

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Case Reports in Surgery
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJCRS_116362
Title of the Manuscript:	BONE-FORMING ANGIOMYOLIPOMA OF THE KIDNEY
Type of the Article	Case report

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>Classically, calcification within a fatty renal tumor is considered pejorative and leads to the rejection of the diagnosis of angiomyolipoma. In this article the existence of a benign AML with ossification is a rare entity hence the interest of the manuscript</p> <p>Benign calcified angiomyolipoma: a case report</p> <p>Yes</p> <p>Yes</p> <p>Yes</p> <p>Most of the references used are not recent</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>-Title of the article is not attractive (does not prove the interest of the subject)</p> <p>- The author have used sometimes data without specifying the references</p> <p>- The author uses some abbreviations without explaining them first to the reader (exemple lab for laboratory, SMA for alpha smooth muscle actin ...)</p> <p>-Figure 2 is not correctly attached</p> <p>-Its not the first report of ossification in renal angiomyolipoma as mentioned in conclusion. There are other articles treating the same case. (For example Angiomyolipome calcifié, angiomyolipome quand meme. Kulski ¹, M. Cymbalista ², P. DuretZ. Journal de radiologie. Vol 86, Issue 10, 2005)</p>	

[Review Form 1.7](#)

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Kaoutar Flayou
Department, University & Country	Ouarzazate Hospital, Morocco