

**Review Form 1.7**

|                          |   |
|--------------------------|---|
| Journal Name:            | <b>Journal of Experimental Agriculture International</b>  |
| Manuscript Number:       | <b>Ms_JEAI_115782</b>   |
| Title of the Manuscript: | <b>Quantify the impacts of economic and environmental gains and losses related to the groundwater transfer from agriculture to urban areas in Tiruppur district</b> |
| Type of the Article      |   |

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

|  | Reviewer's comment  | Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|--|---|---|
| <p><b>Compulsory REVISION comments</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b><br/>(Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b><br/>(If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></li> </ol> <p><b><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></b></p> | <p><b>General Comments</b></p> <p>From my point of view, it is a very interesting topic and simultaneously it seems that to the best of my knowledge is an important study focuses on ground water is the primary supply of water for domestic, industrial, and agricultural purposes. Significant social and economic repercussions could result from a declining water table and the depletion of groundwater resources that are economically accessible. Domestic water supply is given top emphasis in both National and State water programs. Recently, there has been a rise in water transfers to satisfy the needs of the industrial and residential sectors. With the success of the state water supply, many are heralding groundwater transfer as the quickest, least expensive and most environmentally benign solution to large cities water supply and reliability problem. In order to satisfy urban domestic and industrial water demand, the majority of water transfers concentrate on buying water from farmers who are prepared to sell it to them. Water transfers can generate three different types of impacts namely, direct, indirect and induced impacts. The present study was undertaken mainly to study the impacts of economic and environmental gains and losses related to the groundwater transfer in Tiruppur district . The impacts from groundwater transfer to water selling regions and effluent receiving areas are an important consideration in evaluating the impact of groundwater transfer activity. Without doubts groundwater transfer from agriculture to industrial uses would benefit individual sellers, buyers and the Nation as whole. However, groundwater transfers would cause some economic impediment to local rural communities especially non-sellers. The adverse direct economic impact in groundwater selling or water transferring areas to total revenue in agriculture was Rs. 54.32 lakhs per every crop season. Scarcity of water resulted in shifting of irrigated agriculture to rainfed agriculture and labour intensive to labour less intensive crops. The total employment lost per hectare of land was 198.33 man-days. Secondly, another adverse indirect economic and environmental impact of water transfer is discharge of large quantum of industrial effluent water. There is indirect economic and environmental impact on effluent receiving areas due to highly polluted industrial effluent discharge into open lands and river/streams could cause a Rs. 22,296 net personal income loss for every hectare of land. At larger perspective impacts of groundwater transfer could be considered insignificant.</p> <p><b>The paper consists of the sections:</b> <i>Introduction, Methodology, Result and Discussion, Conclusion.</i></p> <p><b>However, I find some recommendations:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The abstract must contains the main purpose of the paper, the research method used in the research and the main contributions.</li> <li>2. It would be very useful to add in the "Introduction" section the purpose, objectives and hypothesis of the research.</li> <li>3. The Literature review section cannot be missing from the paper and must be presented separately from the Introduction section..</li> <li>4. The research is well based on science and the results are in agreement with the theoretical part. From my point of view, the paper is original and the topic addressed brings added value to the specialized literature regarding agriculture development. The paper is well written and easy to read.</li> <li>5. The research is well based on science and the results are in agreement with the theoretical part. The model applied to the analyzed data is correctly used in the analysis undertaken, it is a strength point of this paper.</li> <li>6. Also, we consider that the literature is not enough and we recommend the authors to refer</li> </ol> |   |

