

Short Research Article

Role of Yoghurt Cultures and Incubation Time in Enhancing Sensory Qualities and Water Holding Capacity of Greek Yoghurt Spread

ABSTRACT

Aims: The current research study aimed to investigate sensory characteristics and water holding capacity of Greek yoghurt with varying concentration of starter culture, incubation period and temperature.

Study design: The study was experimental and was laboratory based for optimizing base for Greek yoghurt spread.

Place and Duration of Study: The study was conducted at the Department of Dairy Technology, Dairy Science College, Hebbal, Bengaluru, Karnataka, India, Between January 2024 and October 2024.

Methodology: Greek yoghurt was prepared by various levels of starter culture concentration and incubation period with optimization based on sensory analysis using 9- point hedonic scale. Water holding capacity was analyzed using the centrifugation method.

Results: The addition of various levels of yoghurt culture (1, 2, and 3%), the yoghurt was evaluated by sensory characteristics. Based on trial results, 2% yoghurt culture scored higher (8.42, 8.37, 8.44, and 8.49 out of 9.00) in each category for flavour, colour and appearance, body and texture, and overall acceptability. The effect of varying incubation time at constant temperature of 42°C and inoculation with 2% culture concentration was analyzed for at different incubation hours-periods (4, 5, and 6 h). The maximum score for sensory attributes was obtained for an incubation time of 5 hours with a score of 8.46, 8.42, 8.53, and 8.53 for the parameters flavour, colour and appearance, body and texture, and overall acceptability, respectively. Also, the experimental sample at 42°C incubated for 5 hours had a highest water holding capacity of 76.11%.

Conclusion: The study showed that the sensory qualities and water-holding capacity of Greek yoghurt are greatly influenced by the optimal yoghurt starter culture quantity concentration and incubation time, with the most favourable a higher score results obtained with a 2% culture addition and a 5-hour incubation period.

Keywords: Yoghurt, Sensory characteristics, Water Holding Capacity

1. INTRODUCTION

Dairy products are essential to human nutrition, where fermented milk is preferred for its several health benefits such as improved digestibility, support gut health and boost immunity. Fermented foods have been a part of the human diet for millennia, and the application of microbial starters can offer distinct flavour and texture characteristics to these products. In recent years, the global interest has grown regarding the health advantages and functional roles of bioactive compounds such as free amino acids, peptides, and vitamins generated during fermentation [1]. In the current market, yoghurt is among the most widely consumed fermented and functional milk-based beverages.

Comment [A1]: In the strict sense spread is not a proper word here. According to the information presented in the manuscript it is actually an experiment with a Greek style yogurt

Comment [A2]: It is better to define this as quantity not concentration of starter culture

Comment [A3]: The sentence concerning study design is badly constructed and need revision

Comment [A4]: Use the same approach for citing references according to the Journal recommendations

Comment [A5]: Which market do you refer to and why the statement is restricted only to beverages?

The word "yoghurt" has been suggested to have derived from the Turkish word "yoğurmak," which signifies to curdle, coagulate, or thicken. Yoghurt is the result of ~~beneficial bacterial cultures, lactic acid fermentation~~ **lactic acid fermentation** by *Streptococcus thermophilus* and *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* subsp. *bulgaricus* strains ~~convert lactose into lactic acid~~. Lactose content in raw milk is 4.6% and is a primary carbohydrate in milk which is the main reason for lactose intolerance in people. However, yoghurt ferments lactose due to the action of lactic acid bacteria, reducing the lactose content of milk by 20-30%, thus rendering it more palatable for those individuals who are lactose intolerant. Hence it is a highly nutritious food, offering a substantial source of dairy proteins, calcium, magnesium, vitamin B₁₂, essential fatty acids, and other important compounds [2]. Several studies have demonstrated that yoghurt offers various health benefits, including antimicrobial and antioxidant properties. It is effective in combating gastrointestinal disorders, possesses anti-inflammatory qualities, and may help manage high blood pressure. Additionally, yoghurt supports the immune system, lowers the risk of osteoporosis, and contributes to the management of cardiovascular diseases and diabetes [3].

Greek yoghurt or lebneh is defined as a semi-solid product derived from regular yoghurt by draining away part of its water and water-soluble components, mainly lactose and salt. Traditional methods utilize cloth bags for whey drainage, industrial production often employs mechanical separators, membrane filtration techniques, or specific product formulations. Greek yoghurt is recognized as a concentrated fermented milk product by the Codex Alimentarius [4], requiring a minimum protein content of 5.6 g per 100 g. The straining process removes the liquid component of the milk, referred to as whey or lactoserum, which significantly lowers the lactose content in Greek yoghurt. This strained yoghurt is a high-protein dairy product with low lactose levels [5].

