

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJPSS_112585</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Taxonomical approach on different soil types of Kalyana Karnataka</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

## Review Form 1.7

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Importance:</b> The authors carried out a taxonomical study on the red, lateritic, and black soils from Kalyana Karnataka belonged to selected soil series derived from diversified geology, topography, climate, and vegetation and were characterized and classified based on geomorphological, morphological, physical, and chemical soil properties.</li> <li><b>Title:</b> Preferred to be modified into “<b>Taxonomy of Soil Varieties in Kalyana Karnataka</b>”.</li> <li><b>Abstract:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The aim if the study is not stated in clear words.</li> <li>Provide an opening statement of one or two short sentences as a background on the problem.</li> <li>Abbreviate the scientific names after their first full appearance.</li> <li>Provide a closing statement as a conclusion for your study.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Structure of the manuscript:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Keywords:</b> Re-arrange in alphabetical order as suggested.</li> <li><b>Introduction:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Improperly arranged in two large paragraph. The introduction has to be re-arranged into three paragraphs i.e. 1. Introduction 2. Significance of the study, and 3. Aim of the study.</li> <li>The citation levels is too low which might give an indication of the low significance of the study.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>The aim:</b> Clear to some extent. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> <li><b>Materials and methods:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide the institutional ethical approval for the study.</li> <li>Provide the source and a reference for the used geographical maps in figures 1 and 2.</li> <li>Provide the sample size for the selected soils from the study districts.</li> <li>Provide a statistical analysis section with a reference for the software and the statistical model used.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Results:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Novel and clear to a certain extent.</li> <li>Abbreviate the scientific names after their first full appearance.</li> <li>Many modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Discussion:</b> Clear to a certain extent with low comparisons and speculation.</li> <li><b>Conclusion:</b> Clear to some extent. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> <li><b>Tables:</b> Well presented and organized..</li> <li><b>Figures:</b> Well presented and organized.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Scientific Soundness:</b> Although the old study (2015-2017), the manuscript highlighted the assessment of vegetable crops as an intercropping system in the Arecanut garden for additional returns.</li> <li><b>References:</b> MUST BE UPDATED as only 15% (3 out of 20) of the listed references were published in the past five years. The percentage has to increase to at least 35-40%. Old and un-updated references negatively impact the study and indicate that the study is no longer a point of interest.</li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p><b>General view:</b> The manuscript highlighted that the the black soil series other than the Margutti series were classified as <i>T. Haplusterts</i> while the Margutti series was grouped under <i>L. Haplusterts</i> at the sub-group level. The manuscript was expressed in moderate English and grammar. A certain degree of copyediting, proofreading, enriching the introduction with higher citation levels, enriching the discussion discussion with higher comparison and speculation, and reference updates have to be carried out before resubmission to achieve publishing value.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Essam Samir Soliman</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Suez Canal University, Egypt</b>