

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Research
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJFAR_104600
Title of the Manuscript:	Economic Mapping of Small Fisherman In Dadap Village, Juntinyuat District, Indramayu Regency
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>1. Yes. This research was arranged the status of the village from the local people interview. This research was conducted to describe the economic condition of the community based on data to support the development of small-scale fishermen in Dadap Village. The manuscript is important for scientific community.</p> <p>2. I am not familiar with the word "economic mapping". I researched with google scholar "economic mapping", but there were not many relevant papers. Is it a reference from "23"? I assume that the word "economic mapping" was used in "23". Unfortunately, I could only read the summary of "23". Rather than the word economic mapping, I suggest example that "Status of Small Fisherman in Dadap Village, Juntinyuat District, Indramayu Regency. -From a socioeconomic respective -. Please give it some consideration.</p> <p>3. I suggest more arrange and describe for example " 3.4.1 Supporting Factors for Small Fishermen Development". e.g., Social and economic conditions in an area can be influenced by cultural conditions, religion, behaviour, and community priority goals. ~~~~~.</p> <p>4. 3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION 3.1 General Condition of Research Area 【Geographically, Dadap Village is located~~~ areas as follows:】 and Figure 2 → I suggest move from RESULTS AND DISCUSSION to Methods.</p> <p>5. Yes.</p> <p>6. I am afraid that some parts reference or authors idea(opinion) is rough to understand. Please see Optional/General comments.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Yes.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>1) 2. METHODOLOGY 2.1 Research Methods 【The type of data required includes primary data and secondary data. The sampling technique to fulfill primary and secondary data is using purposive sampling.】 →It goes without saying that I suggest this part is omitted.</p> <p>2) 2.2 Data Analysis 【 The data analysis used ~~~ the results of the researcher's observations.】</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	<p>→I suggest this part more arranged and more skipped the process.</p> <p>3) 2.3 Validity Test 【According to Bahri (2020)】 →Is this references or not ?</p> <p>4) 3.1 General Condition of Research Area. 【This location supports Dadap Village to develop existing fishery activities, especially small-scale capture fisheries. 】 →I think this part is not necessary. I suggest omitted because already explained in previous sentence.</p> <p>5) 3.3 Dadap Village Economic Mapping →I already (Compulsory REVISION comments 2) I have my doubts about this words "Economic Mapping" this MS. This parts sentence that 【Economic mapping includes fishing infrastructure and fishing productivity. 】 The sentence a little unexpected. I suggest that sentence move from RESULTS AND DISCUSSION to Introduction (background parts). And please more describe using mor e references for "Economic mapping" in introduction.</p> <p>6) c. Arrest Tool 【Fig 4. Small fishing boat technology (2-4 GT)】 and 【Fig 5. Small fishing boat technology】 →These photo can omitted or I suggest use more good photo and need at least describe e.g. scale, product specifications (a standard) and so on.</p> <p>7) 3.3.2 Capture Productivity a. Trip and Long Fish Catching 【Fig 6. Average fishing trips for small fishermen】 →If the author have data, more better show SD or range (min-Max).</p> <p>8) 7) likewise, 【Table 5. The average cost of equipping small fishermen in Dadap Village】 → I suggest that show the not only average but also SD or range (min-Max).</p> <p>9) 3.3.4 Social Economic Conflict 【The system for selling ~ ~village government staff statements.】 →I suggest this parts more detail describe. Now this phrase is unknown about not familiar example me (others area people). For example, • The system for selling catches in the small fishing environment in Dadap Village begins with an agreement between the boat owner and the customer. → • How system ? How the boat owner and the customer can with an agreement? • How and when "Dadap Village through village government staff statements" ? • Why the rejection of customers from outside Dadap Village who wanted to buy the catch by the original customers ?</p> <p>10) 3.4.1 Supporting Factors for Small Fishermen Development I agree that Table 7. Assessment of efforts that can support the development of small fishermen in Dadap Village, and Table 8. Assessment of the inhibiting factors for the development of small fishermen in Dadap Village.</p> <p>But I suggest more describe to be more specific your idea or references.</p>	
--	--	--

Review Form 1.7

	<p>For example,</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 【The fish catches of small fishermen in Dadap Village will be maximized if they use the latest technology. In line with Yasrizal's statement (2017) that the use of modern technology supports more catches [34].】 <p>→I agree but I think to use the latest technology lead to more cost. You mean need to more government Support (subsidy)?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 【FM8 Improvements to fisheries systems in achieving existing policies】 <p>→I agree but I think How systems and/ or How policies?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 【FP6 Consumptive behavior of small fishermen】 <p>→I agree but I think How behavior? Do you have any concrete ideas?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 【FP9 Prohibition of entry of customers from outside Dadap Village by local customers】 <p>→I agree but I think Why need to Prohibition of entry, Not restrict?</p>			
--	---	--	--	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Yumi Kobayashi
Department, University & Country	Hokkaido University, Japan