

### Review Form 3

Journal Name:	<a href="#">Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</a>
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JEAI_125229
Title of the Manuscript:	Standardization techniques for grafting in pomegranate ( <i>Punica granatum</i> Linn.)
Type of the Article	

#### **General guidelines for the Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

#### **Important Policies Regarding Peer Review**

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

## Review Form 3

### PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The manuscript titled "Standardization techniques for grafting in pomegranate ( <i>Punica granatum</i> Linn.)" offers significant contributions to the scientific community, particularly in the field of horticulture and crop propagation. By systematically evaluating different grafting methods and timings, the study provides valuable insights that can enhance the efficiency and success rate of pomegranate cultivation. This is crucial for improving yield and meeting the growing demand for pomegranates, both commercially and nutritionally. I appreciate the comprehensive approach taken by the researchers, including the use of statistical analyses and detailed observations over a considerable period. The findings, such as the superiority of softwood grafting performed on July 15th under shade net conditions, are practical and can be directly applied by growers to optimize production. Additionally, the manuscript addresses a gap in propagation techniques for pomegranates, which is beneficial for advancing agricultural practices. Overall, the study is well-structured and contributes meaningful knowledge to the field.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes, the current title "Standardization techniques for grafting in pomegranate ( <i>Punica granatum</i> Linn.)" is generally suitable as it reflects the main focus of your study. However, to enhance clarity and better convey the scope of the research, it might be considered rephrasing it slightly. Here is alternative title: "Standardization of Grafting Techniques and Timing in Pomegranate ( <i>Punica granatum</i> L.) Propagation" The suggested title highlight both the methods and the timing aspects of your study, emphasizing the optimization and evaluation processes that lead to improved grafting success in pomegranates.	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract provides some key information about the study, including the treatments used and the main findings. However, it can be improved to make it more comprehensive and reader-friendly. Here are my suggestions for additions and deletions: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Begin the abstract with 1-2 sentences that introduce the importance of pomegranate cultivation and the need for effective grafting techniques.</li> <li>• Clearly articulate the main objective of the study after the introduction.</li> <li>• Instead of listing all treatments and their codes (T1, T2, etc.), provide a concise description of the experimental design. For example: "Twelve treatments combining softwood and tongue grafting methods were evaluated at fortnightly intervals from June 15 to August 30 using one-year-old 'Ganesh' seedlings as rootstock."</li> <li>• Present the main findings in a summarized form, focusing on significant outcomes and comparisons between methods. For example: "Softwood grafting performed on July 15 resulted in the highest graft success rate (74% at 60 days after grafting), early bud break (15.16 days), and sprouting percentage (57.32% at 150 days after grafting)."</li> <li>• End the abstract with a conclusion that emphasizes the practical implications of the findings. For example: "The study concludes that softwood grafting on July 15 is the most effective technique for pomegranate propagation under shade net conditions and can be recommended for commercial adoption."</li> <li>• Omit specific institutional details and excessive technical terms that may not be essential in the abstract.</li> <li>• Ensure sentences are grammatically correct and the abstract flows logically from introduction to conclusion. For example: Instead of "An Experiment was conducted at Department of Agriculture....," use "An experiment was conducted during 2023-2024 to evaluate..."</li> <li>• Use consistent terms for grafting methods (e.g., "tongue grafting" vs. "whip &amp; tongue grafting") to avoid confusion.</li> </ul> By implementing these suggestions, the abstract will offer a comprehensive and concise overview of the research, effectively communicating its significance and findings to the scientific community.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	While the overall structure is appropriate, here are some suggestions to enhance the clarity and effectiveness of the manuscript: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Include a clearer statement of the research gap and the specific objectives or hypotheses of the study at the end of the introduction.</li> <li>• Ensure consistent use of terminology throughout the manuscript. For example, use either "whip and tongue grafting" or "tongue grafting" consistently.</li> <li>• When introducing treatments (T1, T2, etc.), provide a brief description or a table summarizing them for easy reference.</li> <li>• Ensure all tables are clearly labeled, with appropriate titles, column headings, and units of measurement. Include notes explaining any abbreviations or statistical indicators used.</li> <li>• Provide more details on the statistical analysis methods used, including any software or specific tests performed.</li> <li>• Expand the discussion to include potential reasons for the findings, implications for growers, and suggestions for future research.</li> <li>• Review the manuscript for grammatical errors, typos, and awkward phrasing. Consider having a colleague or professional editor proofread the document.</li> <li>• Ensure that all references are formatted consistently according to the guidelines of the journal to which you plan to submit.</li> </ul> Overall, the manuscript is well-structured and contains the essential sections required for a scientific research article. By implementing the suggested improvements, it can enhance the clarity, readability, and impact of the work.	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound because it employs a systematic and well-designed experimental approach to address a clear research question in pomegranate propagation. The use of a completely randomized design with appropriate replications enhances the reliability and validity of the findings. Statistical analyses are properly conducted, allowing for meaningful interpretation of the data and supporting the conclusions drawn about the effectiveness of softwood grafting on July 15th. Furthermore, the manuscript demonstrates a thorough understanding of the subject by referencing relevant literature, which helps to contextualize the results within the broader field of horticultural science.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.	Overall, the references cited in the manuscript are sufficient and encompass both foundational and recent studies pertinent to pomegranate grafting techniques. The inclusion of studies ranging from 1986 to 2023 demonstrates a thorough literature review and situates the research within the broader scientific context.	

