

Original Research Article

EFFECT OF SOME PRESERVATIVES ON THE MICROBIAL QUALITY OF COLD-SMOKED CATFISH AT AMBIENT TEMPERATURE

Abstract

Aim: In this study, the shelf stability and microbiological quality of cold-smoked Catfish (*Clarius gariepinus*) at ambient storage were investigated in relation to the preservative effects of potassium sorbate, ginger, garlic, and a combination of ginger and garlic.

Methodology: From the MOUAU Fish Farm, one hundred (100) freshly caught catfish were processed and divided into five lots of twenty each. We created four marinating baths, each containing 0.5% potassium sorbate, 3% ginger, 3% garlic, and a mix of 1.5% ginger and 1.5% garlic. All catfish lots, with the exception of the fifth lot (used as a control), were marinated for two hours and cold-smoked for eight hours. Following storage for four days at room temperature (28 ± 2 °C), analyses were performed on the samples. Analyses were done on the catfish samples' total viable count, total fungal count, and bacterial counts (*Escherichia coli*, *Salmonella*, *Staphylococcus sp*, and *Listeria sp*).

Result: The total viable count (TVC) was increased from 8.7×10^5 to 3.43×10^6 CFU/g, 1.13×10^6 to 3.48×10^6 CFU/g, 1.09×10^6 to 3.28×10^6 CFU/g, 9.6×10^5 to 3.45×10^6 CFU/g, and 1.19×10^6 to 3.66×10^6 CFU/g for 3% ginger, 3% garlic, 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic, 0.5% potassium sorbate, and the control at ambient storage respectively. The 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic was the most effective for *E. coli* while 0.5% potassium sorbate was for *Salmonella* at ambient storage. All the treatments were effective against *Listeria monocytogenes* while the total fungal count increased at ambient storage conditions.

Conclusion: The study found that cold smoked catfish treated with 0.5% potassium sorbate, 3% ginger, 3% garlic and a blend of 1.5% ginger and 1.5% garlic can be stored for 4 days at ambient storage provided the storage condition is maintained.

Keywords: Microbial Quality, Ambient Condition, Ginger, Garlic, Potassium Sorbate, Bacterial Count.

1. INTRODUCTION

Fish is desirable for food and business for a number of reasons. It is a major source of animal protein, a significant part of many people's diets, and it provides the essential nutrients for a healthy lifestyle. In comparison to other proteins of animal origin, fish protein now takes precedence and compares favorably with those found in milk, eggs, and meat in terms of amino acid composition [1]. Magawata and Shina [2] reported that "Fish is a very nutrient-dense food that is especially prized for its superior quality protein to that of meat and eggs." Fish is a good source of thiamine, riboflavin, minerals, phosphatides, sterols, enzymes, hormones, hydrocarbons, and pigments. It also contains very high-quality oil and fats [3].

Fish is extremely perishable. Poor or insufficient post-harvest processing and management of fish is one of the biggest challenges facing fish consumption and business in Nigeria, despite how important it is for

Comment [RD1]: Delete full stop on title

Comment [RD2]: Effect of Ginger and Garlic Marinates on growth of Microbial Contaminants in Cold-Smoked Catfish (*Clarius gariepinus*) Stored at Room Condition

NB. Care must taken to avoid the conclusion that this study is

1. An evaluation to determine preservative effect of these natural spices.

2. The study is not also a shelf stability study of the cold-smoked fish. This is because so many parameters that determines the shelf stability of the product were not evaluated,

Comment [RD3]: In this study, the preservative effects of potassium sorbate, ginger, garlic, and combination of ginger-garlic on the microbiological quality and shelf stability of cold-smoked Catfish (*Clarius gariepinus*) were investigated.

Comment [RD4]: Materials and Methods

Comment [RD5]: A total of 100 fresh catfish from Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike (MOUAU) Nigeria Fish Farm. The fish were processed and divided into five lots of twenty each. This was followed marinating in baths containing 0.5% potassium sorbate, 3% ginger, 3% garlic, and a mix of 1.5% ginger and 1.5% garlic each and a control for 2h. Afterwards, the treated fish was cold-smoked for 8 h and then stored at room temperature (28 ± 2 °C). Fish samples were collected at 2 days intervals to determine total viable count, total fungal count, and bacterial counts (*Escherichia coli*, *Salmonella*, *Staphylococcus sp*, and *Listeria sp*).

Comment [RD6]: Finding of this study revealed that potassium sorbate, ginger, garlic, and ginger-garlic blend enhanced the microbiological safety of cold-smoked Catfish (*Clarius gariepinus*). The result showed that although count of some microbial contaminants increased in the cold-smoked fish however, varied ($p < 0.05$) with the treatment during storage. Comparatively, the 1.5% ginger - 1.5% garlic marinate was the most effective and performed considerably higher ($p < 0.05$) than the 0.5% potassium sorbate in the reduction of microbial contaminants. In this study, lowest total viable count was observed in the 3% ginger-treated cold smoked fish (8.7×10^5 cfu/g), while the untreated sample v...

Comment [RD7]: Conclusion: The study found that 3% ginger, 3% garlic, 1.5% ginger - 1.5% garlic mixture inhibits significantly the growth of microbial contaminants relatively with 0.5% potassium sorbate in cold-smoked fish during ambient storage.

Comment [RD8]: several

Comment [RD9]: Fish is desirable for food as a source of animal protein to provides the essential nutrients for a healthy lifestyle. Comparatively, the fish protein takes precedence over those found in milk, eggs, and meat in terms of amino acid composition [1].

healthy living and for the generation of income. Fish is processed into smoked or canned fish, as well as other fish-based products, due to this level of perishability.

