

Review Form 3

Journal Name:	Journal of Energy Research and Reviews
Manuscript Number:	Ms_JENRR_120505
Title of the Manuscript:	Forest clearance and fragmentation for charcoal production: the case Bimbia Bonadikombo forest South West Region, Cameroon
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

Review Form 3

PART 1: Review Comments

Compulsory REVISION comments	Reviewer's comment	Author's Feedback <i>(Please correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
	<p>1. In Introduction, 2nd page, line 3-6, author while explaining about his study site, he generalizes the concept, it is suggested to insert "people of Cameron" instead of "to humanity".</p> <p>2. In section 2.2, line 6 is confusing statement, needs to revise?</p> <p>3. In section 3.1, last sentence "monies" should be replaced by "money"</p> <p>4. In section 3.3, line 1, in my view no need of assigning any figure numbering to pit klin method, since it is method, if author demands he may suggest to use pit klin method (Figure 2(a-f))</p> <p>5. In section 3.5, heading should be "Effect of charcoal production on forest ecosystem," instead of "Effect caused by charcoal production on forest ecosystem."</p> <p>6. In section 3.6 & 3.7, from Figure 5 and 6, charcoal demand should be less in the months of January and December, since charcoal production is high and easily available, but conversely charcoal demand is less in April (Figure 6), how could author can defend this observation?</p> <p>7. In section 3.8, correlation studies reveal the correlation between charcoal production and demand for all seasons and especially dry season exhibits no correlation, but author adds positive association, how could author can explain this odd?</p> <p>8. Section 4.0, line 7, "they talked on" suggested to replace by "they stressed on"</p> <p>9. In conclusion, line 3, the sentence "lack of job and the availability of tree species", the availability of tree species is not mentioned in text and appears only in conclusion part?</p>	
<p>Please write few sentences regarding the importance this manuscript for scientific community. Why do you like (or dislike) this manuscript? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>In Africa, at least 70% of households primarily rely on fuel based on charcoal. In rural areas, it serves as the main energy source for residential purposes, small-scale traditional industries, and commercial businesses. In both rural and urban settings, charcoal has been utilized as a heat source for cooking, baking, roasting meat, fish, and ironing clothes. It is also an inexpensive fuel source to buy and utilize. Additionally, it can be used to make money through local sales and exports to both rural and urban markets. The effects of charcoal production on the Bimbia Bonadikombo forest and its surroundings were investigated in this study. The research suggests that even if the manufacturing of charcoal has a negative impact on the environment, it remains a significant energy source and a backup when other energy sources are unavailable or insufficient. Thus, this energy source can be improved to be more environmentally sustainable for usage in the Bimbia Bonadikombo forest region as well as in the vicinity of urban and rural locations (controlled burning, permanent charcoal pit, defective trees used, etc.).</p>	
<p>Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p>	<p>In my view title is not representing the whole work of article rather than generalised more smoothly, need to change</p>	

Review Form 3

<p>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? Do you suggest addition (or deletion) of some points in this section? Please write your suggestions here.</p>	<p>No, the abstract is lengthy, its needs to be comprehensive by removing unnecessary explanations. In addition, line 19-20 the sentence should be present “were reported as the main effects caused by the charcoal production”, instead of “were the main effects reported for charcoal production”.</p> <p>Author is suggested to add page numbering to indicate/identify the text with ease.</p>	
<p>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p>	<p>Yes, subsections and structure of the manuscript is appropriate</p>	
<p>Please write few sentences regarding the scientific correctness of this manuscript. Why do think that this manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound? Minimum 3-4 sentences may be required for this part.</p>	<p>In Africa, at least 70% of households primarily rely on fuel based on charcoal. In rural areas, it serves as the main energy source for residential purposes, small-scale traditional industries, and commercial businesses. In both rural and urban settings, charcoal has been utilized as a heat source for cooking, baking, roasting meat, fish, and ironing clothes. It is also an inexpensive fuel source to buy and utilize. Additionally, it can be used to make money through local sales and exports to both rural and urban markets. The effects of charcoal production on the Bimbia Bonadikombo forest and its surroundings were investigated in this study. The research suggests that even if the manufacturing of charcoal has a negative impact on the environment, it remains a significant energy source and a backup when other energy sources are unavailable or insufficient. Thus, this energy source can be improved to be more environmentally sustainable for usage in the Bimbia Bonadikombo forest region as well as in the vicinity of urban and rural locations (controlled burning, permanent charcoal pit, defective trees used, etc.).</p>	
<p>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p>	<p>Yes, the references are sufficient for this article and recent are also found</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Yes, it is up to mark</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>10. In study site 2.1, line 2-3, author used sentence “The Bimbia-Bonadikombo community forest (BBCF) was created on May 18, 2002”. It sounds forest was created recently in the year of 2002, is it right?</p> <p>11. Section 3.1, line 2-3, generally in rural areas females are heavily uses charcoal in their cooking activity, but author finds charcoal production is dominated by males, clarify it?</p> <p>12. In section 3.4, line1, in which way weak institutions are source of high demand of charcoal?</p>	

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer’s comment</p>	<p>Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Review Form 3

Reviewer Details:

Name:	U. Jaya Prakash Raju
Department, University & Country	College of Science, Bahirdar University, Ethiopia