

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">International Research Journal of Oncology</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IRJO_127606
Title of the Manuscript:	CLINICAL CHARACTERISTICS AND PROGNOSIS OF PAPILLARY THYROID CARCINOMA IN ADOLESCENT PATIENTS
Type of the Article	

**PART 1: Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>	<p>The topic of characteristics and prognosis of adolescent PTC is quite interesting and important since this group of patients is a minority group of PTC that might have unique biological behavior. As we know pediatric PTC patients usually have a better prognosis than their adult counterparts due to higher expression of Na-I symporter in the pediatric group making them show better response to I-131 iodine therapy. The adolescent group may come with age between pediatric and adult that may persist mix combination of biological behaviors found in the two groups.</p> <p>The problem is that in this study the number of subjects is limited (seven patients) which makes it difficult to raise conclusions about the topic. It seems that this study is more like a case series. In addition, the author should be more detailed not only about the preoperative staging and recurrence but also about the given treatment modality (extension of surgery and I-131 iodine therapy) and its corresponding response, considering that the most important issue here is to show how the adolescent PTC characteristics with its biologic behavior affect the responsiveness to I-131 therapy which finally account for the prognosis. That's the thing that makes this group of patients different from adult and pediatric patients.</p>	
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>	I think the title would be better if the author were more specific about the special issue and added "case series" to make it clearer for the reader, for example "Case Series of Treatment Challenges in Adolescent Papillary Thyroid Carcinoma"	
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>	<p>I prefer to add how adolescent PTC patients are treated and the clinical outcome compared to pediatric and adult patients, not merely discuss preoperative clinical staging. It would be more interesting if the author could link the unique patient characteristics with the responsiveness to treatment.</p> <p>No need to state suggestions for further research in the abstract, just mention what the author found in his study and make a temporary conclusion about that.</p>	
<b>Is the manuscript scientifically, correct? Please write here.</b>	Scientifically correct, but still a need to raise more specific issues about adolescent papillary thyroid cancer.	
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>	Several references are considered out of date since there are not published within the last five years. Besides, the author needs to add more references until around 20-25, especially from the reputable international guidelines, like ATA guideline, NCCN, etc	

### Review Form 3

<b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b>	Moderate suitable for scholarly communication	
<b>Optional/General</b> comments	<b>Need to add more specific issues about adolescent PTC patients</b>	

### **PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

### Reviewer Details:

Name:	<b>I Gusti Ngurah Gunawan Wibisana</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Cipto Mangunkusumo Hospital, Universitas Indonesia, Indonesia</b>