

### Review Form 3

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:            | <a href="#">International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</a>                                       |
| Manuscript Number:       | Ms_IJPSS_126951   |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Effect of Solid and Liquid Manures on growth and Yield of Maize (Zea mays L.) in Malwa region of Punjab |
| Type of the Article      | Original Research Article   |

#### **General guidelines for the Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

#### **Important Policies Regarding Peer Review**

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

#### **PART 1: Review Comments**

| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments   | Reviewer's comment  | Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|---|---|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.                        | This is an important manuscript which highlights the use of organic manures in solid and liquid forms for improving the production of maize. Farmers and entrepreneurs will get valuable information from the publication.  |   |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)  | The title is suitable.  |   |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.   | The abstract is up to the mark. I directly made few corrections to the 'Abstract' of the manuscript.  |   |
| Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?  | Yes; I think, the subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate.  |   |
| Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | <p>Although the manuscript outlined the yield improvement of maize by applying organic manures in solid and liquid forms. However, there needs some corrections before publication.</p> <p>In Introduction, few arguments should be set on the adverse impact of inorganic fertilizers. I pointed out the place in the introduction section with comments there. Few references are also to be added to improve the writing and rationale of the study.</p> <p>In Materials and methods, duration of the experiment by year and month should be added. If possible, weather details should be given.</p> <p>In Results and discussion, I made the required corrections by adding new arguments and references.</p> <p>Few more corrections and comments are directly made in the manuscript body for improvement.</p> |   |

**Review Form 3**

|   |   |  |
|---|---|--|
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> <p>=</p> | <p>I think new references should be added. The position of adding those references is commented in the reviewed manuscript body. I strongly suggest to add these references.</p> <p>However, the references that I suggested to be included in different section of the manuscript are-</p> <p>Kayesh, E., Gomasta, J., Bilkish, N., Koly, K. A., &amp; Mallick, S. R. (2023). A Holistic Approach of Organic Farming in Improving the Productivity and Quality of Horticultural Crops. In <i>Organic Fertilizers-New Advances and Applications</i>. IntechOpen. pp. 35.</p> <p>Rahman, A., Salma, U., Gomasta, J., Ali, M. K., Bari, A. K. M. A., Alam, M. N., Rahman, M. M., Promi, R. J., &amp; Kayesh, E. (2023). Degree and frequency of nitrogen amendments influencing the off-season okra production in the semi-arid north-western Bangladesh. <i>Plant Archives</i>, 23(2), 93-103.</p> <p>Gomasta, J., Hassan, J., Sultana, H., &amp; Kayesh, E. (2024). Interactive plant growth regulator and fertilizer application dataset on growth and yield attributes of tomato (<i>Solanum lycopersicum</i> L.). <i>Data in Brief</i>, 111136.</p> <p>Apu, S. C., Biswas, M. S., Bhuiyan, M. A. B., Gomasta, J., Easmin, S., &amp; Kayesh, E. (2022). Effect of Organic Amendments and Arbuscular Mycorrhizal Fungi on Plant Growth, Yield and Quality of Strawberry. <i>Annals of Bangladesh Agriculture</i>, 26(2), 71-82.</p> <p>Sultana, N., Mannan, M. A., Khan, S. A. K. U., Gomasta, J., &amp; Roy, T. (2022). Effect of different manures on growth, yield and profitability of small scale brinjal (egg-plant) cultivation in gunny bag. <i>Asian Journal of Agricultural and Horticultural Research</i>, 9(1), 52-60.</p> |  |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>                         | <p>Language correction is recommended. Although I made some corrections throughout the manuscript.</p>  |  |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p>  |   |  |

**PART 2:**

|   | Reviewer's comment  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> |   |

**Reviewer Details:**

|   |   |
|---|---|
| <p>Name:</p>                                | <p><b>Joydeb Gomasta</b></p>  |
| <p>Department, University &amp; Country</p> | <p><b>Bangabandhu Sheikh Mujibur Rahman Agricultural University, Bangladesh</b></p> |