

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Biochemistry
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRB_126146
Title of the Manuscript:	In vitro evaluation of bio agents and selected botanical extracts against <i>Alternaria alternata</i> causing <i>Alternaria</i> blight of Dahlia
Type of the Article	Research paper

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	Utilization of inorganic chemicals for agriculture has bothered our ecosystem intensively. The scientists are more concerned towards the application of organic and biological control of diseases, as they are eco-friendly. The present study is based on the biological control of diseases caused in dahlia plant which is an important root crop and medicinal plant. Therefore, this research paper can be useful for prospects.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	The abstract section is the summary of the whole research. It should be rational precise and emphasized. Describe the issues first in the abstract that have been addressed in the present research.	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	The author should pay attention on titles and captions of figures.	
Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The biocontrol for disease-causing pathogens is gaining more prominence rather than the use of agrochemicals that harm our ecosystem. The research article is based on the biological management of plant diseases that can be useful in the future. However, it contains errors in the manuscript that should be fixed.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. :	<p>The introduction section contains only a few references and slight descriptions. It should be described in detail including disease descriptions, bio agents, and disease management, etc.</p> <p>The discussion section lacks references. It contains the explanation of the results only. It should comprise the results of previous studies with references for comparison and discussion of the present research outputs. Some references are suggested below,</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Shah, P., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Basheer, N., Sheikh, A. H., Jabeen, N., & Sitara, U. (2020). Screening of <i>Trichoderma viride</i> as a bio control agent against different soil borne infectious and phytopathogenic fungi. <i>Int. J. Biol. Biotech</i>, 17(2), 405-410. 2. Basheer, N., Sheikh, A. H., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Shah, P., Sitara, U., & Jahan, B. (2023). Phytochemical analysis of plant products and their influence against soil borne phytopathogens. <i>Pak. J. Bot</i>, 55(1), 403-409. 3. Sitara, U., Shah, P., Bhutto, M. A., Sahar, N., Ali, Q. M., Anwar, F., & Basheer, N. (2023). Phytochemicals, Antioxidants and Antifungal Activities of Some Medicinal Plants Against Post-Harvested Fungal Phytopathogens. <i>GU Journal of Phytosciences</i>, 3(1), 30-37. 4. Shah, P., Abid, M., Basheer, N., Sitara, U., Yasmeen, K., Shaikh, A.H., Jabeen, N., Abbasi, M.W. & Hanif, A. (2024). A study on inhabitant microorganisms isolated from wastewater irrigated soils of Karachi, Pakistan. <i>Pak. J. Bot</i>, 56(6), 2465-2472. 	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Author should pay attention to spelling mistakes, capital and small letters, titles of graphs, captions etc.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The manuscript (Ms_JEAI_126146) entitled “In vitro evaluation of bio agents and selected botanical extracts against <i>Alternaria alternata</i> causing <i>Alternaria</i> blight of Dahlia” contains the following errors:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The abstract section is the summary of the whole research. It should be rational, precise and emphasized, describing the issues first that have been addressed in the present research. 2. The introduction section contains only a few references and slight descriptions. It should be described in detail including disease descriptions, bio agents, and disease management, etc. 3. The scientific names should be written according to the scientific rules. Complete genus names with species have to be written first and followed by only the capital initial of the genus e.g. <i>T. viride</i>. 4. Reference to poisoned food technique should be mentioned in the materials and method section. 5. The number of replicates for each treatment should be mentioned. 6. Fungicide (Mancozeb) is used to compare treatments in the result section but it isn't mentioned in the materials and method section. 7. Tables contain mistakes in spelling, capital, and small letters. Tables and graphs should have a note at below that describes a full form of abbreviations e.g. DAI 8. Graphs should contain titles for the x- and y-axis for better understanding and presentation. 9. Difficult to read captions in the image. 10. Pay attention to the title of the image, 'Plate'...???? Replace it with 'Figure number'. 11. The title of table 4 should be re-written, “Table 4. The selected treatments [<i>T. viride</i> (T1) and <i>T. harzianum</i> (T2)] were evaluated for their efficacy against <i>Alternaria alternata</i> by measuring mycelium growth and inhibition percentages over different time intervals, as shown in the table below”. Such as, naming the selected treatments directly, avoiding writing “as shown in the table below, etc. 13. Re-draw figure 4., pay attention to spelling, titles, all are disorganized. 14. The discussion section lacks references. It contains the explanation of the results only. It should comprise the results of previous studies with references for comparison and discussion of the present research outputs. Some references are suggested below, <input type="checkbox"/> Shah, P., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Basheer, N., Sheikh, A. H., Jabeen, N., & Sitara, U. (2020). Screening of <i>Trichoderma viride</i> as a bio-control agent against different soil-borne infectious and phytopathogenic fungi. <i>Int. J. Biol. Biotech</i>, 17(2), 405-410. <input type="checkbox"/> Basheer, N., Sheikh, A. H., Abid, M., Abbas, A., Shah, P., Sitara, U., & Jahan, B. (2023). Phyto-chemical analysis of plant-products and their influence against soil-borne phytopathogens. <i>Pak. J. Bot</i>, 55(1), 403-409. <input type="checkbox"/> Sitara, U., Shah, P., Bhutto, M. A., Sahar, N., Ali, Q. M., Anwar, F., & Basheer, N. 	

Review Form 3

	<p>(2023). Phytochemicals, Antioxidants and Antifungal Activities of Some Medicinal Plants Against Post-Harvested Fungal Phytopathogens. GU Journal of Phytosciences, 3(1), 30-37.</p> <p>□ Shah, P., Abid, M., Basheer, N., Sitara, U., Yasmeen, K., Shaikh, A.H., Jabeen, N., Abbasi, M.W. & Hanif, A. (2024). A study on inhabitant microorganisms isolated from wastewater irrigated soils of Karachi, Pakistan. Pak. J. Bot, 56(6), 2465-2472.</p> <p>15. The manuscript should focus on mentioning the benefits of using selected bio agents instead of the fungicide 'Mancozeb'. It has already been marketed owing to its better use and benefits. It should be mentioned for comparison of outputs provided by treatments in the manuscript.</p>	
--	---	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Paras Shah
Department, University & Country	Hainan University, China