

**Review Form 3**

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Asian Journal of Education and Social Studies</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJESS_126495
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Will Machines Replace Humans in the Hospitality Business?</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Research Paper</b>

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The chosen topic of this manuscript has the potential to contribute academically and practically to the fields of science and technology, particularly within the hospitality and hotel industries. Currently, AI, including technologies like ChatGPT, is a significant point of discussion across various industries, with many applications already in commercial use (e.g., smart order systems for tables). However, while I believe the research background and intent of the manuscript are quite innovative, upon closer examination, I found that the justification for the research need, as well as the citations and examples regarding areas where AI technology is replacing roles in the hospitality sector, were not sufficiently robust. For instance, referencing hotel laundry services or coffee machines as areas being replaced by AI technology is questionable. Additionally, the manuscript lacked adequate examples of areas in hotels where AI technologies cannot replace human roles.</p> <p>Moreover, as AI technology continues to advance, the controversies surrounding personal data collection are intensifying. However, the assertion made on page 11 that "most hotels collect all customer information" is presented without sufficient justification, which raises concerns regarding sensitive issues. I also believe that the necessity and objectives of the research need to be articulated more clearly.</p> <p>Furthermore, responses to the research objectives stated in section 1.1, parts a and b, should be more precise. Therefore, while the manuscript demonstrates originality in its topic, it lacks logical structure and validity.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>Yes, I believe the title is quite appropriate and suitable.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The research objectives appear to be well established. However, in the findings section, it would enhance readability to first mention that "they cannot completely replace human roles in providing genuine and personalized guest services, as noted in previous research," and then state, "This study has concluded that..."</p> <p>Additionally, in the originality section, rather than simply stating that this research has not been presented in any other forum, it would be more appropriate to express that "this study has analyzed and discussed the implications of AI adoption in the labor-intensive hospitality and hotel sector from various perspectives, thereby deriving meaningful academic and practical insights."</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>there is a notable lack of clear paragraph differentiation throughout the text. Additionally, the sections on research methodology and discussion are missing. Since the abstract mentions a literature review, it would be beneficial to create a distinct "Research Methodology" section that details the methods employed. Furthermore, the discussion of the results derived by the researchers should be expanded to provide a more comprehensive analysis.</p> <p>In addition, Regarding the section, "Therefore, while using this artificial intelligence robotics or humanoid robots or different machines will be some recommendations for a better future," I believe that this content does not adequately reflect practical and academic implications for the hotel and hospitality sectors. Additionally, the conclusions presented are quite abstract. It is essential to include specific details about how AI can contribute to particular areas within the hotel and hospitality industries, outlining the potential benefits and applications more concretely.</p>	

**Review Form 3**

<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>I believe this manuscript reflects the realities of the Fourth Industrial Revolution that we experience in our daily lives. By discussing this topic, it explores ways for the hospitality and hotel sectors to integrate and coexist with science and technology, providing significant insights for both the field and academia. Therefore, I consider it scientifically sound.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. -</p>	<p>I have identified several inappropriate citations that I would like to address:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. In line 16 of page 2, the citation (Ivanov, Webster, &amp; Berezina, 2017) is mentioned. I suggest the following: "The author discusses the social trend changes indicating that the situation in the hospitality sector is no longer the same. However, citing a 2017 study may not be appropriate, especially considering the significant changes that occurred in the hospitality and tourism industries before and after the COVID-19 pandemic. A reassessment of the citation is recommended."</li> <li>2. In line 9 of page 2, the statement "As many of the leading international and national brands have occupied the market and are providing facilities at a competitive price; people have the option to locate any hotel at any given time according to their choice. Therefore, it is always a challenging task for any hotel or hospitality business owner to keep their prospective clients/guests satisfied to survive in this competitive market" could be improved by discussing how customer needs for hotel services have changed before and after the pandemic. Please include relevant citations to support this point.</li> <li>3. In line 14 of page 3, the phrase "There are ~ academia" acknowledges various industries related to AI and robotics, which is a good intention. However, references to fields like business schools and universities may imply that the application of AI and robotics is primarily related to education. Therefore, it would be more appropriate to cite industries relevant to this study, such as airlines, resorts, and travel agencies. Additionally, citations and sources for examples of AI and robotics applications should be included.</li> <li>4. In line 9 of page 4, the phrase "is a valid topic for discussion in the arena of research?" could be improved. Simply stating that it is a valid topic does not clearly convey the uniqueness of the research. Therefore, it is essential to articulate how this study differentiates itself from existing literature more explicitly.</li> <li>5. In line 15 of page 4, the statement "Therefore, it became ~ competitive market." lacks a clear presentation of the research's necessity. The author notes that companies in the current hotel and hospitality market are implementing strategies to differentiate their pricing competition. However, the sentence "Therefore, it became obvious for the operators to obtain various technologies and their applications to facilitate their guest and to survive their business in a competitive market" is too abstract. It would be more effective to articulate the author's intent more clearly, necessitating a revision of this part.</li> <li>6. In line 1 of page 5, the phrase "It was challenging ~ data and machine learning" requires attention. The period commonly associated with the Third Industrial Revolution is from the 1970s to the 1990s. Mentioning machine learning and data in this context may be incorrect, and the citation is also inappropriate. It would be more coherent to remove this section.</li> <li>7. In line 12 of page 5, regarding "the past 30 years," I suggest the following. While the text discusses the last 30 years, citing information from 2013 is not appropriate. A revision of the citation is necessary to ensure accuracy.</li> <li>8. In line 15 of page 5, regarding "However, to reduce ~ other machines," I suggest the following. While the citations are appropriate and based on recent literature, it is essential to recognize that the hotel and hospitality sectors encompass various</li> </ol>	

