

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJESS_111157
Title of the Manuscript:	The Influence of Learning Leadership Competency Model, Management Leadership and Principal Decision-Making Ability on Pedagogical Competency and Teacher Performance
Type of the Article	Review Article

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><u>Compulsory REVISION comments</u></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) 2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) 3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? 4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>[1] Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript):</p> <p>This research is important for the scientific community, particularly in the field of educational leadership and management. The manuscript's exploration of the interplay between various leadership competencies and educational outcomes is of significant value to the scientific community. It contributes to the understanding of how leadership within educational institutions can be leveraged to enhance teacher performance and pedagogical quality, which are crucial for educational success.</p> <p>[2] Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title):</p> <p>The title of the article is generally suitable as it accurately reflects the primary focus of the study. The title encapsulates the key variables investigated and suggests the nature of the relationships explored. However, to enhance clarity and focus, an alternative title could be considered. The current title is somewhat lengthy and complex, which might affect its readability and immediate graspability. A more concise title could improve its appeal and convey the essence of the study more directly. Suggested Alternative Title: "Impact of Leadership and Decision-Making in Schools on Teacher Performance and Pedagogical Competency". This alternative title more concise, making it easier to read and remember. It retains the core focus of the study, which is the impact of various leadership qualities and decision-making abilities in educational settings. By using less technical terms, it might attract a wider readership, including those who are not deeply familiar with the specific models of leadership discussed in the study. The current title is more technically precise, while the suggested alternative offers a more general overview of the study's focus.</p> <p>[3] Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?:</p> <p>The abstract of the article is quite comprehensive in terms of providing an overview of the study's focus, methodology, and key findings. Areas for Improvement: [a]Sample Population: While the abstract mentions the use of a sample population, specific details like the size and characteristics of the sample are not provided. This information is crucial for understanding the study's scope and generalizability. [b]Contextual Background: For readers unfamiliar with the Indonesian education system, a brief context about its unique challenges or characteristics would be beneficial. [c] Study Implications: The abstract could be enhanced by briefly mentioning the practical or theoretical implications of the findings, which would provide insight into the study's relevance and potential impact. [d] Overall, the abstract is well-constructed, providing a clear and concise overview of the study, though it could be enhanced by including a few additional details as mentioned above.</p> <p>[4] Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?:</p> <p>The structure and subsections of the manuscript are overall appropriate for an academic research paper, but there are areas for improvement: [1] Expand Introduction: Include more recent studies to highlight ongoing research in this area. [2] Sample Size Clarification: Clearly state the sample size in the Method section. [3] Enhance Discussion: Compare findings with recent studies and discuss implications in more detail. [4] Update References: Include more recent literature to ensure the study's relevance and alignment with current research trends. [5] Visual Representation: Include diagrams or models in the Results section for better visualization of SEM results. [6] Overall, the manuscript is well-structured and addresses an important topic in educational leadership. Enhancing certain aspects, as suggested, would strengthen the paper's impact and relevance.</p> <p>[5] Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?:</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	<p>The manuscript appears to be scientifically valid in several aspects based on the provided content: Methodology, Data Analysis and Results, Theoretical Framework, .. The manuscript appears scientifically valid in its approach, analysis, and interpretation of results within the domain of educational leadership. However, as with any scientific study, the strength of its conclusions is contingent upon the completeness of its methodology description (e.g., sample size details) and the depth of its theoretical grounding. Further scrutiny in these areas would enhance its scientific rigor.</p> <p>[6] Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form:</p> <p>Based on the provided excerpts from the manuscript, here is an analysis focusing on the references used and their adequacy: The references used in the manuscript provide a solid foundation for the study, especially in terms of theoretical concepts and foundational knowledge. However, to enhance the manuscript's relevance, currency, and depth, incorporating more recent and context-specific literature is recommended. This would not only align the study with current educational trends but also offer a more nuanced understanding of the unique challenges and opportunities within the Indonesian educational landscape.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments):</p> <p>Additional Comments: 1. Inclusion of Limitations: Every study has limitations, and acknowledging these can provide a balanced view of the research. Discussing limitations such as sample representativeness, potential biases, or the generalizability of findings would be beneficial. 2. Future Research Directions: Suggesting areas for future research, especially in exploring the model in different cultural or educational settings, would be valuable. 3. Formatting and Structure: Ensure that the manuscript follows the journal's formatting guidelines, including citation style, table formatting, and overall manuscript structure. The manuscript makes a significant contribution to understanding the role of leadership competencies in the educational sector. The findings are robust and well-presented. With the inclusion of suggested improvements, the manuscript has the potential to be a valuable resource for educational leadership and policy formulation, especially within the context of Indonesian education.</p>	
--	---	--

Review Form 1.7

<p><u>Minor REVISION</u> comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language and English quality of the article exhibit both strengths and areas for improvement with respect to scholarly communications: ... Areas for Improvement:</p> <p>1. Grammar and Syntax: There are instances of awkward sentence structures and grammatical errors that can hinder comprehension. 2. Consistency in Referencing: The referencing style should be consistent throughout the document. This includes the formatting of citations and the reference list. 3. Clarity and Precision: Some sections could benefit from clearer and more precise language to enhance the academic rigor and clarity of the arguments presented. For example, the explanation of concepts like 'Learning Leadership' and 'Management Leadership' can be more succinct and precise. 4. Use of Jargon: While the use of specialized terminology is appropriate for a scholarly audience, it should be balanced with clear explanations to make the article accessible to a broader readership, including those not deeply familiar with the specific educational leadership jargon.</p> <p>Recommendations:</p> <p>1. Proofreading and Editing: A thorough proofreading and editing process is recommended to correct grammatical errors and improve sentence structure. 2. Clarity in Writing: Revise sections to enhance clarity and precision in presenting concepts and findings. 3. Consistent Referencing Style: Ensure that the referencing and citation style is consistent throughout the document. 4. Balancing Technical Language: Provide succinct definitions or explanations of specialized terms for accessibility to a broader audience.</p> <p>The article is a valuable contribution to the field of educational leadership, particularly in the context of the Indonesian education system. However, enhancing its language quality through careful editing and revision will significantly improve its suitability for scholarly communications and its overall impact in the academic community.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>Saortua Marbun</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>Universitas Triatma Mulya, Indonesia</p>