

## Original Research Article

# Management of Alternaria Leaf Spot in Cabbage through Bio-Inoculation of *Trichoderma* Spp. and Fluorescent *Pseudomonas*

## Abstract

Alternaria leaf spot caused by *Alternaria* spp. (*A. brassicae* and *A. brassicicola*) has been reported from all the continents of the world and is one among the common diseases of cabbage. Alternaria blight is one of the most dominant one that causes average yield loss in the range of 32-57%. Bio-inoculated seedlings exhibited significantly higher vigour index. Seedling vigour was found to be increased in single or combination of *Trichoderma* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* applied through seed treatment. Higher root and shoot dry biomass observed when *Trichoderma* applied as seed treatment. The rate of chlorophyll degradation was less in two treatments *P. fluorescence* applied through seed treatment and combined inoculation of *Trichoderma* and *P. fluorescence* applied through seed treatment. Low AUDPC was recorded in combined seed treatments with *Trichoderma* and *P. fluorescence* were *Trichoderma* and *P. fluorescence* applied combined through seed treatment.

**Keywords:** Alternaria leaf spot, *Trichoderma*, *P. fluorescence*, Vigour index, AUDPC.

## Introduction

Cabbage is one of the most popular crucifer vegetable grown in the world. India is one of the important cabbages growing countries in Asia. India is next to China in cabbage production. Besides, having improved good technologies and certified seeds, the desirable production is not achieved because of damages caused by insect, pests and diseases. In India, about 20% of the crop yield is lost due to insect, pests and disease per year, which approximately amounting to Rs. 1500 crores but while in case of outbreaks, losses, increased upto 50-90% (Singh et al., 2001). Alternaria black leaf spot disease is one the most destructive disease of cabbage and brassicas worldwide (Meah et al., 2022). A complex of Alternaria species (*A. brassicicola* (Schw.) Wiltsh., *A. brassicae* (Berk.) Sacc., *A. alternata* (Fr.) Kreissler and *A. raphani* Groves and S. kolko) are responsible for considerable yield losses (Meah et al., 2022). These pathogens are greatly influenced by weather with the highest disease incidence reported in mild, wet seasons and in areas with relatively

**Comment [ORD1]:** First of all, I would like to recommend the author not to put any extra alphabet such as letter "i" in most of the sentences and kept that letter in white colour to make it invisible to the reader. In fact, this act of doing just to reduce plagiarism will not gain your writing skills and affect your paper quality. I have highlighted the sentences as green colour where u have added extra letter i. It is advisable to remove it and rewrite your own sentences.

**Comment [ORD2]:** Please write the scientific names as italic both Genus & species names as *A. brassicicola* and so on.

high rainfall. The pathogen appears on leaves and stems of cabbage seedlings and adult plants. It can also affect the siliquae causing a severe reduction in the number of siliquae amount and the quality of head or seed production. Cabbage can be affected in all stages of growth, where the typical symptoms include black necrotic lesions surrounded by chlorotic areas on leaves, stems and siliquae (Macet *et al.*, 1989). *A. brassicae* and *A. brassicicola* can affect host species at all the growth stages including seeds. On seedlings, the visible symptoms include dark stem lesions immediately after germination, that can result in damping-off, or stunted seedlings (Valkonen, *et al.* 1990). In addition, to destruction of a seed crop, these pathogens can live within the seed, spreading the disease to other fields, and can cause a severe seedling loss. seedlings (Rangel *et al.*, 1945)

**Comment [ORD3]:** Write *et al.*, as italic form in all the citations (*et al.*)

**Comment [ORD4]:** Scientific name should be written in italic

### Materials and methods

Bio-inoculation of *Trichoderma sp.* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* to identify the effect of bio-inoculation on physical health of cabbage seedlings under pot condition were tested during 2022-23 rabi crop season at Department of Plant Pathology, Rama University, Kanpur. The experiment consisted of five treatments. Five treatments viz, T<sub>1</sub>: seed treatment, T<sub>2</sub>: soil application, T<sub>3</sub>: seed treatment + soil application, T<sub>4</sub>: seed treatment + foliar application and T<sub>5</sub>: foliar application by using *Trichoderma harzianum*, *Pseudomonas fluorescence* and *Trichoderma harzianum* + *Pseudomonas fluorescence*.