2. MATERIAL AND METHODS

2.1 Materials

For preparation of Greek yoghurt spread, fresh cow milk (4.0% fat and 8.8% SNF) was procured from the Students Experimental Dairy Plant of Dairy Science College, Hebbal, Bengaluru. A good quality the freeze-dried yoghurt culture was procured from Delvo DSL pvt. Ltd., Netherlands. The cultures were in the form of freeze-dried powder and stored at -40°C until they were used. These cultures were first cultivated in MRS broth medium and incubated at 37°C for 24 hours. The resulting pellets were then reconstituted in a 10% skimmed milk suspension and incubated at 37-38°C for 18 hours which are future used in various concentration to prepare yoghurt.

2.2 Methods

Yoghurt was prepared by heating milk to 90°C for 5 minutes and then cooled to 42°C, after which the prepared yoghurt culture was added in varying concentrations of 1, 2, and 3% based on the milk volume. The inoculated milk was incubated at 42°C and then further incubated for 4, 5, and 6 hours.

2.3 Sensory Evaluation

A panel of trained judges evaluated the sensory attributes of the study samples, including colour and appearance, body and texture, flavour, and overall acceptability. Each sample was labeled with a code, and the panelists were instructed to score the sample using a 9-

Comment [A6]: The introduction should contain information about the major factors which affect yogurt production, resulting in different quality characteristics. The last paragraph of the introduction should explain the justification of doing the study, its aim and expected contributions.

Comment [A7]: It has been said that the experiment was done between January and October. This is a quite long period for a constant raw milk composition. There is no data about these characteristics of each batch or raw milk. How many experiments have been done and how many replicates were analyzed? There is no data about acidity of raw milk which is important characteristic. Density and protein content are also missing.

Comment [A8]: What species contains this starter culture? Provide more information

Comment [A9]: Specify the milk quantity which was used for each experiment

Comment [A10]: In table 3 are specified three temperatures for yogurt incubation, specify the experimental design clearly

point hedonic scale. Following this, a hedonic test was conducted to assess the yoghurt preferences.

Comment [A11]: How was analyzed the data from panelist scoring?

2.4 Water Holding Capacity

The water holding capacity was measured by following Krisnaningsih *et al.* (2019) [6].

$$\text{WHC} (\%) = \frac{(W_2 - W_1) \times 100}{W_2}$$

Where,

W_1 = Weight of whey after centrifugation,
 W_2 = Initial weight of yoghurt.

2.5 Statistical analysis

The data was analyzed using R software (version 4.1.2) for statistical computing. Response variables were collected from three replications of the trials, and ANOVA tables were generated for data analysis. When the F value was significant, the critical difference ($P=0.05$) was calculated to determine significant differences, which were indicated in the table using superscripts.

Comment [A12]: Which package of R have you used? Your data implied multifactorial design and analysis but it is not presented

$$\text{Critical difference (CD)} = \frac{\sqrt{2 \times \text{MSS}(E)} \times t_{\alpha}}{r}$$

Where,

MSS (E) = Mean Sum of squares of the error
 r = number of replications
 t_{α} = table t value of the α level of significance

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

3.1 Effect of Yoghurt Culture on the Sensory Characteristics of Yoghurt

The current study revealed significant differences in the flavour profile of Greek yoghurt samples based on varying levels of yoghurt culture. The 2% yoghurt culture sample achieved the significantly highest flavour score of 8.42, indicating the most favorable flavour profile, while the lowest score of 7.33 was found in the 3% culture sample. This finding aligns with Ramakrishnan *et al.* (2024), who reported the increasing amount culture addition leads to higher acidity which contributes to a higher sour taste [7].

Comment [A13]: The higher quantity of starter culture could resulted in higher acidity and sour taste but it does not affect the flavour of the product. If it is the case in the current study an explanation is mandatory

For colour and appearance, the 2% culture addition produced the highest score (8.37), significantly higher than the 3% addition (8.11), but not significantly different from the control (8.27) or 1% addition (8.04). This contrasts with Anjum *et al.* (2007), who reported non-significant differences in colour and appearance across varying culture concentrations, suggesting that formulation and processing variations may influence visual attributes, but does not lead contribute to significant differences in the colour and appearance of the final product [8].

