

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_106132
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of humic acid functionalized bentonite on heavy metal uptake by Spinach (<i>Spinacia oleracea</i> cv. All Green) grown on metal contaminated soil
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>1. The title of the research doesn't matter, but there should be novelty constructed from testing the effect of bentonite humic acid as outlined in the background. Then what is the problem with the construction of the topic will become the aim of this research, and is written clearly in the background.</p> <p>2. The title is Ok</p> <p>3. In the abstract there should be a short scientific statement regarding the superiority of humic acid fungsionalized bentonite which was constructed in this research</p> <p>4. Subsections and structure are appropriate</p> <p>5. There is still a lack of scientific explanation of the mechanism of action of humic acid and the reduction of heavy metal absorption by plants</p> <p>6. Yes</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	Yes	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Need to confirm the construction of the research topic that gave birth to the problem to be answered in the background. - Need scientific explanation of the mechanism of action of humic acid and the reduction of heavy metal absorption by plants. 	

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Wayan Budiarsa Suyasa
Department, University & Country	Udayana University, Indonesia