### Review Form 3

<p><u>Minor</u> REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p><b>Specific Observations and Suggestions:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Grammar and Syntax:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ <b>Examples:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ "An Experiment was conducted at Department of Agriculture, School of Agriculture and Veterinary Science, Shridhar University, Pilani, Rajasthan, India during 2023-2024."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "An experiment was conducted at the Department of Agriculture, School of Agriculture and Veterinary Science, Shridhar University, Pilani, Rajasthan, India, during 2023–2024."</li> <li>▪ "softwood grafting and (T1 on June 15; T2 on June 30; T3 on July 15; T4; on July 30; T5 on August 15; T6 on August 30), tongue grafting (T7 on June 15; T8 on June 30; and T9 on July 15, T10 on 30th July, T11 on August15, T12 on August 30) these were the 12 grafting techniques that used as treatments in the study."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "Twelve grafting treatments were used in the study, comprising softwood grafting (T1–T6) and tongue grafting (T7–T12) performed at fortnightly intervals from June 15 to August 30."</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>2. <b>Consistency in Terminology:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The manuscript alternates between "tongue grafting" and "whip &amp; tongue grafting."</li> <li>▪ <b>Suggestion:</b> Use one term consistently throughout the manuscript to avoid confusion.</li> </ul> </li> <li>3. <b>Punctuation and Capitalization:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ensure proper use of commas, periods, and other punctuation marks.</li> <li>▪ <b>Examples:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ "Due to its robust nature, pomegranates may thrive in a broad range of climates, including tropical, subtropical, desert, and temperate ones."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "Due to their robust nature, pomegranates thrive in a broad range of climates, including tropical, subtropical, desert, and temperate regions."</li> </ul> </li> <li>▪ Section headings like "INRODUCTION" should be corrected to "INTRODUCTION" and formatted appropriately.</li> </ul> </li> <li>4. <b>Sentence Structure:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Some sentences are overly long or contain redundant information.</li> <li>▪ <b>Suggestion:</b> Break complex sentences into shorter, clearer ones.</li> <li>▪ <b>Example:</b> "One of the most revered and ancient beloved fruits. A common term for it is 'friendship fruit.'"</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "The pomegranate is one of the most revered and ancient fruits, commonly referred to as the 'friendship fruit.'"</li> </ul> </li> <li>5. <b>Typographical Errors:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ There are several typos and misspellings.</li> <li>▪ <b>Examples:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ "INRODUCTION" should be "INTRODUCTION."</li> <li>▪ "anti-oxident" should be "antioxidant."</li> <li>▪ "Experiment T3, which entailed grafting softwood on July 15th, had the highest outcomes..." should clarify that T3 is a treatment, not an experiment.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li>6. <b>Clarity and Conciseness:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ The manuscript should convey information clearly and concisely.</li> <li>▪ <b>Suggestion:</b> Remove unnecessary words and focus on the main points.</li> <li>▪ <b>Example:</b> "Currently, 275,500 hectares are planted with this fruit crop, which yields 3 million metric tons (MMT) of fruit year (NHB statistics 2021-22)."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "As of 2021–22, 275,500 hectares are planted with pomegranates in India, yielding 3 million metric tons annually (NHB statistics)."</li> </ul> </li> <li>7. <b>Use of Scientific Language:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Adopt formal scientific language appropriate for scholarly articles.</li> <li>▪ <b>Suggestion:</b> Replace colloquial expressions with precise terminology.</li> <li>▪ <b>Example:</b> "It is grown commercially in the state of Maharashtra, Gujrat, Karnataka..."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "It is commercially cultivated in the states of Maharashtra, Gujarat, Karnataka..."</li> </ul> </li> <li>8. <b>Formatting and Organization:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ensure that all sections, tables, and references follow a consistent format.</li> <li>▪ <b>Suggestion:</b> Number tables sequentially, provide clear titles, and ensure all columns are labeled.</li> <li>▪ Check that references are formatted according to the journal's guidelines.</li> </ul> </li> <li>9. <b>Subject-Verb Agreement:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>○ Ensure that subjects and verbs agree in number.</li> <li>▪ <b>Example:</b> "There are over 760 varieties of pomegranate. Each pomegranate has about 840 seeds."</li> <li>▪ <b>Correction:</b> "There are over 760 varieties of pomegranate, each containing about 840 seeds."</li> </ul> </li> </ol> <p>Improving the language quality will significantly enhance the manuscript's effectiveness in communicating the research findings to the scientific community.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comment</p>		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<p>Name:</p>	<p><b>Vikas Sharma</b></p>
<p>Department, University &amp; Country</p>	<p><b>Swami Keshwanand Rajasthan Agricultural University, India</b></p>