Smoking is a traditional method of keeping fish fresh in Nigeria. Salt is used as the primary preservative when smoking in the chambers of traditional kilns made of clay, cement blocks, or drums in fishermen's camps. Technically, the length of smoking determines the moisture content of fish products. The moisture (or water activity) of smoked fish has been found to be a key factor in determining the rate of microbial growth and invariably the shelf life or keeping qualities of the fish [5]. Gram [6] notes that samples of crabmeat and smoked fish have both contained microbes like *Listeria monocytogenes*. Furthermore, according to Da Silva [7], these microbes are common in nature and are capable of growing at both low temperatures and high salt concentrations of up to 10%. Therefore, reducing the fish's water activity to a point where microorganisms can no longer grow has an impact on preservation by drying [8]. Additionally, using salt as a preservative is associated with several health issues. For this reason the use of alternative and natural spices like ginger, garlic are necessary.

Cold smoking is not widespread in Nigeria, in contrast to the country's traditional method of smoking fish. The smoke's temperature in this method doesn't go above 30°C [8]. In contrast to hot-smoked and oven-dried tilapia samples, Oyelese [9] found that cold-smoked samples had the highest moisture content. This is the reason why cold-smoked fish does not last very long because it has not completely dried out. Studies, such as Eyo [8], have compared cold- and hot-smoked fish, finding that the former has higher nutritional value than the latter because it was cooked during the smoking process.

Finding a substitute for salt as a preservative in fish smoking and extending the shelf life of cold-smoked fish have become more and more important. These preservatives, garlic and ginger, have a variety of biologically active compounds with therapeutic properties [10,11]. Therefore, this study evaluates the shelf stability and microbiological quality of cold-smoked catfish at ambient temperature using 3% ginger, 3% garlic, a blend of 1.5% ginger and 1.5% garlic, and 0.5% potassium sorbate as preservatives.

Comment [RD10]: delete

Comment [RD11]: Fish is perishable, poor or insufficient post-harvest processing and its management is one of the biggest challenges facing its consumption.

Comment [RD12]: moisture or water activity of smoked fish is a key factor

Comment [RD13]: The moisture or water activity of smoked fish is a factor in determining microbial growth and shelf life of the fish [5].

Comment [RD14]: Gram [6] notes that crabmeat and smoked fish contained *Listeria monocytogenes*

Comment [RD15]: Accordingly, Da Silva [7] have reported that although microbes are common in nature and are capable of growing at both low temperatures and high salt concentrations of up to 10%.

Comment [RD16]: Cold smoking is not widespread in Nigeria to the traditional method of smoking fish. In cold smoking method, the temperature doesn't go above 30°C [8].

Comment [RD17]: fish

Comment [RD18]: do

Comment [RD19]: In contrast to hot-smoked and oven-dried tilapia samples, Oyelese [9] reported that cold-smoked fish have higher moisture content due to improper drying. As a result, the cold-smoked fish has a shorter shelf stability.

Comment [RD20]: Besides, study by Eyo [8] revealed that the cold-smoked fish has higher nutritional value than the hot-smoked fish.

Comment [RD21]: have become more necessary.

Comment [RD22]: , and

2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

2.1 Sample Collection

One hundred (100) samples of Catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) with weights ranging between 300 to 400 g were used. The Catfish samples were purchased from the Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike's fish farm, while the ginger, garlic, and other ingredients were purchased from Ubani main market, Abia State. They were taken to the Laboratory prior to analyses for pre-smoking treatment and thereafter to the College smoking kiln for smoking.

2.2 Processing and Preparation Operation:

2.2.1 Preparation of ginger, garlic and potassium sorbate solution

Fresh garlic and ginger solution were prepared by the method described by [12]. Five grams (5g) of potassium sorbate powder was dissolved into 1000 ml of distilled water to obtain 0.5% potassium sorbate solution.

2.2.4 Fish Processing and smoking

One hundred (100) pieces of the Catfish were cut open through the head down to remove the guts and gills, washed with running tap water, and placed in five (5) lots of 20 pieces each. Following marinating standards (WHO), the ratio of fish to liquid was 1:1 weight per volume of fish samples. Each of the lots was treated with 3% ginger, 3% garlic, 1.5% ginger, and 1.5% garlic, and the 4th lot with 0.5% potassium sorbate, respectively, as brine for 2 h before they were conveyed for cold smoking at a temperature around 28°-32 ° C. The lots of folded catfish were arranged on the smoking racks and subjected to cold smoking for 8 h. At intervals of 1 h, the smoking temperature was monitored using a thermometer.

2.2.5 Sample preparation for analysis

After smoking, the fish samples were cooled and separately stored in five labelled metal baskets each containing 20 pieces of the cold-smoked fish. The samples of cold-smoked *Clarias gariepinus*, were coded based on the different treatments they were subjected to. The cold-smoked fish samples were carried to the Department of Food Science and Technology, Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike laboratory for further microbial analyses. Storage of the fish samples was in ambient temperature and wrapped with foil for 4 days.

Comment [RD23]: One hundred (100) samples of Catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*) with weights ranging between 300 to 400 g were purchased from the Michael Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike's fish farm Nigeria. The ginger, garlic, and other marinating gredients were purchased from Ubani main market, Abia State Nigeria. The fish samples were transported to the Laboratory Department of Food Science and Technology Okpara University of Agriculture, Umudike Nigeria prior to analyses

Comment [RD24]: 2.2 Processing of ginger, garlic and potassium sorbate solution

Comment [RD25]: 3.1 Fish Processing and Smoking

Comment [RD26]: The Catfish was processed by cutting open through the head down to remove the guts and gills. It was then washed with running tap water, and placed in five (5) lots of 20 pieces each.

