

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Agriculture and Forestry
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRAF_127082
Title of the Manuscript:	The Analysis of Determinants of Production and Optimization of Garlic Farming in Sembalun District East Lombok Regency
Type of the Article	

[Review Form 3](#)

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript is significant for the scientific community and address critical issues in agricultural productivity and sustainability. By focusing on the optimization of production inputs, particularly the use of organic fertilizers, the study contributes valuable insights into improving garlic farming practices in Indonesia, a country facing challenges in meeting its garlic consumption needs. The research employs robust statistical methods, including multiple regression analysis and the Cobb-Douglas production function, to provide empirical evidence on the efficiency of input usage, which can inform policy decisions and agricultural strategies.</p> <p>Personally, I appreciate this manuscript for its practical implications and methodological rigor. It not only highlights the importance of efficient resource allocation in farming but also emphasizes the potential benefits of organic farming practices. However, I would have liked to see a broader discussion on the long-term impacts of these practices on soil health and ecosystem sustainability, which would enhance the manuscript's relevance to contemporary agricultural challenges.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title of the article, "The Analysis of Determinants of Production and Optimization of Garlic Farming in Sembalun District East Lombok Regency," is generally suitable as it accurately reflects the content and focus of the research.</p> <p>A suggested alternative title could be: "Optimizing Garlic Production: Analyzing Key Factors in Sembalun District, East Lombok."</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract of the article "The Analysis of Determinants of Production and Optimization of Garlic Farming in Sembalun District East Lombok Regency" provides a solid overview of the study's objectives, methodology, and key findings. However, it could be enhanced by incorporating a few additional elements for greater comprehensiveness.</p> <p>Suggestions for Improvement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Clearer Objective Statement: The purpose of the study could be stated more explicitly at the beginning to immediately inform readers about the main research question or hypothesis being addressed. • Key Findings Summary: While the abstract mentions that certain fertilizers have a significant effect on production quantity, it would benefit from a brief summary of the specific results regarding efficiency levels and recommendations for input adjustments. This would provide a clearer picture of the implications of the findings. • Contextual Background: Including a sentence that highlights the broader significance of garlic farming in Indonesia or the specific challenges faced by farmers in Sembalun District could help contextualize the study within larger agricultural issues. • Conclusion Statement: A concluding remark that emphasizes the practical applications or potential impact of the research findings on local farming practices would enhance the abstract's relevance and appeal to practitioners in the field. 	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript demonstrates scientific robustness and technical soundness through its rigorous methodology and comprehensive analysis. The use of established statistical techniques, such as multiple regression analysis and the Cobb-Douglas production function, ensures that the findings are grounded in a solid analytical framework, allowing for reliable conclusions about the effects of various production inputs on garlic yield.</p> <p>Furthermore, the manuscript includes thorough classical assumption testing, which is essential for validating the regression model's reliability. Tests for normality, multicollinearity, and heteroscedasticity are systematically conducted, ensuring that the model meets the necessary criteria for accurate interpretation of results. This attention to methodological detail enhances the credibility of the research outcomes.</p> <p>Additionally, the study's focus on practical implications—such as optimizing fertilizer use to improve</p>	

Review Form 3

	efficiency—demonstrates its relevance to real-world agricultural practices. By addressing both theoretical and practical aspects of garlic farming, the manuscript contributes valuable insights that can inform future research and agricultural policies in Indonesia. Overall, these elements collectively affirm the scientific correctness and technical integrity of the manuscript.	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> <p>=</p>	<p>The references in the manuscript appear to be a mix of relevant foundational texts and more recent studies. However, the manuscript could benefit from a more extensive selection of recent references to enhance its credibility and relevance to current agricultural practices and research.</p> <p>Suggestions for Improvement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusion of Recent Studies: The manuscript should include more recent literature from the last five years that discusses advancements in agricultural practices, particularly regarding organic farming and fertilizer optimization. This would provide a contemporary context for the findings. • Citations of Local Research: Incorporating studies specific to garlic farming or similar crops in Indonesia or Southeast Asia would strengthen the manuscript's relevance to local agricultural practices. This could include government reports, agricultural extension publications, or recent theses from local universities. • Diverse Sources: Expanding the variety of references to include journals focused on sustainable agriculture, environmental science, and agronomy could provide broader insights into the implications of the findings. 	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	Yes	
Optional/General comments		

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Manoj Kumar Das
Department, University & Country	Odisha University of Agriculture and Technology, India