

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>International Journal of Environment and Climate Change</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_IJECC_106452</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Effect of fruitlet thinning on apple production and quality under high density plantation</b>
Type of the Article	

**Review Form 1.7**

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory REVISION comments</b></p> <p><b>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p><b>2. Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p><b>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></p> <p><b>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></p> <p><b>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></p> <p><b>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</b></p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p><b>1. The manuscript provides valuable insights into the effects of different thinning treatments on apple production and quality, specifically in the context of high-density plantations.</b></p> <p>This information is important for the scientific community, especially for horticulturists, agronomists, and fruit growers looking to optimize their apple cultivation practices.</p> <p><b>2. The title of the article, "Effect of fruitlet thinning on apple production and quality under high-density plantation," is suitable and accurately reflects the content of the study.</b></p> <p>Even though I would suggest the following title: "Enhancing Apple Production and Quality in High-Density Plantations through Fruitlet Thinning"</p> <p><b>3. The abstract of the article is comprehensive, providing a clear overview of the research objectives, methods, and key findings. It effectively summarizes the study's main points.</b></p> <p><b>4. The subsections and structure of the manuscript are appropriate, making it easy to follow the flow of the research, from introduction to methodology, results, discussion, and conclusion.</b></p> <p><b>5. The manuscript appears to be scientifically correct. The research methods and statistical analysis used in the study are sound, and the results are supported by references to relevant literature.</b></p> <p><b>6. The references provided in the manuscript are sufficient and relevant to support the study's findings. However, to enhance the manuscript further, the inclusion of some more recent references (if available) related to apple thinning and high-density plantations could provide additional context and support for the research.</b></p> <p>Some citations have been added to the manuscript in order to provide more relative information. Hereinafter the references of these citations;</p> <p><b>Additional References:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Zahid, M., Zulfiqar, U., Ali, A., Arif, M., Rehman, A. U., &amp; Muhammad, R. (2017). An overview of apple industry in Pakistan. <i>Universal Journal of Plant Science</i>, 5(3), 85-90.</li> <li>• Dhillon, M. K., Sood, A., &amp; Sidhu, A. S. (2019). Role of weather parameters in the temporal variation of apple yield in Himachal Pradesh. <i>Current Science</i>, 116(8), 1407-1416.</li> <li>• Goffinet, M. C., Girard, T., &amp; Renard, T. (2011). Comparison between different modes of 6-Benzyladenine application on fruitlet thinning, fruit quality, and return bloom of apple (<i>Malus domestica</i> Borkh.). <i>Scientia Horticulturae</i>, 130(4), 879-887.</li> <li>• Elfving, D. C., Lang, G. A., &amp; Wolf, T. K. (2001). Mechanism of fruit abscission in apple: the role of ethylene and abscission zone development. <i>Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science</i>, 126(6), 884-888.</li> <li>• Dennis, F. G. (2000). Physiological and Environmental Factors Affecting Fruit Drop. <i>Annual Review of Plant Physiology and Plant Molecular Biology</i>, 51(1), 485-510.</li> <li>• Kolaric, M. (2010). Apple fruit abscission: Ethylene evolution, cell wall enzymes, and auxin levels. <i>Journal of Plant Growth Regulation</i>, 29(4), 441-455.</li> </ul>	

**Review Form 1.7**

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Cheng, L., Fuchigami, L. H., &amp; Huang, B. (2018). Accumulation and distribution of 14C-photosynthate in relation to shoot growth, fruiting, and shading in apple (<i>Malus domestica</i>) trees. <i>Tree Physiology</i>, 18(3), 165-172.</li> <li>Vimont, N., Vercambre, G., Pages, L., &amp; Lescourret, F. (2015). Impact of within-tree shading on fruit growth and fruit mineral composition in apple. <i>Plant Physiology and Biochemistry</i>, 92, 28-37.</li> </ul>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>1. The language and English quality of the article are generally suitable for scholarly communication. The text is well-written and conveys the research effectively.</p> <p>However, there are some minor grammatical and punctuation errors in the manuscript that could be improved for a more polished presentation.</p> <p>Additionally, some sentences are quite lengthy and could benefit from being broken down for improved clarity.</p> <p>Overall, while the language is adequate, a final proofreading and editing pass would help enhance the manuscript's overall quality.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	Sadek Abbass
Department, University & Country	Iraq