

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Journal of Economics, Management and Trade |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_JEMT_127028 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Economic growth and income inequality in sub-Saharan Africa: does environmental policy matter? |
| Type of the Article | Original Research Article |

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|---|
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>The paper explores the complex relationship between economic growth, income inequality, and environmental policy in sub-Saharan Africa using a panel smooth transition regression (PSTR) model. By analyzing data from 1999 to 2021, the study assesses how environmental policy affects the connection between growth and inequality, positing an inverted-U relationship when stringent environmental standards are upheld in wealthier countries. The authors conclude that environmental policy impacts inequality differently across economic contexts, with strict policies reducing inequality in wealthier countries but potentially exacerbating it in poorer ones.</p> | |
| <p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> | <p>Yes</p> | |
| <p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p> | <p>The abstract mentions the use of a "panel smooth transition regression model (PSTR) of Gonzalès (2005)" but does not specify why this model was chosen. Adding a brief rationale (e.g., its suitability for analyzing non-linear relationships) would help readers understand the methodological choice.</p> | |
| <p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> | <p>yes</p> | |
| <p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p> | <p>The manuscript appears scientifically robust and technically sound due to its well-defined methodology and appropriate model choice. The use of the panel smooth transition regression (PSTR) model is suitable for analyzing the non-linear relationship between economic growth, income inequality, and environmental policy, providing nuanced insights that linear models may not capture. Additionally, the authors conducted preliminary tests for non-linearity and threshold effects, enhancing the credibility of their findings and ensuring the model fits the data structure accurately. By incorporating a diverse set of control variables and data sources, including environmental performance indicators, income inequality indices, and economic indicators, the study establishes a comprehensive analytical framework that strengthens the validity of its conclusions.</p> | |
| <p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> | <p>Sufficient but suggested recent studies on the Environmental Kuznets Curve (EKC) and income inequality could enrich the discussion and provide context for the PSTR model's applicability.</p> | |
| <p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>yes</p> | |
| <p>Optional/General comments</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The statistical results, especially in tables, are dense and may benefit from further clarification. 2. Providing brief interpretations directly within each table or supplementing with footnotes could aid readers less familiar with the PSTR model. The explanation of the transition mechanism within the PSTR model could be elaborated. A more thorough discussion on why abrupt transitions are observed in environmental policy effects across economic regimes would add depth to the interpretation. | |

Review Form 3

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i> |
|---|--|---|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | <i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i> | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|--|
| Name: | Gundupagi Manjunath |
| Department, University & Country | Bheemi Reddy Institute of Management Science, India |