Comment [RD27]: What is this?

Comment [RD28]: Recast, sentence not clear

Comment [RD29]: Each of the lots was treated with 3% ginger, 3% garlic, 1.5% ginger, and 1.5% garlic, and the 4th lot with 0.5% potassium sorbate, respectively, as brine for 2 h before they were conveyed for cold smoking at a temperature around 28°-32 ° C. The lots of folded catfish were arranged on the smoking racks and subjected to cold smoking for 8 h. At intervals of 1 h, the smoking temperature was monitored using a thermometer.

The preparation of the sample for microbial analysis was done as described by [13]. For the entire experiment 1ml of appropriate dilution was used for inoculation on Tryptone soy agar and the selective media for the isolation of *Escherichia coli*, *Staphylococcus spp*, *Listeria*, *Salmonella spp*, and fungi. This experiment was carried out on the fish samples in alternate days (0, 2, 4,) making 3 testing days for microbial analysis.

2.3 Experimental/ Research Design

The experiment was modelled according to [14]. The study was laid out on a two-factor (A x B) factorial experimental setting, with factors A and B being the preservatives and the storage period, respectively. With the exception of the microbiological studies, the factor levels were generally set at 5 x 3 for the preservatives and storage period, respectively. The microbiological study was expanded to a 5 x 8 factor level setting, to monitor the effectiveness of the preservatives for a longer period.

2.4 Microbial Analysis

The fish samples were subjected to microbial analysis to determine the microbial load of the samples. Selective media were used for isolation of the specific pathogenic organisms which include; Sorbitol MacConkey agar (CM0813) for *Escherichia coli*, brilliance *Listeria* agar base (CM1080) for *Listeria* spp, brilliance *Salmonella* agar base (ISO16140 standard) for *Salmonella* spp, Dichloran Bose-Bengal Chloramphenicol (DRBC) Agar base (Oxoid), for yeast and mould, Baird Parker agar base (Oxoid) for *Staphylococcus* spp, peptone water (CM009) for the dilution and tryptone soy agar which was used for total bacteria count (TBC) . These media were prepared according to the manufacturer's instructions. The microbial load for the cold smoked fish samples was recorded in CFU/g.

2.4.1 Enumeration of *Escherichia coli* /Coliforms

Sorbitol MacConkey agar (CM0813) was prepared according to manufactures instruction. Cefixime-Tellurite supplement (SR0172E Oxoid) was used for the isolation of *Escherichia coli*. Exactly 1ml of the aliquot of the samples made up in the peptone water (in triplicate per sample) was poured into the plate and about 15 – 20 ml of molten agar (45-50 °C) was then poured into the plate, mixed thoroughly and allowed to solidify, inverted and incubated at 37°C for 24 h. Pink colonies were observed in the plate and was counted using colony county indicating the presence of *Escherichia coli* /Coliforms.

2.4.2 Enumeration of *Listeria monocytogenes*

Comment [RD30]: The enumeration of contaminants of the fish were determined according to standard procedure described byxxxxxx A 25 g of the fish was homogenised in 225 ml sterile xxx broth. Aseptically, the resultant stock solution was tenfold serially diluted and pour plated on Sorbitol MacConkey agar (CM0813) for *Escherichia coli*, brilliance *Listeria* agar base (CM1080) for *Listeria* spp, brilliance *Salmonella* agar base (ISO16140 standard) for *Salmonella* spp, Dichloran Bose-Bengal Chloramphenicol (DRBC) Agar base (Oxoid), for yeast and mould, Baird Parker agar base (Oxoid) for *Staphylococcus* spp, peptone water (CM009) for the dilution and tryptone soy agar which was used for total bacteria count (TBC) . The inoculated agar Petri plates were then incubated at 37°C for 24 h except Dichloran Bose-Bengan Chloramphenicol (DRBC) Oxoid for yeast and mould. Discrete colonies formed ; Pink colonies were observed in the plate and was counted using colony county indicating the presence of *Escherichia coli* /Coliforms. Green colonies were observed and counted with colony counter which indicated the presence of *Listeria* spp. purple and blue colonies were counted and recorded with a colony counter, indicating the presence of *Salmonella* spp. Black colonies with halo around it was observed and counted using colony counter indicating the presence of *Staphylococcus* spp. and the presence of yeast and mould were enumerated and expressed as colony forming unit per gram of samples (cfu/g).

Brilliance *Listeria* agar base (CM1080) was prepared according to manufacturer's instruction. One vial of Brilliance *Listeria* selective supplement (SR0227E) and Brilliance *Listeria* differential supplement (SR0228E) were added for the isolation of *Listeria* spp. Approximately 15 – 20 ml of molten agar was poured into the plate mixed thoroughly and allowed to solidify, 1ml of the aliquot was inoculated into the *Listeria* agar plate, spread with sterile glass rod spreader, inverted and incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. Green colonies were observed and counted with colony counter which indicated the presence of *Listeria* spp.

2.4.3 Enumeration of *Salmonella* spp

Brilliance *Salmonella* agar base (CM1092) was prepared according to the manufacturer's instructions. One vial of Brilliance *Salmonella* selective supplement (SR0194E) was added for the isolation of *Salmonella* spp. purple and blue colonies were counted and recorded with a colony counter, indicating the presence of *Salmonella* spp (*Salmonella typhimurium* and *Klebsiella pneumonia*).