**Comment [ORD5]:** Rabi should be written as italic as *rabi*

## Bio agents

Pure culture of *Trichoderma harzianum* (UBT18) and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* (VPF-1) were obtained from, Department of Plant Pathology, Rama University, Kanpur. *Pseudomonas fluorescence* strain VPF-1 was mass multiplied on King's B broth in 250 mL Erlenmeyer flasks, incubated at 28 °C for 48 hrs. in shaker incubator. Cell suspension of bacterial strain was adjusted to concentration of 10<sup>6</sup> CFU/ml and used along with talc and Carboxy methyl cellulose. *Trichoderma harzianum* (UBT18) was mass multiplied on potato dextrose broth, after full mycelia growth obtained media mixed with talc and Carboxy methyl cellulose.

## Preparation of pathogen inoculums

*Alternaria* sp. was isolated from leaf spot affected cabbage leaf. The fungal inoculums were taken from petridishes and transferred to potato dextrose broth (PDB) and was kept for 7 days for incubation. After the full growth of pathogen the mycelial mat was harvested and homogenized. Conidial concentration was determined using a haemocytometer and adjusted to 5 × 10<sup>5</sup> conidia per mL. Plants were labeled and spray inoculated with a conidial suspension of pathogen using 1000 mL hand held atomizer directed at the central part of the upper leaf side. Approximately 0.3 mL conidial suspension per leaf was applied to the plants.

## Mode of application

Seeds were treated with *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* at the rate of 5 gram per kg. of seed, applied 30 min. before sowing. *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* were applied in soil at the rate of 12.5 kg per ha. Foliar spray of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence*, at 1% concentration of talc based formulation was done 5 days before the inoculation of pathogen.

## Plant growth promotion

Plant growth promotion activity of *Trichoderma harzianum* and *Pseudomonas fluorescence* were assessed based on the seedling vigour index was calculated by using the formula as described by Abdul Baki and Anderson

**Seedling Vigour Index = mean root length + mean shoot length x germination (%)**

## Chlorophyll estimation

Chlorophyll content estimated by using Konica Minolta SPAD-502 PLUS at transplanting stage and before challenge inoculation

## Shoot and root dry weight

**Comment [ORD6]:** Remove all the extra small letter i from all the paragraphs.

**Comment [ORD7]:** Follow according to journal guideline to express the units as g/kg seed or gram per kg seed accordingly.

**Comment [ORD8]:** kg/ha or kg per ha check the journal guideline format.

**Comment [ORD9]:** Mention the year in which AbdulBaki andAnderson has given the SVI formula.

Seedlings collected from the transplanting stage were kept in hot air oven for 7 days and measured the shoot and root dry biomass.

#### Percent disease index

Percent disease index (PDI) was calculated for each plot by summing the scores of twenty leaves and analyzed using rating scale. The value was expressed as percentage using the following formula:

No. of leaves examined  $\times$  maximum rating score

Scale (0-6) used for rating:

Rating Symptoms of Alternaria blight on leaves

0 = No infection

1 = Up to 5% leaf area covered

3 = 5-10% leaf area covered

5 = 11-25% leaf area covered

7 = 26-50% leaf area covered

9 = More than 50% leaf area covered

#### AUDPC

Area under Disease Progress Curve (AUDPC) was calculated by using the following formula:

$S_i$  = Disease severity at the end of time  $i$ ,  $k$  = Number of successive evaluation of blight severity

