicated section on existing water management policies and community engagement would strengthen the manuscript. Future research directions and a consistent language throughout the document are also suggested for a more comprehensive and professional presentation.</p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Yes | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | <p>The manuscript provides a thorough analysis of water demand and availability in the Tarutung District, addressing key aspects such as population growth, spring sources, facility conditions, and rainfall data. The methodology for water demand calculations is well-explained, utilizing relevant formulas and assumptions. The discussion on the surplus of water availability and the recommendations for sustainable management is insightful. However, minor grammatical and formatting adjustments are needed for enhanced clarity and presentation. Additionally, ensuring consistent citation formatting in the references would improve the overall quality. The research contributes valuable insights to water resource planning, emphasizing the need for sustainable environmental policies in the context of the Tarutung District.</p> | |

[Review Form 1.7](#)

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|---|
| Name: | Mudasir Rashid Bhat |
| Department, University & Country | School of Agricultural Economics & Hbm, Sher-e-Kashmir University of Agricultural Sciences and Technology, India |