

### Review Form 3

Journal Name:	<a href="#">South Asian Journal of Social Studies and Economics</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_SAJ SSE_128054
Title of the Manuscript:	POLICY REVIEW ON LAND USE PLANNING IN THE SHORELINE AREAS OF LAKE TOBA: POTENTIAL FOR ECOTOURISM DEVELOPMENT IN MUARA DISTRICT, NORTH TAPANULI REGENCY
Type of the Article	Original Article

#### **General guidelines for the Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

#### **Important Policies Regarding Peer Review**

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Comments**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	This article is very good in introducing the current condition of ecotourism management in Lake Toba, this is very important to support national tourism efforts especially in future policy analysis. The information in the article is quite good in analyzing the field and the ideal management needed.	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	The title section is good enough	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	In this section it is quite good but in the first sentence it is better to add a sentence about the importance of ecotourism management in Lake Toba, and how policies must be integrated as a whole. We suggest you add a sentence such as: Ecotourism development must be integrated with community management and supported by a comprehensive land use planning review.	
<b>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</b>	Yes, it is quite scientific, but it needs to be supported by the ecotourism concept that has been applied in various other places. In addition, we would like to suggest that you can write down the appropriate SWOT analysis procedure by providing ratings and scales, if not, you should refer to the commonly used SWOT method, for example the SWOT Analysis developed by Damanik	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>	This article has not explained much about how important ecotourism is as environmental management, ecotourism theories have not been widely presented. We suggest that you can include various literature on ecotourism practices that are relevant to your study. This will be able to add to your references.	
<b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	The language in the article is quite good and easy to understand.	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	This article provides quite important information so it is very good to be processed for publication, Research suggestions and recommendations will be very useful for the development of national tourism. However, various literature is needed in packaging ecotourism development efforts, you can add for example in the introduction 2 or 3 paragraphs about the importance of ecotourism to be developed. This article is quite good. "I declare that I have no competing interest as a reviewer"	

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Marlina</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Universitas Negeri Makassar, Indonesia</b>