2.4.4 Enumeration of *Staphylococcus aureus*

Baird parker agar (with egg yolk Tellirite Emulsion, Oxoid), which was prepared according to the manufacturer's instruction. The plates were incubated at 37 °C for 24 h. Black colonies with halo around it was observed and counted using colony counter indicating the presence of *Staphylococcus* spp.

2.4.5 Enumeration of yeast and mould

Dichloran Bose-Bengan Chloramphenicol (DRBC) Oxoid was used for the isolation of yeast and mould. DRBC was prepared according to the manufacturer's instruction. The mixture was homogenized and 0.1 ml of the aliquot was inoculated on the DRBC plate and incubated for 25 °C for 5 days. The presence of yeast and mould was counted and recorded in CFU/g of the sample.

Comment [RD31]: All this procedures can be summarised as suggested above

2.5 Statistical Analysis

Data obtained from bench analyses were recorded and subjected to statistical analysis of variance (ANOVA) using SPSS version 20.0 statistical package for windows (SPSS, Chicago IL). Differences were considered to be significant at ($p < 0.05$), means were separated using Duncan's multiple range test.

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The Catfish samples were subjected to analysis immediately after cold smoking on the day of production (i.e., day 0). The fish was stored at ambient temperature at $(28 \pm 2^{\circ}\text{C})$ for four (4) days. Samples were also taken for microbial analysis in alternate days of the storage periods (i.e., day 0, 2, and 4). The specific microorganisms that were evaluated in the cold smoked fish samples during the storage period exhibited their defined colony characteristics on the respective chromogenic media; *Escheriachia coli* appeared as pink colonies, *Staphylococcus* sp had black colouration with shinny halo around it, *Listeria monocytogenes* as green colonies, *Salmonella* spp as purple and blue colonies while the yeast and mould as pink colonies.

Comment [RD32]: Delete or match these information under materials and methods

3.1 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on Total Viable Count (CFU/g) for Catfish Stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature

It was observed that the initial total viable count of all the cold smoked fish before the ambient storage day 0 was low, with the lowest number of count obtained in the 3% ginger treated sample (8.7×10^5 cfu/g) and the highest number found in the untreated sample (1.19×10^6 cfu/g). This could be attributed to the treatment given to the fish samples prior to cold smoking which must have destroyed / inhibited some of the bacteria load present in the fish samples though statistically, there was no significant difference ($p < 0.05$) between the treated and the untreated samples. However, as the duration of storage increased, there was significant increase in the number of total viable count in all the sample but 3% garlic recorded the least increase ($1.13 \times 10^6 - 2.84 \times 10^6 - 3.48 \times 10^6$ cfu/g) and the highest in the untreated sample ($1.19 \times 10^6 - 3.38 \times 10^6 - 3.66 \times 10^6$ cfu/g). However, the treated samples were significantly different ($p < 0.05$) from the untreated sample on day 2 but not significantly different ($p > 0.05$) on day 4. This report concurred with the findings of Mosarrat *et al.* [15] who recorded an increase in TVC in salt + garlic-treated smoke-dried *Mastacembelus pancxalus* (biam) during different storage conditions. The effect of preservatives on the TVC from the preservative main effect shows that the treated samples are significantly different ($p < 0.05$) from the untreated sample.

Comment [RD33]: Table 1 presents the effect of preservatives and cold smoking on total viable count (cfu/g) for catfish stored at room (ambient) temperature. In this study, lowest total viable count was observed in the 3% ginger-treated cold smoked fish (8.7×10^5 cfu/g), while the untreated sample was the most contaminated (1.19×10^6 cfu/g) at pre-storage.

Comment [RD34]: Please, avoid very lengthy sentences

Table 1: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on Total Viable Count TVC (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature (28± 2°C)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	1.19x10 ^{6c}	3.38x10 ^{6a}	3.66x10 ^{6a}	2.74x10^{6a}
3% Ginger	8.7x10 ^{5c}	2.43x10 ^{6b}	3.43x10 ^{6a}	2.33x10^{6b}
3% Garlic	1.13x10 ^{6c}	2.84x10 ^{6b}	3.48x10 ^{6a}	2.48x10^{6b}
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	1.09x10 ^{6c}	2.66x10 ^{6b}	3.28x10 ^{6a}	2.34x10^{6b}
0.5% K-Sorbate	9.6x10 ^{5c}	2.87x10 ^{6b}	3.45x10 ^{6a}	2.27x10^{6b}
Duration of storage main effect	9.5x10^{5c}	2.89x10^{6b}	3.46x10^{6a}	

Values are means from replicated determinations: n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly (p<0.05) different.

This implies that the preservatives used have significant effect on the TVC compared to the untreated sample. The effect of storage on TVC from duration of storage main effect shows that TVC of cold smoked fish samples were increased with increased in the duration of ambient storage due to the growth and multiplication of microbes. This agrees with the results of Bilgin *et al.* [16] and Kester *et al.* [17], who reported an increase in TVC of Gilthead Seabream (*Sparus aurata*) after cold and hot smoking and an increase in microbial load of cold smoked Atlantic Cod *Gadus morhua* during ambient storage respectively. Furthermore, there was significant difference (p<0.05) between the treated and the untreated sample, which means that though there was an increase, the rate of the increase was slow in the treated samples compared to the untreated sample. This increase could be a result of the absorption of a small amount of moisture by the processed fish from the surrounding atmosphere which provides an enabling environment for microbial growth as a result of the increased duration of storage at ambient temperature.

