

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Economics, Management and Trade
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEMT_126977
Title of the Manuscript:	THE VIRTUAL INTERNATIONAL EXCHANGE OF EXTREME PRODUCTIVE FACTORS AND SUSTAINABILITY: CASE STUDY OF AN EFFICIENT EDUCATIONAL VECTOR
Type of the Article	

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The authors examine how the Heckscher-Ohlin model can be used to impose an optimal import tax on countries operating within the global technology frontier, and an optimal export tax on countries whose production possibilities frontier is greater than the global technology frontier. They find that when the Heckscher-Ohlin model imposes an optimal tax, the productivity of the formal sector in industrialized countries reaches its maximum, inducing a low cost of production, while the volume of the informal sector in under-industrialized countries reaches its absolute minimum, with equilibrium production in the informal sector.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Title of the article is suitable	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The results of the regression model have not been presented in the abstract. The authors may wish to reformulate the abstract to take account of the results obtained.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	The subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The methodological approach presented by the authors is not supported by theoretical foundations or empirical work in the literature. In addition, the variables used, the model's fundamental assumptions and the assumptions about factors that can be traded between countries have not been clearly defined. Nor have the authors specified how externalities or factor productivity shocks are taken into account in the model. It seems that the authors have not highlighted or clearly described comparative advantages between countries. Furthermore, the authors have used a panel data regression model, but have not taken into account stationarity tests in the data, or heterogeneity between OECD and developing countries.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	The authors can refer to the following works to improve the paper : <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Galor, O., & Moav, O. (2002). <i>Natural Selection and the Origin of Economic Growth</i>. AER, 92(4), 1133-1191. • Matsuyama, K. (1991). <i>Immiserizing Growth in Diamond's Overlapping Generations Model: A Geometrical Exposition</i>. AER, 81(1), 251-265. • Razin, A., & Ben-Zion, U. (1975). <i>An Intergenerational Model of Population Growth</i>. AER, 65(5), 923-933. • Diamond, P. A. (1965). <i>National Debt in a Neoclassical Growth Model</i>. AER, 55(5), 1126-1150. • Stiglitz, J. E. (1970). <i>Factor Price Equalization in a Dynamic Economy</i>. AER, 60(4), 456-488. 	

Review Form 3

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Boppart, T., Krusell, P., & Olsson, J. (2020). <i>Labor Supply in the Past, Present, and Future: A Balanced-Growth Perspective</i>. AER, 110(4), 1103-1135. • Fajgelbaum, P., & Khandelwal, A. K. (2021). <i>The Economic Impacts of COVID-19: Evidence from a New Public Database Built Using Private Sector Data</i>. AER, 111(3), 775-824. • Adao, R., Beraja, M., & Pandalai-Nayar, N. (2021). <i>Market Access and Economic Development: Evidence from Mexico's Banking Deregulation</i>. AER, 111(9), 3025-3066. • Alvarez, F., & Shimer, R. (2022). <i>Search Theory with Leisure as an Endogenous Choice: Implications for Optimal Unemployment Insurance</i>. AER, 112(1), 161-196. • Antràs, P., & Padró i Miquel, G. (2023). <i>Globalization and International Development: A Multigenerational Analysis</i>. AER, 113(2), 525-552. 	
Minor REVISION comments		
Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	The language quality of the article is suitable	
Optional/General comments	<p>The authors state in the introduction that “In the existing literature, there is no rigorous formulation of how intergenerational free trade interacts with the international free trade to determine general macrodynamic equilibrium in terms of optimal growth. Optimal allocation of economic resources should lead to optimal growth and sustainable development.” This statement is erroneous insofar as there are rigorous models in the economic literature that examine the interactions between intergenerational free trade and international free trade to determine the macrodynamic equilibrium in terms of optimal growth. This work is often inspired by Overlapping Generations Models (OLG), endogenous growth models with intergenerational transfers and trade, and OLG models with international openness.</p> <p>The authors should present the data sources and describe the variables used. The introduction should clearly state the problem addressed or raised by the article. They should present the sources below the graphs and present the x-axis in years. Size and font should be the same for the whole document.</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Lawin Laïfoya Moïse
Department, University & Country	Université De Québec à Montréal (UQAM), Canada