

**Review Form 3**

|                          |                                                                                                                                                          |
|--------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Journal Name:            | <b>Asian Journal of Case Reports in Medicine and Health</b>                                                                                              |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_AJCRMH_120623</b>                                                                                                                                  |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>A rare case of proliferative glomerulonephritis with monoclonal IgG deposits in an adolescent female; mimicking immune complex glomerulonephritis</b> |
| Type of the Article      | <b>Case report</b>                                                                                                                                       |

**Review Form 3**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

| <b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments                                                                                                                                                                                        | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               | <b>Author's Feedback</b> (Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Please write few sentences regarding the importance this manuscript for scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.                           | This type of case report is crucial to broaden the knowledge of nephrologists and renal pathologists worldwide on different modes of presentations of rare disease conditions. The investigations were detailed. The electron microscopy and immunoflourescent pictures are rich, but arrow should be used to indicate the pathologies being described. |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)                                                                                                                                         | The title of the article is suitable<br><br>SEE ATTACHMENT                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.                                                                    | The abstract is comprehensive, but authors can state the specific type of membranoproliferative glomerulonephritis this case illustration depicted, type I, II, III, or atypical                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?                                                                                                                                                               | The subsections of the manuscript are appropriate                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Please write few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part. | The article is very robust because of the detailed investigations including serology, electron microscopy, and immunoflourescence studies, including antibody typing. The interpretations of the findings were appropriate, which shows rich knowledge base. Differential diagnosis were meticulously excluded with adequate evidence.                  |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.                                                                                              | The references are sufficient and recent enough considering the rarity of the case illustration.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| Minor REVISION comments<br><br>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?                                                                                                           | The language is suitable                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                     |
| <b>Optional/General</b> comments                                                                                                                                                                                           | This is an educating article, I commend the meticulousness and knowledge base of the authors                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                     |

**PART 2:**

|                                              | <b>Reviewer's comment</b>                                                    | <b>Author's comment</b> (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|----------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Are there ethical issues in this manuscript? | <u>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</u> |                                                                                                                                                                                      |

**Review Form 3**

**Reviewer Details:**

|                                  |                                                                             |
|----------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Name:                            | <b>Mojeed Olaitan Rafiu</b>                                                 |
| Department, University & Country | <b>Irrua Specialist Teaching Hospital, Ambrose Alli University, Nigeria</b> |