The control sample with 2% yoghurt culture had a mean sensory score of 8.25 for body and texture. In comparison, the experimental samples with 1, 2, and 3% yoghurt culture had mean scores of 7.53, 8.44, and 7.79, respectively. The highest score of 8.44 was observed in the 2% yoghurt culture sample, indicating superior body and texture characteristics at this concentration. Statistical analysis showed a significant relationship between culture

concentration and product texture, with higher concentrations resulting in a thicker yoghurt. Anjum *et al.* (2007) found that yoghurt prepared with 2.00% and 2.50% sub-cultured inoculum recorded the highest texture scores [8]. The ability of proteins to retain water and fat in yoghurt structure is a key factor affecting syneresis, which compromises body and texture. According to Arab *et al.* (2022), syneresis, an important quality indicator, tends to increase with higher culture concentrations and extended storage time, impacting consumer satisfaction [9].

The analysis of overall acceptability followed a similar trend, with the 2% culture addition achieving the highest score (8.49), significantly higher than both the 3% (7.51) and 1% (7.97) additions, although no significant difference was observed between the 2% addition and the control group (8.30). This is consistent with Ramakrishnan *et al.* (2024), who reported that a 0.2% culture level of freeze-dried culture yielded the highest overall acceptability score (8.60), reinforcing the idea that optimizing culture concentration is crucial for enhancing both sensory and overall acceptability in yoghurt products [7].

The effect of varying quantity of yoghurt culture percentages on the sensory characteristics of yoghurt, based on a 9-point hedonic scale, is presented in Table 1.

3.2 Effect of Incubation Period on Sensory Attributes of Yoghurt

The statistical analysis of the flavour attribute under varying incubation temperatures shows significant differences. The highest flavour score of 8.46 was observed in the yoghurt incubated for 5 hours, which was not significantly different from the control (8.35), both scoring higher than the samples incubated for 4 hours (7.44) and 6 hours (7.30). This is consistent with Eze *et al.* (2021) found that yoghurt incubated for 5 hours achieved the highest sensory scores across several attributes, including colour (7.35), flavour (6.8), texture (6.9), and overall acceptability (7.35). These scores were notably higher compared to yoghurt incubated for shorter periods of 3 and 4 hours. Similarly, the colour and appearance of yoghurt incubated for 5 hours (8.42) and the control (8.38) showed no significant differences, maintaining superior scores, while shorter (4 hours) and longer (6 hours) incubation periods yielded significantly lower scores (7.64 and 7.67, respectively), indicating that extreme incubation conditions adversely affect the visual appeal [10].

The body and texture of the samples followed the same trend, with the control and 5-hour incubated yoghurt receiving the highest scores (8.50 and 8.53, respectively), whereas the 4-hour (7.51) and 6-hour (7.50) samples were rated lower, suggesting that both insufficient and excessive incubation periods negatively impact texture. These results mirrored the study by Santoso *et al.* (2021) who investigated and reported the impact of varying culture concentrations (2, 3, 4, and 5%) and different incubation periods (6, 8, and 10 hours) on yoghurt's sensory characteristics. The study revealed that yoghurt produced under these conditions exhibited a soft texture, distinctive yoghurt aroma, very sour taste, and a white colour. The sourness resulted from bacterial fermentation of lactose into lactic acid, which also contributed to the thick texture due to the coagulation of milk proteins. As the pH of the yoghurt approached 4.6, the solubility of casein decreased, leading to hydrophobic interactions between casein micelles. This phenomenon played a crucial role in defining the yoghurt's physical properties, such as texture, viscosity, water-binding capacity, and syneresis [11,6].

Finally, the overall acceptability of the samples mirrored the trends in other sensory attributes, with the control and 5-hour incubated yoghurt achieving the highest scores (8.45 and 8.53, respectively), while 4-hour (7.43) and 6-hour (7.38) incubation periods resulted in lower acceptability. These findings align with Aman *et al.* (2021), who reported higher

acceptability scores for yoghurt incubated for 8 hours compared to 6 and 10 hours, highlighting the importance of optimizing incubation time to achieve desirable sensory properties [12].

The results focus on the significance of the incubation period on sensory attributes of yoghurt which is presented in Table 2, illustrating the effect of varying incubation time (4, 5, and 6 hours) on the sensory characteristics of the yoghurt spread, at a constant incubation temperature of 42°C.

