

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_107624
Title of the Manuscript:	Effect of Organic Sources and Fertilizer Levels on Physiological Response of Garlic by using Infrared Gas Analysis (IRGA) in Western Rajasthan.
Type of the Article	Original Research Article

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<p>1. The manuscript is important, but it needs to be greatly improved.</p> <p>2. Yes</p> <p>3. Not, the abstract should be restructured, improve the part of materials and methods as well as the results. It includes a lot of introduction but little information about the process that was carried out and its achievement.</p> <p>4. Not, the author does not include all the sections that should be included in the manuscript, such as the conclusion section, which does not include the following sections.</p> <p>5. Yes</p> <p>6. Not Hanif, M., Khan, R., Kiran, J., Haq, I. U., Ali, S., Niaz, Y., ... & Siddique, M. I. (2022). Interactive effect of organic and mineral phosphorus on volatile compounds, morphology, and physiology of garlic (<i>Allium sativum</i> L.). <i>Journal of King Saud University-Science</i>, 34(8), 102351. Diriba-Shiferaw, G., Nigussie-Dechassa, R., Kebede, W., Getachew, T., & Sharma, J. J. (2013). Growth and nutrients content and uptake of garlic (<i>Allium sativum</i> L.) as influenced by different types of fertilizers and soils. <i>Science, Technology and Arts Research Journal</i>, 2(3), 35-50. Kenea, F. T., & Gedamu, F. (2018). Response of garlic (<i>Allium sativum</i> L.) to vermicompost and mineral N fertilizer application at Haramaya, Eastern Ethiopia. <i>African Journal of Agricultural Research</i>, 13(2), 27-35. Oo, A. L., Khine, T. M., & Aye, T. T. (2019). Preparation and characterization of organic fertilisers made from bat guano, rice husk ash and groundnut leaves. <i>Journal Myanmar Academy of Arts and Sciences</i>, 17(1B), 393-405. ABD RAHMAN, S. S. N., TINGGA, R. C. T., BUKHORI, M. F. M., & ABDULLAH, S. M. A. A. (2023). A Brief Review of the Nutritive Value and Chemical Components of Bat Guano and Its Potential Use as a Natural Fertiliser in Agriculture. <i>Borneo Journal of Resource Science and Technology</i>, 13(1), 22-31. Nackley, L. L., Jeong, J. H., Oki, L. R., & Kim, S. H. (2016). Photosynthetic acclimation, biomass allocation, and water use efficiency of garlic in response to carbon dioxide enrichment and nitrogen fertilization. <i>Journal of the American Society for Horticultural Science</i>, 141(4), 373-380.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>Yes</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The author does not adhere to the journal's Guidelines. The author submits the manuscript, not following the guidelines of the journal.</p> <p>The references section is incorrect. Check the instructions for this journal again.</p> <p>He/she must rewrite the manuscript and resubmit it.</p> <p>The introduction does not include sufficient references, which must be up to date and the author must use references at least 10 years old.</p>	

Review Form 1.7

	<p>Number citations consecutively in square brackets [1], not as presented in alphabetical order. That is, if the first reference is Zaday it will be [1], while the next reference will be [2], regardless of the alphabetical order.</p> <p>Delete table 1, it is information that does not contribute to the manuscript. And they are terms that we know (Table 1: List of physiological data recorded by Infrared gas analysis (IRGA) model number CI-340.)</p> <p>The author should improve the quality of the table where he presents his results.</p> <p>The author refers to the fact that he used Ten plants were selected from each plot excluding the border row for taking observation. However, he does not mention the age of the crop at the time of taking the observation, what stage the tree was in fruiting, did he take the sample at harvest time, etc. He should be more specific.</p> <p>The author should expand on the information about the eight sources of organic materials, what they were, how they were made, etc. The way in which he writes them is not clear about the combinations. Expand the information on Groundnut husk and Wool waste, in this section.</p>	
--	--	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Mónica Guadalupe Lozano Contreras
Department, University & Country	National Institute of Forest Research Agricultural and Livestock, Mexico