

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_112892
Title of the Manuscript:	EFFECT OF COMBINATION OF SOIL IMPROVERS AND FERTILIZER N, P, K ON C-ORGANIC, N-TOTAL, N-UPTAKE, AND YIELD OF FIELD RICE (<i>Oryza sativa</i> L.) IN INCEPTISOLS FROM JATINANGOR
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>There are several suggestions to improve this manuscript:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Make sure a professional English editor check the English of this manuscript. There are numerous mistakes. 2. I found several repeated wrong words like C organic, N total, dan N uptake in quite a lot spots both in text and in tables. Instead, please use Organic C, total N and uptake N. 3. Different words were used for the same meaning: soil improver, soil conditioner and soil amendment; I think only one single word must be used consistently. 4. Please change the word "to determine" to "to evaluate" for the objective in Abstract. 5. Table 1 and Table 2 are much better combined into a single table to show the changes in soil organic C and N (Soil nutrients). 6. Table 5 you mentioned in the discussion part does not exist; I am sure you mean Table 4? 7. Treatment B: N, P, K Dose Recommendations is better written Recommended NPK Dose 8. Use International System unit for Organic C and N; change % to g kg⁻¹. 9. Please write the complete description when referring the place of experiment. 10. No publication year for: Li, X., Zhu, W., Xu, F., Du, J., Tian, -term contrasting nitrogen applications. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment, 322. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.agee.2021.107643 11. Arrange keywords alphabetically please. 	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The English of this manuscript must be checked by a professional English Editor.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The topic and methodology of this research are ordinary.</p>	

Commented [H1]: Recommended NPK

Commented [H2]: Year of publication

Review Form 1.7

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Abdul Kadir Salam
Department, University & Country	University of Lampung, Indonesia