

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Plant &amp; Soil Science</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJPSS_116092</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Evaluating the impact of rice establishment methods, zinc application and rice residue retention on growth and development in rice</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li><b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li><b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li><b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li><b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li><b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Importance:</b> The authors investigated the effect of different establishment methods, zinc application, and residue retention on the rice plant growth metrics. They used a split-plot design with three replications in the Rice and Wheat Research Centre-CSK HPKV, Malan, Kangra, Himachal Pradesh, India. The study was conducted during the Fall of 2021 and 2022.</li> <li><b>Title:</b> Long and preferred to be modified into <b>"Growth and Development of Rice Concerning Establishment and Residue Retention and Zinc Application"</b>.</li> <li><b>Abstract:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide an opening statement of one or two short sentences as a background on the problem.</li> <li>MUST provide the P-value for the significant results.</li> <li>MUST be specific in your expressions and unify to the international English terms.</li> <li>Many modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Structure of the manuscript:</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Keywords:</b> Modify and reduce in number as suggested.</li> <li><b>Introduction:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Improperly arranged in two paragraphs. The introduction has to be re-arranged into three paragraphs i.e. 1. Introduction 2. Significance of the study, and 3. Aim of the study.</li> <li>Must be specific to the international research language (American English).</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>The aim:</b> Clear to a certain extent. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text</li> <li><b>Materials and methods:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Provide the institutional ethical approval for the study.</li> <li>Must be specific to the international research language (American English).</li> <li>Do not use the sign @ for the doses and instead use "at a rate of" which is a more scientific expression.</li> <li>Provide a reference for the software and the statistical model used for the statistical analysis.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Results:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>List only the abbreviations of the treatments instead of listing their full appearance.</li> <li>Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Discussion:</b> Clear to a certain extent with moderate comparisons and speculation.</li> <li><b>Conclusion:</b> Clear to a certain extent. Some modifications were suggested to enhance the readability and understanding of the text.</li> <li><b>Tables:</b> Notice the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Add a ligand for the tables as suggested.</li> <li>Explain why the tables list the Rabi//Spring season, while the study was carried out in the fall season.</li> </ul> </li> </ul> </li> <li><b>Scientific Soundness:</b> The manuscript highlighted that the transplanting in conjunction with soil application of ZnSO<sub>4</sub> (12.5 kg ha<sup>-1</sup>) and foliar application of ZnSO<sub>4</sub> (0.5%) at flowering and early milk stages resulted in significantly higher and better rice plant growth and hence is encouraged.</li> <li><b>References:</b> Sufficient as 55.5% (10 out of 18) of the listed references were published in the past five years.</li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><b>Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</b></li> </ol>	<p><b>General view:</b> The manuscript was expressed in moderate English and grammar. A certain degree of copyediting, proofreading, proper display of the abstract and the introduction, declaring some explanations in the materials and methods section, and a proper display of the tables have to be carried out before resubmission to achieve publishing value.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>	<p>The authors have to be specific to the international writing language and use the known terms in English and not in Hindi such as "Fall" instead of "Kharif" and "Spring" instead of "Rabi".</p>	

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Essam Samir Soliman</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Suez Canal University, Egypt</b>