$d$  = Interval between two observations

## Result and Discussion

### Effect on Seedling Vigour Index

Seedling Vigour index is one of the most important indices that represents the plant health. In the present investigation the results on seedling vigour index revealed that irrespective of delivery system i.e. through seed treatment or soil application or combination of both bio-inoculated seedlings showed significantly higher vigour index (1520.00-1813.33) in comparison to untreated check, on the other hand single or combination of *T. harzianum* and *P. fluorescence* applied through seed treatment resulted comparatively higher vigour index. Seed treatment along with soil application did not provided better results as compared to seed treatment alone. Although many research findings reported that seed treatment is the most suitable way to introduce biocontrol agents to the rhizosphere rather than soil application, but however seed along with soil application also exhibit incomplete rhizosphere colonization which reflects through higher vigour

index but it may not always be true due to spatial structure of population leading to repeated interaction between the mutualists (Hamilton *et al* 1964).

Results on dry biomass of root and shoot of cabbage seedlings at transplanting stage have been presented in table 1 which revealed that shoot and root dry biomass increase significantly over control. Significantly higher shoot biomass was observed when from the *Trichoderma* treated seeds was applied through seed treatment (0.075 mg/seedling) which was significantly at par with *Trichoderma* applied through seed treatment and soil application, *P.fluorescence* through seed treatment and soil application and combined application of *Trichoderma* and *P.fluorescence* seed treatment (0.05-0.069 mg/seedling). Later three was only significantly at par with *Trichoderma* applied through soil application and combined inoculation of *Trichoderma* and *P.fluorescence* through seed treatment and soil application (0.060 and 0.059 mg/seedling respectively). The result was also in corroboration with the previous results of vigour index, seed treatment was comparatively better than applied through seed treatment and soil application in combination. Root dry weight also follow almost the same trend, were *Trichoderma* through seed treatment resulted significantly higher root dry biomass (0.016 mg/seedling) and it was significantly at par with *Trichoderma* application with seed and soil (0.014 mg/seedling). The increase in shoot and root dry biomass over control was highest in *Trichoderma* treated seedlings through seed treatment (56.25 and 77.78 % respectively) followed by *Trichoderma* applied combining through seed treatment and soil application (43.75 and 56.56% respectively). Higher the root shoot ratio, reveals better increase more is the root surface area resulting and better establishment of crop in soil. The present result indicated that better root biomass in comparison to shoot was produced by the seedlings treated with combined inoculation of *Trichoderma* and *P.fluorescence* through seed treatment and soil application (R:S- 0.220) which was followed by *Trichoderma* applied through soil application (0.217) and *Trichoderma* applied through seed treatment (0.213). Enhancement of shoot dry weight from 16-48% and root dry weight from 82-137% when inoculated with Fluorescent Pseudomonads [22].

Variation in total chlorophyll in cabbage under influence of bio-control agents at 20 DAS and 45 DAS.

#### Variation in total chlorophyll in cabbage under influence of bio-control agents

Results on total chlorophyll as expressed in SPAD-502 readings at transplanting stage at 20 days after sowing and at pathogen inoculation time at 45 days after sowing, have been elucidated in fig. 1 showed no significant variation within the bio-agent treated seedlings irrespective of delivery system and the total chlorophyll was ranged between (36.4-37.6) at transplanting stage. Although these were significantly higher in comparison to control (36.2). Comparatively higher variation was found at the time of inoculation among the bio-treated plants had significantly higher total chlorophyll was measured in the plants developed with *P.fluorescence* applied through seed treatment and combined inoculation of *Trichoderma* and *P.fluorescence*

**Comment [ORD10]:** Repeated sentences. Keep only appropriate one.

**Comment [ORD11]:** Figure 1 is missing in the manuscript. Either add the fig 1 or remove this.

applied through seed treatment. The rate of chlorophyll degradation was less in those two treatments. Aging of plants increases oxidative stress in chloroplasts and results in reduction of total chlorophyll in leaves [3].

