

**Review Form 1.7**

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Environment &amp; Ecology</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJEE_106418</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Feasibility of Water Quality from Treated Domestic Wastewater Effluent in IPAL Bojongsoang, Bandung District for Fish Farming</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 1: Review Comments**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. <b>Is the manuscript important for scientific community?</b> (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. <b>Is the title of the article suitable?</b> (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. <b>Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</b></li> <li>4. <b>Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</b></li> <li>5. <b>Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</b></li> <li>6. <b>Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in thereview form.</b></li> </ol> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>L = Line</p> <p><b>Title and abstract:</b> specify the country</p> <p><b>Abstract:</b> give the meaning of the acronym WWTP when it first appears</p> <p><b>Introduction</b></p> <p>L16-25: missing reference</p> <p>L27: "Based on data from the Bandung City Statistics Agency (BPS), the..." -&gt; cite the reference appropriately</p> <p><b>Material and methods</b></p> <p>L71-72: "Bojongsoang, Bandung Regency, West Java" -&gt; specify the country.</p> <p>L80: give the meaning of the acronym "DO"</p> <p>L81: Format "NH3"</p> <p>Table 1: What does "Suhu" mean?</p> <p>Table 1: "°C Potensiometrik" -&gt; I didn't understand</p> <p>L118-120: Was this regional legislation cited in the reference list?</p> <p><b>Results</b></p> <p>-&gt; I suggest improving the formatting of Tables 3 and 4, it is confusing, difficult to visualize.</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	<p>Figures 2 to 7: translation into English</p> <p>L214: "has the lowest DO value is ..." -&gt; I suggest you use all the verbs in the pastthroughout the text.</p> <p>L225: "(Effendi 2003).The" -&gt; missing spaceTable</p> <p>5 and 6: "Suhu (°C)" -&gt; ?</p> <p>L299: "ph" -&gt; pH</p> <p>Table 5: Table formatting is not good, some numbers are appearing on 2 lines, confusing. Verify proper formatting of all tables.</p> <p>L305: "bod5, ammonia, ph, and tss" -&gt; format</p> <p>L305-306: "There is one parameter that exceeds the quality standards forwastewater treatment. That parameter is tss." -&gt; rewrite</p> <p>L307: "tss"</p> <p>-&gt; acronyms in lowercase: acronyms must be in uppercase, check all the text.</p> <p>-&gt; check the formatting of numbers in English. For example: pH 8,15 (Table 6) -&gt; pH 8.15(replace "," with ".")</p> <p>L352: "there are several parameters" -&gt; specify</p> <p>L359: "According to febrita and roosmini (2022)," -&gt; formatL360: "cr,</p> <p>zn, cu, and ni." -&gt; format</p>	
--	--	--

**Review Form 1.7**

	<p>check case formatting throughout all text.</p> <p>359-364: this work did not analyze heavy metals in the samples.</p> <p>-&gt; Table 2: could the authors prepare a table with 3 columns: parameter, expected trend for the parameter and observed trend, that is, was the "Expected parameter value" reached?</p> <p><b>Conclusion</b></p> <p>L369: "several parameters" -&gt; specify</p> <p>L374: "six water quality parameters" -&gt; specify L375:</p> <p>"some ponds" -&gt; especificque</p> <p><b>References</b></p> <p>Check that all references cited throughout the text are in the reference list. Check that all references in the list of references have been cited throughout the text. Use "Ctrl+F"</p>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>		
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

**PART 2:**

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

**Reviewer Details:**

<p>Name:</p>	<p><b>Thiago Simonato Mozer</b></p>
<p>Department, University &amp; Country</p>	<p><b>Universidade Federal Fluminense, Brazil</b></p>