

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Agriculture and Ecology Research International
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JAERI_121524
Title of the Manuscript:	Economics of Tomato (<i>Solanum lycopersicum.L</i>) Production Under Plastic Tunnel Technology in Peri-urban Areas of Kathmandu, Nepal
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the importance of this manuscript for the scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The paper is very relevant in that it analyses the costs and expenses involved in tomatoes grown using plastic tunnel technology. I like the article but a lot of grammatical and other mistakes should be corrected before final consideration for publication. I have tried to correct most of the mistakes.</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>The title is appropriate.</p>	
<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest the addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>The abstract is comprehensive enough.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>Some of them will need modifications. I have suggested some of these modifications.</p>	
<p>Please write a few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do you think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? A minimum of 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>The article is scientifically correct but not sound enough and should be corrected before publication. For instance, there was a mention of a benefit-cost ratio of 2.1, but this was not compared with previous farming situations using the same technology and crop.</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestions of additional references, please mention them in the review form.</p>	<p>The references are all right although some of them including No. 4 does not seem to be complete.</p>	

Review Form 3

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is the language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language is very poor and should be corrected before acceptance and publication. I have tried in my review to correct some of the mistakes.</p>	
<p><u>Optional/General</u> comments</p>	<p>General Comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. The paper is very relevant in that it analyses the costs and expenses involved in tomatoes grown using plastic tunnel technology.2. The paper is poorly written with a series of grammatical and other problems. The paper should have been sent first for someone to correct these problems before being to the Editor for review. I have corrected some of the mistakes and the comments are shown in Section B below.3. The authors mentioned plastic tunnel technology. They should include a section to explain this technology including the details as well as its advantages and disadvantages.4. The authors indicated the various costs involved. They should also include the United State dollar equivalents as this will assist the international readers of this article.5. The last sentence of this paper stated that “the study identifies many opportunities for enhancing tomato production that could benefit farmers in Chandragiri.” Which opportunities were obtained or described? These should be made clear by the authors.6. The authors did not compare their results with existing literature in Nepal and elsewhere. For instance, they obtained a cost-benefit ratio of 2.1. How does this compare with tomato farming in other areas with the same or different technologies <p style="text-align: center;">Section B</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none">1. Page 1: Abstract. Results, Line 3: were benefitted with benefit. Just state enjoyed a cost benefit ratio of 2.1.2. Page 1. Introduction. Line 3: Instead of primary employment source, state primary source of employment.3. Introduction, Line 3. What is the meaning of Terai? Please make it clearer.4. Page 1. Last line. Should read: which are widely cultivated for commercial purposes.5. Page 2, Paragraph 2, line 1: what do you mean by 2078/79? Please correct or put the equivalent world dating system in brackets.6. Page 2, Paragraph 2, line 1: tonnes not tons. Also line 4.7. Line 5 of same Paragraph: should read grow 1-3 meters in height.8. Line 5/6: should read: The crop is often grown outside as a seasonal crop.9. Line 6: should read: Often grown outside as a seasonal crop.10. Line 7: fruits not fruit.	

Review Form 3

- 11. Line 9: produce not produces. (two places).
- 12. Third to the last line of same paragraph should read: The pigment that makes the tomato red called lycopene [11], prevents many types of cancer.
- 13. Page 2, paragraph 3: Explain: RARS in Lumle and HRD in Khumaltar.
- 14. Line 6: write masl in full.
- 15. Line 7: should read improved soil fertility maintenance.
- 16. Line 8: should read enhanced water conservation.
- 17. Page 3: Materials and Methods, line 2/3. Complete the sentence: Considering the fact that plastic tunnel farming of tomatoes is widespread among farmers in this region in recent years.
- 18. Second to last line on page 2: please explain: pre-tested semi-structured questionnaire.
- 19. Page 3, last line under Materials and Methods: should be data were.....
- 20. Page 3, under Marketing Channel, first line, should read: Based on the information obtained from producers, traders and consumers marketing channel were drawn that show the linkages between input suppliers, producers, local collectors/traders, wholesalers, retailers, and consumers.
- 21. Line 1, under 2.3. forced not Forced.
- 22. Line 2, what do you mean by: The index was prepared on the basis of responded frequencies? Write this better.
- 23. Page 3, second to the last line: should read scaled value
- 24. Last line, problems not problem
- 25. Page 4, line 4: f_i not F_i
- 26. Page 4, Section 2.4, line 1. what do you mean by: Different economic variables were analyzed to the profitability of tomato farming
- 27. Line 2 should read: variable and fixed costs.....
- 28. Lines 2/3 should read: The variable costs include those for seeds, fertilizers, manure, and other costs like chemical, preparation, human resource, bagging and transportation.
- 29. Page 5: Table 1 should be better arranged. I am seeing:

Year of experience	Frequency	Sources to get agriculture inputs	Frequency
within the table itself.			

- 30. The key to Figure 2 should read: wholesalers, retailers, consumers and middlemen.

Under Figure 2 should read: It was found that majority of the producers sell their products to middlemen (51.2%), followed by wholesalers (22.6%), retailers (15%) and consumers (11%). More than half of the farmers of this study area sell their produce to the wholesale market via middlemen to ensure that their produce are marketed whereas the rest of the farmers closer to the market sell their produce directly to the retailers and very few of the farmers sell the produce to consumers directly from their farms.

Review Form 3

	<p>31. Page 5, 3rd to the last line: tomato not Tomato.</p> <p>32. Page 5, last line: hold not have.</p> <p>33. Page 6, Figure 3: remove one Yes/No as key.</p> <p>34. Page 6: Section 3.4 Reasons not Reason</p> <p>35. Section 3.4 should read: The major reason for adopting plastic tunnel was protection from extreme weather conditions as observed from the responses of 42 farmers whereas 19 farmers grew their tomatoes in plastic tunnel for the protection from biotic factors like insect pest and diseases.</p> <p>Under Section 3.6, second sentence should read: The involvement of the middle persons increased the price to be paid by the consumers and reduced the farm gate prices. Majority of the farmers i.e. 48% respondents in the study area were found to adopt Channel IV where producers sold their produce to middlemen who in turn sold tomatoes to the wholesalers and then to retailers and finally to consumers. 23% of respondents sold their produce to the wholesalers who in turn sold tomatoes to the retailers and then to consumers. 17% of respondents sold their produce to retailers and then to consumers. 12% of respondents in the study area were found adopting Channel I where producers directly sold their produce to the consumers.</p> <p>36. Page 6: Heading of 3.7 should be: Sources of Information of Market Prices of Tomatoes.</p> <p>37. Page 7, Section 3.8, line 3: late not Late</p> <p>38. Page 7: Heading of 3.9 should be Major Insects and Pests. Correct the Heading of Table 2. It should be Major Reasons for Adopting the Tunnel Technology and Major Insetx and Pests.</p> <p>39. Page 8: Title of 3.10.2 should include problems not problem</p> <p>40. Page 8, line 4, are not is</p> <p>41. Pages 9/10: Table 5 Write these in full: FYM, DAP, and MOP. Can this table b shortened on broken into many Tables.</p> <p>42. Page 10, under Section 3.11.3, occurs not occurring.</p>	
--	--	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Edwin Ekwue
Department, University & Country	University of the West Indies, Trinidad and Tobago