**Comment [ORD12]:** Write authors citation not numeric citation.

**Table 1:** Effect of bio-inoculation on dry biomass of cabbage seedlings

Treatment	Shoot dry wt. (mg/seedling)	Root dry wt. (mg/seedling)	Root: shoot	% increase in shoot dry wt. over control	% increase in root dry wt. over control
Tr-ST	0.075A	0.016A	0.213	56.25	77.78
Tr-SA	0.060BC	0.013BC	0.217	25.00	44.44
Tr-ST+SA	0.069AB	0.014AB	0.203	43.75	55.56
Pf-ST	0.067AB	0.014B	0.209	39.58	55.56
Pf-SA	0.061B	0.011CD	0.180	27.08	22.22
Pf-ST+SA	0.065AB	0.013BC	0.200	35.42	44.44
Tr+Pf-ST	0.066AB	0.014B	0.212	37.50	55.56
Tr+Pf-SA	0.063AB	0.013BC	0.206	31.25	44.44
Tr+Pf-ST+SA	0.059BC	0.013BC	0.220	22.92	44.44
Control	0.048C		0.009D		0.188
SEM±		0.00428		0.00077	
CD(P=0.05)		0.01219		0.0021931	

## Conclusion

Bio-inoculated seedlings exhibited significantly higher vigour index. Single or combination of *T.harzianum* and *P.fluorescence* applied through seed treatment resulted comparatively higher seedling vigour. Seed treatment along with soil application did not provide better result as compared to seed treatment alone.

**Comment [ORD13]:** Italic form

Higher shoot biomass was observed when *Trichoderma* was applied through seed treatment. Root dry biomass also followed the same trend. Increase in shoot and root dry biomass over control was highest in *Trichoderma* treated seedlings applied through seed treatment.

Higher total chlorophyll was measured in the plants developed with P. fluorescence applied through seed treatment and combined inoculation of Trichoderma and P. fluorescence applied through seed treatment. The rate of chlorophyll degradation was less in those two treatments.

**Comment [ORD14]:** Write your conclusive sentences in brief.

Significant variation in disease development was found then after and it continued up to terminal stage of disease record. Fourteen days after challenge inoculation, lowest disease severity was recorded in the plants raised by combined inoculation of Trichoderma and P. fluorescence applied through seed treatment. Soil application did not show any significant effect in reduction of disease severity at the terminal stage disease record i.e. 28 days of challenge inoculation. Lowest severity was recorded when both Trichoderma and P. fluorescence were applied through seed treatment and foliar application. In control plants 40.74% disease severity was recorded which indicated that as high as 30.90% reduction in disease severity could be achieved through biocontrol agent application. Low AUDPC was recorded were Trichoderma and P. fluorescence applied combined through seed treatment. In control plants the calculated AUDPC was significantly higher.

Before challenge inoculation the highest protein concentration was measured in plants raised with combined inoculation of Trichoderma and Pseudomonas fluorescence applied through seed treatment and foliar application (5.49 mg/g of fresh wt.). After challenge inoculation highest increase was observed in the plants raised with P. fluorescence applied through seed treatment and soil application (116.72%) followed by Trichoderma applied through foliar application (107.17%). In general P. fluorescence was found to be more potential protein inducer compared to Trichoderma.

**Comment [ORD15]:** Draw your conclusion as per the findings of the experiment in brief as best treatment and recommendation to future researchers.

## References

1. Abdul-Baki A, Anderson JD. Vigour determination in Soybean seed by multiple criteria. *Crop Science*, 1973; 13: 630-633.
2. Barbosa MA, Rehn KJ, Menejeds M and Mariano RL. Antagonism of Trichoderma sp on Cladosporium harabarium and their enzymatic characterization. *Brazilian Journal of microbiology*, 2001; 32:98-104.
3. Bosh N and Alegre L. Plant aging increases oxidative stress in chloroplasts. *Planta*. 2002; 214(4): 608-615.