**Review Form 3**

	<p>departments and tasks. Therefore, it is necessary to specify in which areas of guest service artificial intelligence and services like ChatGPT are being utilized.</p> <p>9. In line 2 of page 7, the statement "The main reason ~ compared to a human" lacks a source. Therefore, it is crucial to provide valid evidence to support this claim.</p> <p>10. In line 18 of page 7, regarding "As recorded ~ drone services," I suggest that this content appears to be unrelated to the focus of the study. It would be more appropriate to remove this section. Additionally, citing sources from the 1990s is not considered valid in this context.</p> <p>11. In line 29 of page 7, regarding "Many researchers have shown ~ instead of a human being," I suggest that the citation from 2010 may not accurately reflect the current situation in 2024. Even if there were concerns about technology adoption in 2010, the landscape may have significantly changed. It would be more appropriate to cite more recent studies or consider removing this content.</p> <p>12. In line 12 of page 8, regarding "in the process of whether ~ and technology," I recommend adjusting the placement of the citation. Additionally, citing a source from 2008 is outdated, and updating it would be advisable.</p> <p>13. In line 5 of page 9, regarding "In the 90s most of ~ 10 number of people at the same time," it is important to provide employment figures from the 1990s, but it would also be beneficial to present current employment statistics from the 2020s for comparison. If no comparative data is available, it may be more prudent to avoid presenting specific figures.</p> <p>14. In line 5 of page 9, regarding "automatic laundry machines," I suggest that automatic washers and dryers are not new technologies that have replaced labor in the 2020s. Their prevalence in hotels does not align with the intended discussion of AI and technologies replacing human roles, so it may be more appropriate to exclude this mention.</p> <p>15. In line 16 of page 9, regarding "Many coffee shops ~ coffees," I suggest that mentioning coffee machines in coffee shops and cafes is not relevant to the areas where AI technology is making an impact. This content does not align with the focus of the research and disrupts the flow of the argument.</p> <p>16. In line 22 of page 9, regarding "For most of the multiple ~ in less time," there is a lack of valid evidence to support this claim. Many establishments still employ staff for cleaning tasks. If the researcher intends to include this information, it is crucial to provide appropriate evidence to back up the statement.</p> <p>17. In line 6 of page 10, regarding "Even in the hospitality ~ blackboard, and others," I suggest clarifying which specific areas or tasks within the hospitality or hotel industry have seen an increase in virtual meetings. Providing examples would enhance the reader's understanding.</p> <p>18. In line 13 of page 10, regarding "Even in the hospitality academics ~ digital perform," it is important to note that many universities and educational institutions have transitioned back to in-person classes after the end of the COVID-19 pandemic. Therefore, this statement may no longer be accurate. Additionally, citing a 2018 paper to support the claim that "institutions are forcing their mentor to conduct classes by using digital perform" lacks logical consistency and disrupts the flow of the argument, necessitating revision.</p> <p>19. In line 29 of page 10, regarding "online transactions ~ in transaction," I suggest reevaluating the relevance of this statement. Online commerce existed prior to the</p>	
--	--	--

**Review Form 3**

	<p>advent of AI and the Fourth Industrial Revolution, so its inclusion should be justified.</p> <p>20. In line 8 of page 11, regarding "For example ~ personalized interfaces," it is essential to specify how AI technologies will be applied in particular areas or fields within the hospitality industry. This content is currently too abstract; providing detailed examples, such as AI-enabled menus in hotel restaurants, would improve clarity.</p> <p>21. In line 14 of page 11, regarding "So it will become ~ on guest complaints," I suggest that while addressing customer complaint behavior is indeed crucial in a service-based industry, it is essential to discuss specific ways in which AI-related technologies can be utilized to resolve these complaints. The current wording is too abstract and requires more concrete suggestions for improvement.</p> <p>22. In line 18 of page 11, regarding "Most of the hotels ~ guests and the feedback, and guests," the assertion that most hotels collect all customer information does not reflect the current societal concerns surrounding data privacy. This statement addresses a sensitive issue, and I recommend revising or removing it to avoid potential implications.</p> <p>23. In line 7 of page 12, regarding "Instead of deploying ~ guest queries," evidence is needed to support the claim that all hotels are using digital concierges. There are still many hotels operating in an analog manner that do not employ digital concierge services. If you wish to include this statement, it is crucial to provide appropriate evidence.</p> <p>24. In line 24 of page 12, in the section "3.3 Areas where artificial intelligence and machines cannot replace human," it would be beneficial to expand the discussion on areas within the hotel industry where AI cannot replace human roles. Including references to critical areas such as back office operations and facilities would enhance the content and provide a more comprehensive analysis.</p> <p>25. In line 9 of page 14, regarding "The review period ~ database," I suggest that conducting a review from 1990 onwards may be flawed, as AI technology was not commercialized during that decade. You should provide a valid reason for including literature from the 1990s in your analysis. Otherwise, it would be more appropriate to focus your review starting from the early 2010s, when AI technology and smartphones became more widely adopted.</p>	
<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>Yes, the language used in the manuscript is academic and the English vocabulary is appropriate, contributing to good readability.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>		

**Review Form 3**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Chae-Won Ha</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Sejong University, South Korea</b>