

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	South Asian Journal of Social Studies and Economics
Manuscript Number:	Ms_SAJ SSE_128054
Title of the Manuscript:	POLICY REVIEW ON LAND USE PLANNING IN THE SHORELINE AREAS OF LAKE TOBA: POTENTIAL FOR ECOTOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN MUARA DISTRICT, NORTH TAPANULI REGENCY
Type of the Article	

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. This paper underlines the significant but underutilized tourism potential in Muara Regency, especially around Lake Toba. These insights are crucial for developing targeted strategies to improve tourism in the region. 2. Identify key challenges such as inadequate infrastructure, limited facilities, and inadequate promotion, which are important obstacles to tourism development. Addressing these issues can lead to more effective tourism management and a better visitor experience 3. This paper emphasizes the importance of sustainable tourism practices to preserve the Lake Toba ecosystem. This focus on environmental conservation is essential to ensure the long-term survival of the region's natural attractions 4. By offering evidence-based policy recommendations, this paper contributes to the literature on tourism management and coastline development. This guide can help policymakers and stakeholders implement effective strategies tailored to local contexts 	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	<p>Title Evaluation</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Relevance to Content: The title accurately reflects the main focus of the article, which is a policy review on land use planning and the potential for ecotourism development in Muara Regency, North Tapanuli Regency ▪ Specificity: The title is specific enough to indicate a geographic focus (Muara Regency, North Tapanuli Regency) and a thematic focus (land use planning and ecotourism development) <p>Suggested Alternative Titles "Sustainable Ecotourism Development and Land Use Planning in Muara Regency, North Tapanuli Regency: A Policy Review for the Lake Toba Coastline Area"</p> <p>Reasons for Alternative Titles</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Emphasis on Sustainability: An alternative title emphasizes "sustainable ecotourism development," aligning with the article's focus on balancing tourism growth with environmental conservation. ▪ Clarity and Focus: Alternative headings maintain clarity and focus by defining the scope of the policy review and geographic area, ensuring that readers understand the main purpose of the article. 	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>Abstract Evaluation The abstract provides a broad overview of the potential and challenges of Muara Regency as a tourist destination, highlighting the natural beauty of Lake Toba and the Batak cultural heritage. Identify Challenges It effectively identifies key challenges such as inadequate infrastructure, limited supporting facilities, and inadequate promotion and professional management. Suggestions for Improvement 1. The inclusion of social and economic impacts Add points about the social and economic impacts of tourism development, such as job creation, improvement of community welfare, and cultural preservation. 2. Details on Data Collection Methods Include brief mentions of the research methods used, such as direct observations, surveys, and interviews, to provide context on how the data was collected. 3. Highlighting Specific Issues with Facilities and Services Determine issues related to public facilities, such as lack of clean toilets, information centers, and adequate accommodation, as well as mismatches between cost and quality of service. 4. Promotions and Environmental Issues Mention limited tourism information and digital promotion, as well as the environmental threats posed by unsustainable activities. 5. Strategic Recommendations Summarize strategic recommendations to improve facilities, leverage digital promotions, and improve human resource development to provide a clear direction for future action. 6. SWOT Analysis Insights Incorporates insights from SWOT analysis, such as the strengths of natural beauty and cultural richness, and weaknesses such as limited facilities and environmental risks. By including these additional points, the abstract will provide a more comprehensive and detailed overview of the research, covering all aspects and critical recommendations.</p>	
<p>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</p>	<p>Scientific Accuracy of the Manuscript 1. Tourism Potential in Muara Regency This manuscript accurately identifies Muara Regency as having significant tourism potential due to its natural beauty and cultural heritage, especially around Lake Toba. 2. Challenges in Tourism Development This paper accurately highlights the challenges faced by Muara Regency, including inadequate infrastructure, limited supporting facilities, and inadequate professional promotion and management. 3. Environmental Sustainability Issues This paper properly addresses the risks of poorly managed tourism activities damaging Lake Toba's ecosystem, emphasizing the need for sustainable tourism practices. 4. Research Methodology and Tools This paper provides a detailed description of the research methodology, including the selection of specific villages to study and the use of tools such as Microsoft Office and ArcGIS for data processing and spatial analysis. 5. Policy and Zoning Strategy This paper discusses the importance of zoning strategies for shoreline utilization to balance environmental conservation and development needs, supported by previous research. 6. Local Context Considerations This paper emphasizes the need for tailored strategies that are in tune with local conditions in Muara Regency, which is an important aspect of effective tourism management. 7. Data-Driven Approach This paper aims to provide strategic recommendations based on a data-driven approach, which is important for informed decision-making in tourism development. Overall, the manuscript is scientifically accurate and well supported by the context provided. It effectively addresses the key aspects of tourism potential, challenges, environmental sustainability, and the need for tailored data-driven strategies.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>Reference Evaluation Adequacy of References The references provided cover various topics relevant to tourism development, ecotourism and regional planning. They cover basic texts and recent studies, ensuring a comprehensive understanding of the subject matter. Latest References References include the latest publications from 2022 and 2023, which are essential for understanding current trends and developments</p>	-

Review Form 3

	<p>in tourism and environmental management.</p> <p>Suggestions for Additional References</p> <p>1. Inclusion of More Recent Studies Although the references are generally up to date, incorporating more studies from the last two years could provide additional insight into recent advances and challenges in sustainable tourism and ecotourism practices.</p> <p>2. Focus on Digital and Technology Promotion in Tourism Given the emphasis on digital promotion and infrastructure improvements in the recommendations, including reference to the role of technology and digital marketing in tourism could be useful. This will provide a more rounded perspective on how digital tools can improve tourism management and promotion.</p> <p>3. Case Studies of Successful Ecotourism Models Adding case studies of successful ecotourism models from other regions or countries can offer practical examples and strategies that can be adapted for Lake Toba. This will help in understanding the practical application of theoretical concepts discussed in the existing references.</p> <p>References to Community Based Tourism As community engagement is highlighted as a key strategy, including references that focus on community-based tourism and its impact on local economies and social structures would be valuable. This would support the argument for involving local communities in tourism development.</p> <p>By addressing these points, references can be made more robust and comprehensive, providing a thorough foundation for research and recommendations.</p>	
<p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Overall, the language and English quality of the articles are suitable for scientific communication, meeting the standards of clarity, structure, technical accuracy, and proper citation.</p>	<p>-</p>
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>In general, this article has been structured with a comprehensive approach. This article is to analyze the potential and challenges of tourism in Muara Regency, offering evidence-based strategies for sustainable development. These points highlight a range of competing interests issues that need to be addressed to ensure sustainable tourism development in the region. Points that need to be considered include:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Limited and Unreliable Tourism Information 2. Lack of Utilization of Digital Promotion 3. Inadequate Infrastructure and Facilities 4. Risk of Environmental Degradation 5. Inadequate Infrastructure and Facilities 6. The Need for Community-Based Conservation Programs <p>Cooperation between Government and Stakeholders no plagiarism found yet <i>This manuscript has no ethical writing problems</i></p>	<p>-</p>

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Reviewer Details:

<p>Name:</p>	<p>I Putu Putra Astawa,S.Kom.,M.Kom</p>
<p>Department, University & Country</p>	<p>Hindu University of Indonesia, Indonesia</p>