

### Review Form 3

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research</a>   |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_AJFAR_127616   |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effectiveness of Adding Spirulina Meal in Improving the Colour of Platy Fish ( <i>Xiphophorus maculatus</i> ) |
| Type of the Article      |   |

#### PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments   | Reviewer's comment  | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|--|---|---|
| <b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>                        | The study evaluates the effect of spirulina meal on the coloration of platy fish, focusing on optimal dosage and its impact on color intensity, growth, and survival. Using a randomized design, results show that 3% spirulina meal significantly enhances brightness, redness, and yellowness, while maintaining high survival rates. Excessive doses (5%) diminished benefits. The findings highlight spirulina's potential as a natural pigment source for ornamental fish, with practical applications for improving marketability and aesthetic appeal in aquaculture.  |   |
| <b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>  | <b>YES</b><br>The title is clear and reflects the study. However, consider rephrasing for conciseness (e.g., "Effectiveness of Spirulina Meal in Enhancing Platy Fish <i>Xiphophorus maculatus</i> Color")  |   |
| <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>   | <b>YES</b><br>The abstract provides good detail but could benefit from reorganization for clarity. Separate findings (e.g., optimal dose, survival rate) into distinct sentences for better readability.  |   |
| <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>  |   |   |
| <b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b> | <p><b>1. Methodology</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Well-detailed and replicable. Consider adding justifications for sample size (12 experimental units) and duration (45 days) for clarity.</li> <li>The description of tools like the colorimeter is clear, but additional details about calibration procedures would improve transparency.</li> </ul> <p><b>2. Results</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Results are presented effectively with appropriate figures and statistical analyses..</li> </ul> <p><b>3. Discussion</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The interpretation of the results is comprehensive. However, certain statements (e.g., impact of Melanocyte Stimulating Hormone) could include citations or further clarification for readers unfamiliar with these concepts.</li> <li>Explore more on the implications of spirulina meal for commercial fish farming</li> </ul> |   |

**Review Form 3**

|   |  |  |
|---|--|--|
|   | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Discussion on why the 3% dose was optimal could be expanded, particularly linking findings to biochemical mechanisms or previous studies</li> </ul>                     |  |
| <p><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b></p> |  |  |
| <p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>         | NO   |  |
| <p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>   | <input type="checkbox"/> Consider highlighting environmental or economic impacts of using spirulina as a feed additive.<br><input type="checkbox"/> Discuss potential limitations (e.g., scalability, feed cost) |  |

**PART 2:**

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
|  | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>  | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
| <p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p> | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> |  |

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                   |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>R. Azhagu Raj</b>              |
| Department, University & Country | <b>St. Xaviers College, India</b> |