Review Form 1.7

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
|  | <p>to other recent works indexed in Web of Science, Scopus, Emerald and Cambrige. We suggest that the authors cite papers indexed in Web of Science Journals, such as:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>1. Batrancea L., Batrancea I., Moscviciov A. (2009), The Roots of the World Financial Crisis, <i>Annals of Faculty of Economics</i>, 3(1):57-62.</li><li>2. Moscviciov, A., Bătrâncea, I., Bătrâncea, M., Bătrâncea, L.M. (2010) Financial Ratio Analysis Used In the It Enterprises, <i>Annals of the University of Oradea: Economic Science</i>, 19(2):600-603.</li><li>3. Batrancea LM, Nichita A, Balci MA, Akgüller Ö (2023) Empirical investigation on how wellbeing-related infrastructure shapes economic growth: Evidence from the European Union regions. <i>PLoS ONE</i> 18(4): e0283277. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0283277">https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0283277</a>, ISSN:1932-6203.</li><li>4. Batrancea, L., Batrancea, I., Moscviciov, A. (2009) The analysis of the entity's liquidity—A means of evaluating cash flow, <i>Journal of International Finance and Economics</i>, 9(1):92-98.</li><li>5. Batrancea, L., Rathnaswamy, M.K. &amp; Batrancea, I. A Panel Data Analysis on Determinants of Economic Growth in Seven Non-BCBS Countries. <i>J Knowl Econ</i> (2021). <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s13132-021-00785-y">https://doi.org/10.1007/s13132-021-00785-y</a></li><li>6. Batrancea LM.(2021) An Econometric Approach on Performance, Assets, and Liabilities in a Sample of Banks from Europe, Israel, United States of America, and Canada. <i>Mathematics</i>. 2021; 9(24):3178. <a href="https://doi.org/10.3390/math9243178/">https://doi.org/10.3390/math9243178/</a>.</li></ol> <p>5. We also consider that an important cause that influences GDP is fiscal compliance and therefore even if this variable was not taken into account, the authors should refer to the works published on this topic, namely:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"><li>7. Batrancea L.M., Nichita R.A., Batrancea I. (2012), Tax Non-Compliance Behavior in the Light of Tax Law Complexity and the Relationship between Authorities and Taxpayers, <i>Annals of the Alexandru Ioan Cuza University-Economics</i>, 59(1), pp.97–106.</li><li>8. Nichita R.A., Batrancea L.M., (2012), The Implications of Tax Morale on Tax Compliance Behavior, <i>Annals of University of Oradea: Economic Science</i>, 21(1)1, 739–744.</li><li>9. Batrancea, L.M., Kudła, J., Błaszczak, B., Kopyt, K. (2022) Differences in tax evasion attitudes between students and entrepreneurs under the slippery slope framework, <i>Journal of Economic Behavior &amp; Organization</i>, Volume 200, Pages 464-482, ISSN 0167-2681, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2022.06.017">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jebo.2022.06.017</a></li><li>10. Kogler, C., Olsen, J., Kirchler, E., Batrancea, L.M., &amp; Nichita, A. (2022) Perceptions of trust and power are associated with tax compliance: A cross-cultural study, <i>Economic and Political Studies</i>, DOI: 10.1080/20954816.2022.2130501, Print ISSN: 2095-4816 Online ISSN: 2470-4024.</li><li>11. Batrancea, L. M., Nichita, A., De Agostini, R., Batista Narcizo, F., Forte, D., Mamede, S. D. P. N., Roux- Cesar, A. M., Nedev, B., Vitek, L., Pántya, J., Salamzadeh, A., Nduka, E. K., Kudła, J., Kopyt, M., Pacheco, L., Maldonado, I., Isaga, N., Benk, S., &amp; Budak, T. (2022). A self-employed taxpayer experimental study on trust, power, and tax compliance in eleven</li></ol> |  |
|--|--|--|

**Review Form 1.7**

|   |  |  |
|---|--|--|
|   | <p>countries.</p> <p>12. Batrancea, L.M., Kudła,J., Błaszczak,B., Kopyt, M.(2023) A dataset on declared tax evasion attitudes of students and entrepreneurs from Poland under the slippery slope framework, <i>Data in Brief</i>,109183, ISSN 2352-3409, <a href="https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2023.109183">https://doi.org/10.1016/j.dib.2023.109183</a>.</p> <p>7. Another important cause that must be mentioned in the paper is the link between GDP, fiscal compliance and shadow economy, as the independent variables fiscal compliance and shadow economy strongly influence GDP. In this sense, I recommend the authors to quote the paper:</p> <p>13. Batrancea L., Nichita A., Batrancea I., Gaban L. (2018). „The Strenght of the Relationship Between Shadow Economy and Corruption: Evidence from a Worldwide Country-Sample”. <i>Social Indicators Research</i>, 138(3), 1119-1143; DOI: 10.1007/s11205-017-1696-z</p> <p>We recommend the authors to number the paragraphs: 1. Introduction; 2. Literature Review; 3. Methods and Results, Discussions and Conclusions.<br/>In conclusion, the article should be thoroughly rebuilt (changes in structure recommended above). It should also be enhanced with a review of the literature adequate to the subject and a broader interpretation and commentary of the research results.</p> |  |
| <p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p> | <p>Yes</p>   |  |
| <p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>   | <p>The Manuscript needs careful English proofreading because there are some shortcomings. For instance, the article “the” is sometimes missing in front of nouns, the message in some paragraphs is not clear enough.</p>  |  |

**PART 2:**

|   | Reviewer’s comment  | Author’s comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here) |
|---|---|---|
| <p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p> | <p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p> |   |

**Reviewer Details:**

|   |  |
|---|--|
| <p>Name:</p>                                | <p><b>Batrancea Larissa Margareta</b></p>      |
| <p>Department, University &amp; Country</p> | <p><b>Babes-Bolyai University, Romania</b></p> |