3.3 Effect of Incubation Temperature and Time on Water Holding Capacity (WHC) of Greek Yoghurt

The impact of incubation temperature and time on the WHC of yoghurt is documented in Table 3. Higher incubation temperatures, such as 42°C, have been shown to enhance WHC significantly. Swelam *et al.* (2019) reported similar findings, with the optimal WHC observed at 42°C when applied for different incubation temperatures of (40°C, 42°C and 45°C). This is consistent with the data presented here, where yoghurt incubated at 42°C exhibited the highest WHC across all time points, with a peak value of 76.11% after 5 hours of incubation [13]. The prolonged incubation times further improved WHC, particularly at 42°C, aligning with Krisnaningsih *et al.* (2019), who indicated that extended incubation times enhance WHC and viscosity while reducing moisture content [6].

At 37°C, WHC was generally lower compared to the control and 42°C groups, with a maximum of 65.16% after 5 hours. This temperature also showed a decrease in WHC with prolonged incubation beyond 5 hours, indicating that optimal results at this temperature might be time-sensitive. Conversely, the lowest WHC was observed at 55°C across all incubation times, with values significantly lower than those at 42°C or even 37°C. The results further indicate that incubation time plays a crucial role in determining WHC. Gyawali and Ibrahim (2018) reported that the incorporation of whey protein concentrate (WPC) increases WHC by approximately 21% compared to control samples. The role of incubation conditions in WHC enhancement aligns with their findings [14].

Table 1. Effect of yoghurt culture on the sensory characteristics of yoghurt.

Culture Addition (%)	Flavour	Colour and appearance	Body and Texture	Overall Acceptability
Control	8.24 ^{ab}	8.27 ^a	8.25 ^{ab}	8.30 ^{ab}
1	8.12 ^b	8.04 ^a	7.53 ^b	7.97 ^b
2	8.42 ^a	8.37 ^a	8.44 ^a	8.49 ^a
3	7.33 ^c	8.11 ^c	7.79 ^c	7.51 ^b
CD(P= .05)	0.20	0.27	0.35	0.28

Note: The control sample is yoghurt with 2% culture addition, CD= Critical difference, all the results are average of three trials (n=3), and same superscript indicates non-significance while different, indicate statistically significant difference at P= .05.

Comment [A14]: If the sample inoculated with 2% culture is included in the experimental variants how you should justify its presence among experimental variants?

Table 2. Effect of Incubation Period on Sensory Attributes of Yoghurt.

Incubation Period (Hours)	Flavour	Colour and appearance	Body and Texture	Overall Acceptability
---------------------------	---------	-----------------------	------------------	-----------------------

Comment [A15]: What could be the possible explanation for the effect of the incubation period on the colour and appearance of the product? Please, provide relevant references to support your findings

Control	8.35 ^a 8.35 ^b	8.38 ^a 8.38 ^b	8.50 ^a 8.50 ^b	8.45 ^a 8.45 ^b
4	7.44 ^a	7.64 ^a	7.51 ^a	7.43 ^a
5	8.46 ^b	8.42 ^b	8.53 ^b	8.53 ^b
6	7.30	7.67	7.50	7.38
CD(P=.05)	0.27	0.20	0.17	0.16

Note: Temperature constant at 42°C, CD= Critical difference, all the results are average of three trials (n=3) and same superscript indicates non-significance while different, indicate statistically significant difference at $P= .05$.

Table 3. Effect of Incubation Temperature and Time on Water Holding Capacity (WHC) Of Greek Yoghurt

Incubation Temperature (°C)	4 hours	5 hours	6 hours	CD (p=0.05)
Control	72.16 ^{aAB}	75.68 ^{cA}	64.27 ^{aB}	8.43
37	61.31 ^{bAB}	65.16 ^{bA}	50.86 ^{bb}	10.30
42	71.69 ^{aAB}	76.11 ^{aA}	61.89 ^{ab}	9.92
55	46.80 ^{cAB}	43.30 ^{cA}	40.67 ^{cb}	4.93
CD (P=.05)	3.61	4.81	2.11	

Note: Culture is constant (2%), CD= Critical difference, all the results are average of three trials (n=3) and same superscript indicates non-significance while different, indicate statistically significant difference at $P=.05$. A, B = Indicate significant differences between different incubation times within the same treatment

Comment [A16]: At what temperature was incubated the control sample and what defines it as a control one?

4. CONCLUSION

The study's conclusions highlight the crucial effects of temperature, incubation time, and yoghurt culture concentration on the sensory qualities and water holding capacity (WHC) of Greek yoghurt. The optimal concentration of 2% yoghurt culture yielded the most favourable flavour, body and texture, and overall acceptability scores, confirming the importance of balancing culture levels to enhance product quality. Additionally, a 5-hour incubation period at 42°C demonstrated superior sensory attributes, aligning with previous research that highlights the detrimental effects of both insufficient and excessive incubation times on yoghurt quality. The results also indicate that at 42°C for 5 hours showed improved water holding capacity of yoghurt. Overall, this research provides valuable insights into optimizing production parameters for Greek yoghurt, suggesting that careful consideration of culture concentration and incubation conditions can lead to enhanced product quality and increased consumer appeal.

