

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_120799
Title of the Manuscript:	Assessment of Soil Nutrients Status Under Different Aged Walnut Orchards in Jajarkot, Nepal
Type of the Article	Research article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Please write few sentences regarding the importance this manuscript for scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The research article entitled Assessment of Soil Nutrients Status Under Different Aged Walnut Orchards in Jajarkot, Nepal contains some useful information on the status of soil pH, organic matter, nitrogen, phosphorus and potassium nutrients. These information are very important for optimum management of soil fertility in walnut orchard especially for fixing the doses of liming for correcting acidity as well as rates of nitrogen, phosphorus and potassium fertilizers to meet nutrient needs of walnut plants. Organic matter status is helpful to determine of the rate of organic manure.	
Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)	Yes, the title of the research appears to be suitable.	
Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.	Abstract is comprehensive, but it should be arranged in one paragraph deleting side subtitles	
Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?	Yes, the subsections and structure of the research article seem to appropriate.	
Please write few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.	The research article has scientific merit as it contains status on soil pH, organic matter as well nutrient status of the primary nutrients such as nitrogen, phosphorus and potassium of the walnut orchards. The quality of the article would have been much improved if it could contain nutritional status of some secondary and micronutrients like magnesium, zinc and boron.	
Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.	The references cited are too many. They should be reduced to 30 or less mentioning only recent and up to date ones.	
<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?	Language seems to be okay	
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	However, there are few typing and grammatical mistakes as indicated by red markings. These need to be corrected before the article is finally accepted for publication.	

Review Form 3

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mohammad Shahidul Islam
Department, University & Country	Bangladesh Agricultural Research Institute, Bangladesh