

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Journal of Advances in Biology &amp; Biotechnology</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_JABB_119923</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Wilt (<i>Fusarium oxysporum</i> f. sp. <i>ricini</i>) disease of castor: A review</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Review Article</b>

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>.- The morphological, cultural and pathogenic characteristics of castor isolates and their management practices. This statement provides no information or is poorly written.</p> <p>2.- The abstract gives very little idea of the content that the review will provide.</p> <p>3.- Why is the word management in the keywords?</p> <p>4.- What is IDM? INTRODUCTION 5.- Asian country (India) is the main producer of castor within the world (Sudha et al., 2016) Use a current reference</p> <p>6.- The most important castor manufacturing states in this country are Gujarat, Rajasthan and Andhra Pradesh. Together, these States account for quite 90 per cent of total domestic production with Gujarat being the most important physical seed manufacturing State Use reference</p> <p>7.- Monocropping followed due to its high economic return resulted in wilt endemic which seriously hampered castor cultivation in the state (Dange et al., 1997) Improve translation</p> <p>8.- The wilt disease is endemic to all castor growing states of India causing a significant yield loss of around 80-100 per cent per year (Anjani et al., 2004). Chattopadhyay (2000) reported yield reduction of 1.86 kg/ha with each per cent incidence of wilt disease. Update information and references</p> <p>9.- Disease occurrence is higher in irrigated conditions due to the longer crop duration in Gujarat than in the southern regions. Wilt was found to be rooted in dark soil The soil in Gujarat is dark?</p> <p>10.- The incidence of wilt varies with hybrid and crop rotation. What is this variation?</p> <p>11.- Rephrase, as there some short sentences that do not have much connection between the previous sentence and the next. Example: Disease incidence in Russia reached up to 80 per cent (Moshkin, 1986).</p> <p>12.- Wilt incidence in Andhra Pradesh ranged from 5 to 60 per cent, resulting in a 1.86 kg/ha loss for each percent incidence of wilt disease (Chattopadhyay, 2000). More than 95 per cent of Gujarat's castor growing regions are occupied by castor hybrids that are tolerant to wilt disease, and productivity has increased dramatically</p>	

**Review Form 1.7**

	<p>from 350 to 1970 kg/ha (Damodaram and Hegde, 2010). Andreeva (1979) reported the occurrence of wilt in the USSR. Most of the information presented is very old data, please include more recent information.</p> <p><b>Symptoms</b></p> <p>13.- I suggest making a figure that represents this category</p> <p>14.- This implies that nematodes play an important role in the breakdown of wilt resistance in castor hybrid GCH-4, hence enhancing the severity of castor wilt (Pathak, 2003). Nematodes play vital role in the breakdown of wilt resistance in castor hybrid and thus, increasing the severity of the castor wilts (Jangir et al., 2018). Information is repeated sequentially</p> <p>15.- Reniform nematode damage has been estimated to cause yield losses of up to Rs. 18 crores per year (13.93% yield loss) in castor (Jain et al., 2007). Update information and references</p>	
--	---	--

**Review Form 1.7**

<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. <b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></p>	<p>Disease cycle 16.- Macroconidia are hyaline, few in number, having 2- 6 septa, straight, spindle as well as sickle-shaped and measure 17.5-70 x 3.50-5.25 µm (Desai et al., 2003).</p> <p>Information is repeated (causal organism)</p> <p>Epidemiology 17.- There is a lack of information on the factors that influence the rate of increase of the disease in plant populations over time.</p> <p>Resistant variety: 18.- Nagesh et al. (2020) recorded the three resistant accessions (RG-43, RG-111, RG-109, RG-297, RG-1608, RG-1624, RG-2758, RG-2787, RG-2800, RG-2818, RG-2822, RG-3016 and RG-3105) would be of great value as donors of resistance. Why are three resistant accesses mentioned when there are more than three between parentheses?</p> <p>19.- I suggest to summarize the information (resistant variety) of the in a table</p> <p>Intercropping 20.- Do you have a hypothesis as to why different crop combinations produce different incidence percentages?</p> <p>Physical methods 21.- Raoof and Rao (1997) studied on effect of soil solarization on castor wilt in a wilt sick plot by covering the low density transparent polyethylene sheet (200 gauge) and recorded that maximum reduction in wilt incidence (50%), <i>F. oxysporum</i> f. sp. <i>ricini</i> population (35%), nematode population (78%) and highest castor seed yield in plots solarized for six weeks in summer. The wording of this paragraph is not clear to me.</p> <p>Biocontrol control 22.- I suggest to changing the title to Biocontrol or Biological control</p> <p>23.- Do you have any hypothesis as to why there are different percentages of seed germination and inhibition with the different strains?</p> <p>Chemical control 24.- Could you search a larger number of papers to get ranges of inhibition percentages with the chemical compounds mentioned?</p> <p>25.- The words <i>in vitro</i> are not in <i>cursiva</i>.</p> <p>Compatibility of seed coat biopolymer with biocontrol agent <i>T. harzianum</i></p> <p>26.- Improve writing and put a period at the end of a sentence.</p> <p>Conclusiones 27.- Mention the F</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Karla Lizbeth Macias Sanchez</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Guanajuato Campus National Polytechnic Institute, México</b>