

Review Form 3

| | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Journal Name: | Journal of Experimental Agriculture International |
| Manuscript Number: | Ms_JEAI_126937 |
| Title of the Manuscript: | Seasonal Influence on the Effect of Indole Butyric Acid (IBA) on Survival and Branch Development in Culm Cuttings of <i>Bambusa balcooa</i> Roxb. and <i>Dendrocalamus stocksii</i> Munro. |
| Type of the Article | manuscript |

General guidelines for the Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guidelines for the Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

<https://r1.reviewerhub.org/general-editorial-policy/>

Important Policies Regarding Peer Review

Peer review Comments Approval Policy: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/peer-review-comments-approval-policy/>

Benefits for Reviewers: <https://r1.reviewerhub.org/benefits-for-reviewers>

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

| Compulsory REVISION comments | Reviewer's comment | Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|--|---|
| Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | I dislike many things in the current investigation. Author did not improve new methods or results that different from literature even that he used it (from 1989 to 2023) Author gave a result only on survival and number of branches. (He did not introduce results on branches measurements, roots, leaves or any other parameters of growth Author made a combination between IBA treatments and species in rainy and summer seasons while he had to do a combination between IBA treatments and seasons for every species. | |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) | Seasonal Influence on the Effect of Indole Butyric Acid (IBA) on Survival and Number of Branches Development in Culm Cuttings of <i>Bambusa balcooa</i> Roxb. and <i>Dendrocalamus stocksii</i> Munro | |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here. | Addition of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Place of the experiment (country, city, coordination, ...) • Years of the investigation • Concentrations of IBA at the correct part in abstract Correction: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Comparison between treatments in the same species | |
| Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? | Yes but with weakness in key words and discussion | |
| Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | Author did not improve new methods or results that different from literature even that he used it (from 1989 to 2023) Author gave a result only on survival and number of branches. (He did not introduce results on branches measurements, roots, leaves or any other parameters of growth | |
| Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form. | Author have to delete a lot of old references and add other references to discuss his result in good way | |
| Minor REVISION comments | Good language | |
| Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications? | | |
| Optional/General comments | The manuscript in the current form with the same data cannot enhance ideas or knowledge in the scientific field. Author have to improve and correct his manuscript and give other data for growth, roots,.... . He has to correct his combination to be between seasons and treatments of IBA for each species. | |

PART 2:

| | Reviewer's comment | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|--|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | (If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details) | |

Reviewer Details:

| | |
|----------------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Name: | Magdi Ismaiel Abdelaziz Saif |
| Department, University & Country | Suez Canal University, Egypt |