

### Review Form 3

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Dental Sciences</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJDS_122894</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Proton beam therapy for Oral cancer and treatment challenges in India</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Review Article</b>

#### **General guidelines for the Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

#### **Important Policies Regarding Peer Review**

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

#### **PART 1: Review Comments**

<b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's Feedback</b> <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>		
<b>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</b>		
<b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</b>		
<b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b>		
<b>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</b>		
<b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</b>		
<b>:</b>		

**Review Form 3**

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p><b>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>		
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<p><b>Strengths of the Review</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The review offers an extensive summary of the physical principles of proton beam therapy, compared with intensity-modulated radiation therapy (IMRT), highlighting the dosimetric advantages of PBT.</li> <li>2. The paper does an excellent job of comparing the outcomes of proton therapy with conventional photon-based radiotherapy methods. It references various studies showing that PBT can lead to reduced toxicity and improved patient-reported outcomes, which is crucial for understanding its potential benefits over IMRT.</li> <li>3. By addressing the availability and affordability of PBT in India, the review brings attention to significant disparities in access to advanced cancer treatments. It provides valuable insights into how socio-economic factors and the distribution of healthcare resources affect the accessibility of PBT in developing countries.</li> <li>4. The paper discusses future improvements in proton therapy, such as advancements in on-board imaging and automated proton plan adaptation, which are essential for enhancing the precision and effectiveness of treatments.</li> </ol> <p><b>Areas for Improvement</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. While the review mentions that PBT is significantly more expensive than conventional radiotherapy, a more detailed cost-benefit analysis would be beneficial. Is there a benefit to cost when considering the decreased toxicity from PBT and use of the medical system after RT?</li> </ol>	

**PART 2:**

	<p><b>Reviewer's comment</b></p>	<p><b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p><b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b></p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<p>Name:</p>	<p><b>Irimi Youssef</b></p>
<p>Department, University &amp; Country</p>	<p><b>SUNY Downstate Health Sciences University, USA</b></p>