3.2 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on Total Fungal Count (CFU/g) for Catfish stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature.

At the beginning of the storage period day 0, it was observed as shown in Table 2 below that 3% ginger (4.6x10⁵ CFU/g) treated sample recorded the lowest value of the total fungal count (CFU/g) and 3% garlic (6.1x10⁵ CFU/g) recorded the highest count. However, there was no significant difference (p> 0.05)

among the samples. But as the duration of storage increased, the total fungal count significantly increased ($p < 0.05$) in all the samples, with 3% ginger recording the lowest ($6.6 \times 10^5 - 7.4 \times 10^5$ CFU/g) and the 0.5% potassium sorbate ($7.1 \times 10^5 - 8.2 \times 10^5$ CFU/g) the highest TFC among the treated samples throughout the storage days, although there was no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) among the treated samples. It was noted that there was a general increase among the samples but, the total fungal count of the untreated sample was significantly higher than the treated samples as the duration of storage increased. This agrees with Kester *et al.* [17], who reported an increase in mould count of cold-smoked Atlantic cod under ambient storage. This could be attributed to the anti-fungal effect of the preservatives. Statistically, the effect of preservatives from preservative main effects on the total fungal count shows, significant difference ($p < 0.05$) between the treated and the untreated samples. 3% ginger (6.2×10^5 CFU/g) treated sample was most effective, followed by 3% garlic (6.5×10^5 CFU/g), 1.5 % ginger + garlic (6.9×10^5 CFU/g), 0.5% potassium sorbate then untreated sample (7.7×10^5 CFU/g) which had the highest value of total fungal count.

This result shows that these preservatives have anti-fungal properties and it agrees with Negbenebor *et al.* [20] who used clove and ginger individually and in combination to reduce the fungal load of smoked fish. The effect of storage on the TFC from the duration of storage main effect shows a clear significant difference ($p < 0.05$) in the storage days 0, 2 and day 4, (5.6×10^5 , 7.0×10^5 and 7.3×10^5 CFU/g) respectively.

Table 2: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on Total Fungal Count (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature ($28 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	5.7×10^{5de}	8.2×10^{5ab}	9.1×10^{5a}	7.7×10^{5a}
3% Ginger	4.6×10^{5e}	6.6×10^{5bcd}	7.4×10^{5abcd}	6.2×10^{5b}
3% Garlic	6.1×10^{5cde}	6.4×10^{5bcde}	7.1×10^{5bcd}	6.5×10^{5b}
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	5.8×10^{5de}	6.9×10^{5bcd}	7.9×10^{5abc}	6.9×10^{5ab}
0.5% K-Sorbate	5.7×10^{5de}	7.1×10^{5bcd}	8.2×10^{5ab}	7.0×10^{5ab}
Duration of storage main effect	5.6×10^{5c}	7.0×10^{5b}	7.3×10^{5a}	

Values are means from replicated determinations: n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly ($p < 0.05$) different.

Comment [RD35]: Values are means of replicated determinations. Means with different superscripts along the column, and row varied significantly at $p < 0.05$. I find difficulty to follow the long explanation, recast n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Are Preservative main effect or Duration of storage main effect not mean values?

This is indicative that storage has significant effect on total fungal count which implies that TFC increased with increase in the duration of storage of cold smoked samples. This work is in agreement with Idris *et al.* [23] and Kester *et al.* [17], who reported an increase in TFC of different concentrations of ginger-treated catfish under storage and an increase in mould count of cold smoked Atlantic cod, *Gadus morhua* at ambient storage respectively.

3.3 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Escherichia coli* Count (CFU/g) for Catfish stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature.

It was observed from the result that there was no detectable growth of *Escherichia coli* in all the samples at day 0. However, as the duration of storage increased at day 2, the growth of *E. coli* was noticed with the sample treated with 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic (3.0×10^5 CFU/g) recording the lowest number of growth and 0.5% potassium sorbate (6.4×10^5 CFU/g) the highest number of growth among the treated samples. Values obtained from the untreated samples was significantly higher ($p < 0.05$) than those of the treated samples, probably because of the antimicrobial effect of the preservatives applied to the fish prior to cold smoking. Further increase in the number of *E. coli* was also observed as the duration of storage increased but without any significant difference ($p < 0.05$) between the treated and the untreated samples.

Table 3: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Escherichia coli* count (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature ($28 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	ND	9.2×10^{5a}	6.2×10^{5c}	5.1×10^{5a}
3% Ginger	ND	4.0×10^{5ef}	5.5×10^{5cd}	3.2×10^{5b}
3% Garlic	ND	4.5×10^{5de}	5.5×10^{5cd}	3.3×10^{5b}
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	ND	3.0×10^{5f}	4.2×10^{5e}	2.4×10^{5c}
0.5% K-Sorbate	ND	6.4×10^{5c}	7.7×10^{5b}	4.7×10^{5a}
Duration of storage main effect	$< 10^{1b}$	5.4×10^{5a}	5.8×10^{5a}	

Values are means from replicated determinations: n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly ($p < 0.05$) different. ND = Not Dictated

The effect of preservative on *E. coli* from the preservative main effect shows significant difference ($p < 0.05$) among the treated samples. Sample treated with 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic (2.4×10^5 CFU/g) was seen to be most effective against *E. coli*, followed by 3% ginger (3.2×10^5 CFU/g), and 3% garlic (3.3×10^5 CFU/g) then 0.5% potassium sorbate (4.7×10^5 CFU/g) which was the least effective. However, the growth rate of *E. coli* on the treated samples, were significantly lower than the untreated sample. This means that the preservatives used were effective against *E. coli*. This is in agreement with Ezeama and Ozua [21] who stated that ginger and garlic possess antimicrobial properties.