**Comment [ORD16]:** Double check your reference writing format according to the journal guidelines.

4. Chaddha KC and Brown SA. Biosynthesis of phenolic acids in tomato plants infected with *Agrobacterium tumefaciens*. *Canadian J. Bot.* 2001; 52:2041–2047.
5. Conn KL, Tewari JP. Survey of *Alternaria* blackspot and *Sclerotinia* stem rot in central Albertain. *Can. Plant Dis. Survey*, 1990; 70:66-67.
6. Dharmendra K, Maurya N, Bharati YK, Kumar A, Kumar K, Srivastava K, Chand G, Kushwaha C, Singh SK, Mishra RK and Kumar A. *Alternaria* blight of oilseed Brassicas: A comprehensive review. *African Journal Microbiology Res.* 2014; 8(30):2816-2829.
7. Dolatabadi KH, Goltapeh EM, Varma A, Rohani N. In vitro evaluation of arbuscularmycorrhizal-like fungi and *Trichoderma* species against soil borne pathogen. *Journal of Agricultural Technology* 2011; 7(1):73-84.
8. FAO. 2013. The state of food in security in the world 2013, 6.
9. Hamilton RH. A corn mutant deficient in 2,4-dihydroxy-7-methoxy-1,4-benzoxazin-3-one with an altered tolerance of atrazine. *Weeds*, 1964; 12: 27-30.
10. Harman GE, Howell CR, Viterbo A, Chet I and Lorito M. *Trichoderma* species—opportunistic, avirulent plant symbionts. *National Review of Microbiology*, 2004; 2:43–56.
12. Kucuk C, Kivanc M. Isolation of *Trichoderma* spp and determination their antifungal biochemical, physiological features. *Turkish Journal of Biology*, 2003; 27:247-253.
13. Mac KSL, Keifer P, Ayer WA. Components from the phytotoxic extracts of *Alternaria brassicicola*, a black spot pathogen of canola. *Phytochemistry*, 1999; 51:215-221.
14. Meah MB, Hau B, Siddique MK. Relationship between disease parameters of *Alternaria* blight (*Alternaria brassicae*) and yield of mustard. *Journal of Plant Diseases and Plant Protection*, 2002; 3:243-251.
15. Rangel JF. Two *Alternaria* disease of cruciferous plants. *Phytopathology* 1945; 35:1002-1007.

16. Sharma P, Jha AB, Dubey RS and Pessaraki M. Reactive oxygen species, oxidative damage, and antioxidative defense mechanism in plants under stressful conditions. *Journal of Botany*, 2004, 1-26.
17. Siddiqui IA and Shaukat SS. Rhizobacteria-mediated induction of systemic resistance (ISR) in tomato against *Meloidogyne javanica*. *J. Phytopathology*, 2002; 150: 469-473.
18. Singh T, Saikia R, Jana T, Arora DK. Hydrophobicity and surface electrostatic charge of conidia of the mycoparasitic *Trichoderma* species. *Mycological Progress*, 2001; 3(3):219–228.
19. Tra H, Ficke A, Asimwe T, Hofte M, Aaraijmaker JM. Role of cyclic lipopeptide Massetolide A in biological control of *Phytophthora infestans* and in colonization of tomato plants by *Pseudomonas fluorescens*. *New Phytologist* 2007; 175:731-772.
20. Valkonen JPT, Koponen H. The seed-borne fungi of Chinese cabbage (*Brassica pekinensis*), their pathogenicity and control. *Plant Pathology* 1990; 39:510-516.
21. Verma PR, Saharan GS. Monograph on *Alternaria* diseases of crucifers. Agriculture Canada Research Station, Saskatoon, Technical Bulletin. No. 1994-6E, 162.
22. Walley FL, Germida JJ. Plant growth promoting rhizobacteria alter rooting pattern and arbuscularmycorrhizal fungi colonization of field grown spring wheat. *Biology and fertility of soils*, 1997; 23:113-120.
23. Wilcoxson RD, Skovmand B, Atif A. Evaluation of wheat cultivars for ability to retard development of stem rust. *Annals of Applied Biology*, 1975; 80: 275-281

**Comment [ORD17]:** Keep only those references which u cited in the body of the manuscript. Remove the extra references from the reference section.