

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	South Asian Journal of Parasitology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_SAJP_121390
Title of the Manuscript:	Orbital Soft Tissue Granuloma Caused by Dirofilarial couple: A rare clinical case report
Type of the Article	CASE REPORT

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	<p>This manuscript discusses a rare and intriguing case of orbital soft tissue granuloma caused by <i>Dirofilaria repens</i>, with the coexistence of both male and female worms within the same lesion. The manuscript's importance lies in its potential to challenge the traditional understanding that humans are merely accidental hosts and dead-ends for <i>Dirofilaria</i> species. By presenting clinical, radiological, and histopathological evidence, the authors suggest the possibility of humans serving as definitive hosts, a concept that has been largely unreported and could have significant implications for parasitology. The manuscript is scientifically robust, with well-documented case details and thorough analysis, making it a valuable contribution to the field.</p> <p>This study is particularly relevant because it sheds light on the rare coexistence of male and female <i>Dirofilaria</i> in a human host, which could prompt further research into the life cycle of this parasite in humans and potentially lead to revised treatment protocols or public health strategies. However, to enhance the manuscript's impact, the authors could further elaborate on the broader implications of this finding and how it might influence future research or clinical practices in parasitology.</p>	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	<p>The title accurately reflects the content of the manuscript by clearly identifying the condition being reported and the rarity of the case. It is concise yet informative, which is appropriate for attracting the attention of readers who are interested in rare parasitic infections and their manifestations in human hosts.</p> <p>An alternative title that could be considered is: "Rare Case of Orbital Granuloma Caused by Coexisting Male and Female <i>Dirofilaria repens</i> Worms: Implications for Human Host Status." This alternative emphasizes the co-existence of male and female worms and hints at the potential implications for understanding human hosts' role in the parasite's life cycle.</p>	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is well-structured and offers a clear summary of the case, including the clinical presentation, diagnostic methods, findings, and implications. It provides the essential details necessary for readers to quickly grasp the significance of the case. However, the abstract could be enhanced by briefly mentioning the possible implications of this finding on the understanding of human hosts as potential definitive hosts for <i>Dirofilaria repens</i>. This would add context to the uniqueness of the case and its contribution to the scientific community.</p> <p>Additionally, the authors could consider specifying the geographical location where the case was reported, as this might be relevant to the epidemiology of <i>Dirofilaria</i> infections.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>The manuscript is well-organized, with distinct subsections that logically guide the reader through the case report. The Introduction provides a background on dirofilariasis, setting the stage for the case presentation. The Presentation of Case section is detailed and follows a logical flow from the clinical examination to diagnostic findings and treatment. The Discussion appropriately places the case in context with existing literature and emphasizes its novel aspects. Finally, the Conclusion succinctly summarizes the key takeaways. The structure adheres to the standard format for case reports, making it easy for readers to follow and comprehend.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The manuscript is scientifically robust because it presents a well-documented case with clear clinical, radiological, and histopathological evidence to support the diagnosis. The authors have carefully described the case, ensuring that all relevant details are included, from the patient's initial presentation to the final diagnosis and treatment. The histopathological findings are particularly well-documented, with clear descriptions and accompanying images that provide strong evidence for the identification of <i>Dirofilaria repens</i>. The discussion is scientifically sound, referencing relevant literature and comparing the findings with previously reported cases. The hypothesis that humans might serve as definitive hosts for <i>Dirofilaria repens</i> is intriguing and well-argued, though it remains a hypothesis that would benefit from further research. Overall, the manuscript adheres to high scientific standards and contributes valuable knowledge to the field of parasitology.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p> <p>:</p>	<p>The references cited in the manuscript are appropriate and cover relevant studies related to <i>Dirofilaria</i> infections, including both historical and more recent reports. The references provide a good foundation for understanding the context of the case and the significance of the findings. However, given the evolving nature of parasitology and zoonotic diseases, the authors might consider including more recent studies or reviews that discuss the role of humans as hosts for <i>Dirofilaria</i> species. This would help to further substantiate the discussion and place the case within a broader scientific context.</p>	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language and English quality of the manuscript are generally suitable for scholarly communication. The text is clear, concise, and free of major grammatical errors. However, there are a few areas where the language could be refined to improve readability and precision. For example, some sentences could be restructured for clarity, and there are minor grammatical errors that should be corrected. I recommend a careful proofreading to address these minor issues and ensure that the manuscript meets the high standards expected in scientific publishing.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>The manuscript is a valuable contribution to the field of parasitology, particularly in understanding the rare manifestations of <i>Dirofilaria</i> infections in humans. The case report is unique and well-presented, with clear evidence supporting the diagnosis. The authors have done a commendable job in documenting the case and discussing its implications. I would encourage the authors to consider expanding on the broader implications of their findings, particularly in terms of how this case might influence future research or clinical practices.</p>	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Arman Abdous
Department, University & Country	Islamic Azad University, Iran