The effect of storage on *E. coli* from the duration of storage main effect revealed that, between the days 2 and 4 storage (5.4×10^5 and 5.8×10^5 CFU/g) respectively, there was no significant difference ($p < 0.05$) between them which means that storage significantly had equal increase / effect in the growth rate of *E. coli* on both storage days hence the longer the duration of storage the higher the growth rate of *E. coli*, but are significantly different ($p < 0.05$) from day 0 ($< 10^1$ CFU/g) which had no detectable growth of *E. coli* in all the samples. This disagrees with Kester *et al.* [17] who found no detectable amount of *E. coli* throughout the storage days of cold smoked Atlantic Cod *Gadus morhua*.

3.4 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Staphylococcus aureus* Count (CFU/g) for Catfish stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature.

From the values obtained in Table 4, it was observed that at day 0, sample treated with 3% ginger had no detectable growth of *Staphylococcus aureus* ($< 10^1$ CFU/g), this was followed by 0.5% potassium sorbate (2.8×10^5 CFU/g), 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic treated sample (3.1×10^5 CFU/g) and the 3% garlic treated sample, which are not significantly different from each other, then the untreated sample (4.4×10^5 CFU/g) which recorded the highest number of growth.

Table 4: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Staphylococcus aureus* count (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature (28± 2°C)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	4.4x10 ⁵ g	6.3x10 ⁵ b	9.3x10 ⁵ a	7.0x10 ⁵ a
3% Ginger	<10 ¹ h	5.9x10 ⁵ d	7.5x10 ⁵ bc	4.4x10 ⁵ d
3% Garlic	3.5x10 ⁵ ef	4.5x10 ⁵ e	7.0x10 ⁵ c	5.0x10 ⁵ c
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	3.1x10 ⁵ g	8.3x10 ⁵ b	8.0x10 ⁵ bc	6.5x10 ⁵ a
0.5% K-Sorbate	2.8x10 ⁵ g	7.3x10 ⁵ bc	8.1x10 ⁵ b	6.1x10 ⁵ b
Duration of storage main effect	2.8x10⁵c	6.6x10⁵b	8.0x10⁵a	

Values are means from replicated determinations: n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly (p<0.05) different.

Furthermore, with increase in the duration of storage the number of *S. aureus* count in the samples increased with significant difference (p<0.05) among the samples. This agrees with Kester *et al.* [17] who recorded an increase in *S. aureus* count in cold smoked Atlantic cod.

However, the result obtained from the preservative main effect show significant difference (p<0.05) among the treated samples. 3% ginger had the most effect (4.4x10⁵ CFU/g) against *S. aureus*, followed by 3% garlic (5.0x10⁵ CFU/g), 0.5% potassium sorbate (6.1x10⁵ CFU/g), and 1.5% ginger + garlic (6.5x10⁵ CFU/g) which had the least effect on *S. aureus*. This means that the different preservatives used had varying effect

on the fish samples but values obtained are significantly lower than the untreated samples (7.0x10⁵ CFU/g). The effect of storage on the *S. aureus* from the duration of storage main effect shows significant difference (p<0.05) in the storage days (2.8x10⁵ CFU/g), (6.6x10⁵ CFU/g), and (8.0x10⁵ CFU/g) for days 0, 2 and 4 respectively. This implies that storage has significant effect on the *S. aureus* and that *S. aureus* count increased with increase in the duration of storage.

3.5 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Listeria sp* Count (CFU/g) for Catfish stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature.

From the result obtained in Table 5. *Listeria sp* was not detected in all the samples at days 0 (<10¹ CFU/g) and day 2 (<10¹ CFU/g) storage days. However, with increase in the duration of storage, (3.9x10⁵

CFU/g) from 3% ginger, (3.8×10^5 CFU/g) from 3% garlic, (3.0×10^5 CFU/g), from 1.5% ginger + garlic, (3.1×10^5 CFU/g) from 0.5% potassium sorbate and (4.8×10^5 CFU/g) from the untreated sample were isolated from the samples. This result could be attributed to the inhibitory effect of the phenolic compounds in the wood and the antimicrobial effect of the preservatives applied on the treated samples against *Listeria spp.*

Table 5: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Listeria sp* count (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature ($28 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	$<10^{1d}$	$<10^{1d}$	4.8×10^{5a}	1.6×10^{5a}
3% Ginger	$<10^{1d}$	$<10^{1d}$	3.9×10^{5b}	1.3×10^{5ab}
3% Garlic	$<10^{1d}$	$<10^{1d}$	3.8×10^{5bc}	1.3×10^{5ab}
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	$<10^{1d}$	$<10^{1d}$	3.0×10^{5c}	9.8×10^{4b}
0.5% K-Sorbate	$<10^{1d}$	$<10^{1d}$	3.1×10^{5bc}	1.0×10^{5b}
Duration of storage main effect	$<10^{1b}$	$<10^{1b}$	3.7×10^{5a}	

Values are means from replicated determinations: n= 6 for preservative main effect; n= 10 for duration of storage main effect; n= 2 for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly ($p < 0.05$) different.

Also, the emergence of this organism at day 4 during the ambient storage may likely be due to the low temperature inherent in cold smoking process which provides a favourable condition for proliferation of *Listeria sp*, if the catfish harboured the pathogen or acquired it from the processing environment prior to cold smoking or storage environment during storage. Moreover, there were significant differences ($p < 0.05$) among the samples, the treated samples recorded lower counts of *Listeria sp* than the untreated sample, and the anti-listeria activity of the preservatives could have accounted for this.