REFERENCES

- Lang, F., Wen, J., Wu, Z., Pan, D., & Wang, L. (2022). Evaluation of probiotic yoghurt by the mixed culture with *Lactobacillus plantarum* A3. *Food Science and Human Wellness*, 11(2), 323-331. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fshw.2021.11.006>

2. Predescu, C., ȘTEFAN, G., & Papuc, C. (2022). Impact of the addition of different forest berry fruits on functional, physicochemical and sensory properties of yogurt shelf life. *Scientific Works. Series C, Veterinary Medicine*, 68(1), 43-49.
3. Hoxha, R., Evstatieva, Y., & Nikolova, D. (2023). Physicochemical, rheological, and sensory characteristics of yogurt fermented by lactic acid bacteria with probiotic potential and bioprotective properties. *Foods*, 12(13), 2552. <https://doi.org/10.3390/foods12132552>
4. Codex Alimentarius. Codex Standard for Fermented Milks. Codex stan. 2003;243-2013.
5. Pappa, E. C., Kondyli, E., Pappas, A. C., Kyriakaki, P., Zoidis, E., Papalamprou, L., ... & Georgiou, C. A. (2024). Physicochemical Characteristics of Commercially Available Greek Yoghurts. *Dairy*, 5(3), 436-450. <https://doi.org/10.3390/dairy5030034>
6. Krisnaningsih, A. T., Radiati, L. E., Evanuarini, H., & Rosyidi, D. (2019). The Effect of Incubation Time to The Physicochemical and Microbial Properties of Yoghurt with Local Taro (*Colocasia Esculenta* (L.) Schott) Starch as Stabilizer. *Current Research in Nutrition & Food Science*, 7(2), 547-554. <http://dx.doi.org/10.12944/CRNFSJ.7.2.23>
7. Ramakrishnan, V., Arunkumar, H., Venkatesh, M., Manjunatha, H., & Pushpa, B. P. (2024). Effect of Concentration of Starter Culture and Incubation Time on Sensory Attributes of RTE Functional Greek Yoghurt. *Journal of Scientific Research and Reports*, 30(7), 340-345. <https://doi.org/10.9734/jsrr/2024/v30i72149>
8. Anjum, R. R., Zahoor, T., & Akhtar, S. (2007). Comparative study of yoghurt prepared by using local isolated and commercial imported starter culture. *J. Res. Sci*, 18, 35-41.
9. Arab, M., Yousefi, M., Khanniri, E., Azari, M., Ghasemzadeh-Mohammadi, V., & Mollakhaili-Meybodi, N. (2023). A comprehensive review on yogurt syneresis: Effect of processing conditions and added additives. *Journal of Food Science and Technology*, 60(6), 1656-1665. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13197-022-05403-6>
10. Eze, C. M., Aremu, K. O., Alamu, E. O., & Okonkwo, T. M. (2021). Impact of type and level of stabilizers and fermentation period on the nutritional, microbiological, and sensory properties of short-set Yoghurt. *Food science & nutrition*, 9(10), 5477-5492. <https://doi.org/10.1002/fsn3.2507>
11. Santoso, A., Retnosari, R., Pramudita, V., Wijaya, A. R., Anisa, T. N., & Sanjaya, E. H. (2021, May). The effect of starter concentration and incubation time on yogurt characteristics. In *AIP Conference Proceedings* (Vol. 2353, No. 1). AIP Publishing. <https://doi.org/10.1063/5.0052694>
12. Aman, Santos R, Rini P, Vina W, Anugrah A & Tiara S. (2021). The effect of starter concentration and incubation time on yoghurt characteristics. *AIP Conference Proceedings*, 2353 (1),1-6.
13. Swelam, S., & Rashed, M. A. (2019). Properties of non-fat yoghurt as influenced by the incubation temperature of exopolysaccharide producing culture. *Journal of Food and Dairy Sciences*, 10(12), 447-452. [10.21608/jfds.2019.71333](https://doi.org/10.21608/jfds.2019.71333)

14. Gyawali, R., & Ibrahim, S. A. (2018). Addition of pectin and whey protein concentrate minimises the generation of acid whey in Greek-style yogurt. *Journal of dairy research*, 85(2), 238-242. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0022029918000109>

UNDER PEER REVIEW