The effect of preservatives from preservative main effect on *Listeria sp* shows no significant difference ($p > 0.05$) among the treated samples. However, the 1.5% ginger+1.5% garlic (9.8×10^4 CFU/g) treated sample had the lowest count and hence most effective against the organism, followed by 0.5% Potassium sorbate (1.0×10^5 CFU/g) then 3% ginger and 3% garlic (1.3×10^5 and 1.3×10^5 CFU/g) respectively. Moreover, values obtained from the treated samples were significantly lower and different ($p < 0.05$) from the untreated sample (1.6×10^5 CFU/g). This result shows the *anti listerial* properties of the different

preservatives used in this study. Hence the study agrees with Neetoo *et al.* [22] who reported antilisterial activity of some preservatives potassium sorbate combined with Nisin on cold smoked salmon pata and fillet. Therefore, these indicated that the preservatives are effective and inhibitory to *Listeria* sp when compared to the untreated sample.

The effect of storage on this pathogen from the duration of storage main effect shows no significant difference ($p>0.05$) between day 0 and day 2 but they are significantly different from day 4 the last day of ambient storage. This is an indication that ambient storage significantly affected *Listeria* sp from 4th day of storage by increasing the counts across the samples. Therefore, *Listeria* sp counts was increased with increase in duration of storage at ambient temperature of cold smoked spice treated catfish.

3.6 Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Salmonella* spp Count (CFU/g) for Catfish stored at Room (Ambient) Temperature.

It was observed from the table below that there was no detectable count of *Salmonella* sp in all the samples at day 0 as shown in Table 6. However, as the duration of storage was increasing the organism became visible across the samples. At day 2 storage, 0.5 % potassium sorbate treated sample recorded the least count (6.4×10^5 CFU/g), while 3% ginger (9.0×10^5 CFU/g) the highest count among the treated samples, there were significant variation in the rate of increase among the samples. Further increase was also observed as the duration of storage increased to day 4. Also, a decrease (9.4×10^5 - 8.2×10^5 CFU/g) was observed in the 3% garlic at day 4.

The effect of preservatives from the preservative main effect indicated a significant variation among the samples. 0.5% potassium sorbate (4.5×10^5 CFU/g) was most effective in inhibiting the organism followed by 1.5% ginger + garlic (5.1×10^5 CFU/g) then 3% garlic and 3% ginger (5.9×10^5 and 6.1×10^5 CFU/g) respectively. Moreover, 0.5% potassium sorbate and 1.5% ginger + 1.5% garlic treated sample were significantly lower than the untreated sample. This result implies that these treatments given to the fish samples had significant effect on *Salmonella*, but 3% garlic and 3% ginger were significantly higher than the untreated sample.

The effect of storage from the duration of storage main effect statistically on *Salmonella* shows no significant different ($p>0.05$) at day 2 and day 4 (7.9×10^5 and 8.3×10^5 CFU/g) respectively but they are significantly different from day 0 ($<10^1$ CFU/g). This means that storage had no effect on the organism at

day 0 but with increase in the duration of storage there was a significant increase ($p < 0.05$) in *Salmonella* count in all the samples.

Table 6: Effect of Preservatives and Cold Smoking on *Salmonella spp* (CFU/g) of Catfish stored at ambient temperature ($28 \pm 2^\circ\text{C}$)

Preservative	Duration of storage (Days)			Preservative main effect
	0	2	4	
Untreated	$<10^{1f}$	7.6×10^{5cd}	8.7×10^{5abc}	5.4×10^{5bc}
3% Ginger	$<10^{1f}$	9.0×10^{5ab}	9.3×10^{5ab}	6.1×10^{5ab}
3% Garlic	$<10^{1f}$	9.4×10^{5a}	8.2×10^{5bc}	5.9×10^{5ab}
1.5%Ginger+1.5%Garlic	$<10^{1f}$	7.1×10^{5de}	8.3×10^{5abc}	5.1×10^{5c}
0.5% K-Sorbate	$<10^{1f}$	6.4×10^{5e}	7.1×10^{5de}	4.5×10^{5d}
Duration of storage main effect	$<10^{1b}$	7.9×10^{5a}	8.3×10^{5a}	

Values are means from replicated determinations: $n = 6$ for the preservative main effect; $n = 10$ for the duration of storage main effect; $n = 2$ for the interactions. Means bearing different superscripts in the preservative main effect column, duration of storage main effect row and the interaction cells are significantly ($p < 0.05$) different.

5.1 CONCLUSION

In conclusion, cold smoked catfish *Clarius gariepinus* can be microbiologically stable and safe for human consumption with minimal changes to the nutrient composition when treated with some natural spices like ginger and garlic under ambient storage. Furthermore, the use of up to 3% of these natural spices individually and in combination can compare favourably with synthetic antimicrobial agents like potassium sorbate, citric acid and sodium metabisulphite. The use of these natural preservatives will therefore help in dousing the tension about health concerns posed by the invasion of the hazardous pathogenic organisms which are associated with the consumption of cold smoked fish under storage conditions by reducing and inhibiting the growth of these pathogens in cold smoked catfish. However, the use of these natural preservatives at ambient storage, however, may not offer the needed preservative effect beyond four days.

Comment [RD36]: This statement cannot be substantiated by the finding of the present study.
Delete

Comment [RD37]: The statement is unnecessary

REFERENCES

1. Kumolu-Johnson CA, Aladetohun NF, Ndimele PE. The effect of smoking on the nutritional qualities and shelf- life of *Clarias gariepinus* (BURCHELL 1822). *African Journal of Biotechnology*. 2010; 9(1): 073-076.
2. Magawata I, Shina, AA. Effect of Spice Treatment on the Quality of Solar Dried African Catfish, *Clarias gariepinus* in Sokoto, Nigeria. *Journal of Food Science and Quality Management*. 2013; 19(1): 7-14.
3. Usydus Z, Szlinder-Richert J, Adamczyk M. Protein quality and amino acid profiles of fish products available in Poland. *Food Chem*. 2009; 112: 139-145.
4. Iheagwara CM. Effect of ginger extract on stability and sensorial quality of smoked Mackerel (*Scomber scombrus*) fish. *Journal of Nutrition and Food Science*, 2013;3: 199.
5. Venugopal V, Doke SN, Thomas P. Radiation processing to improve the quality of fishery products. *Critical Reviews in Food Science and Nutrition*. 1999; 39(5), 391-440.
6. Gram L. Potential hazard in cold-smoked fish: *Listeria monocytogenes*. *Journal Food Science*. 2001;66: S1072- S1081.
7. Da Silva LV. *Hazard Analysis Critical Control Point (HACCP), microbial safety and shelf life of smoked blue catfish (Ictalurus furcatus)*. M.Sc. Thesis, Department of Food Science, Louisiana State University, Louisiana, USA; 2002.
8. Eyo AA. *Fish Processing Technology in the Tropics*. National Institute for Freshwater Fisheries Research, New Bussa, Nigeria, ISBN-(13): 9781770457, Pp 403; 2001.
9. Oyelese OA. Quality assessment of cold smoked hot smoked and oven dried *Tilapia nilotica* Under Cold Storage Temperature Conditions. *Journal of Fisheries International*. 2006; 1(2): 92-97.
10. Kumar Gupta S, Sharma A. Medicinal properties of Zingiber officinale Roscoe- A review. *Journal of Pharmacy and Biological Sciences*. 2014; 9(5). 124-129
11. Mikaili P, Maadirad S, Moloudizargari M, Aghajanshakeri S, Sarahroodi S. Therapeutic uses and pharmacological properties of garlic, shallot, and their biologically active compounds. *Iranian journal of basic medical sciences*. 2013; 16(10), 1031.
12. Kyu HK. *Natural preservative compri; sing heated garlic extract and method for preparing thereof*, Sejong University. USA; 2005.
13. Ezeama CF. *Food Microbiology, Fundamentals and Applications*. Natural prints Limited Lagos, Nigeria. 2007; Pp 64-66, 104.
14. Oehlert LA. *First Course in Design and Analysis of Experiments (1st Edition). Hardcover, 600 Pages, Published 2000*
15. Mosarrat NN, Gulshan AL., Shubhash CC, Farzana B, Mohajira B. Shelf-life study of salt and garlic treated smoked-dried Mastacembelus pancalus (baim) during different storage condition. *International Journal of Advanced Research and Development*. 2017; 2(1): 79 - 85.

16. Bilgin S, Unlusayin M, Izci L, Gunlu A. The Determination of The Shelf Life and Some Nutritional Components of Gilthead Seabream (*sparus aurata* L.) after cold and hot Smoking. *Turkish Journal of Veterinary and Animal Science*. 2008; 32 (1): 49-56.
17. Kester CT, Daramola JA, Oni PI, Oshinaya SO. Effect of Smoking Duration on the Microbiological Quality of Cold-smoked Atlantic Cod, *Gadus morphea* (Linnaeus). *Journal of Fisheries and Aquatic Science*. 2013; (8): 196-201.
18. Frazier WC, Westhoff DC. *Food Microbiology (fourth edition)*. Tata McGraw-Hill publishing company limited New Delhi. 2008; Pp 421.
19. Jeyakumar E, Lawrennce R, Ahmed S. Antibacterial activity of garlic, onions and ginger against contaminants of fermented milk. *Asian Journal of Microbial Biotechnology and Environmental Biotechnology Science*. 2005; 7(2): 237- 238.
20. Negbenebor CA, Adetunji IS, Igene, JO. The effect of clove and ginger dip on the quality of solar-tent dried (*Clarias anguillids*). In FAO. Fisheries report; 1996.
21. Ezeama CF, Ozua NO. Microbiological assessment and sensory properties of steamed cowpea paste (*moi moi*) treated with garlic, ginger, and alkaline salt (trona). *Nigerian Food Journal*. 2008, 26 (2): 32-42.
22. Neetoo H, Mahomoodally F. Use of antimicrobial films and edible coatings incorporating chemical and biological preservatives to control growth of *Listeria monocytogenes* on cold smoked salmon. *BioMed Research International*; 2014.
23. Idris GL, Omojowo FS, Omojasola PF, Adetunji, CO, Ngwu E.O. The effect of different concentrations of ginger on the quality of smoked dried catfish (*Clarias gariepinus*). *Nature and Science Journal*. 2010; 8(4): 59 – 62.
24. Le Loir Y, Baron F, Gantier M. *Staphylococcus aureus* and Food Poisoning. *Genetics Molecular Research* 2003; 2: 63-76 (Public Medicine).
25. Lianou, A., and Sofos, J. N. A review of the incidence and transmission of *Listeria monocytogenes* in ready-to-eat products in retail and food service environments. *Journal of Food Protection* 2007; (9): 2172-2198.