

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	Asian Journal of Research in Zoology
Manuscript Number:	Ms_AJRIZ_108820
Title of the Manuscript:	Formaldehyde: From Interstellar Space to the Pathology Laboratory
Type of the Article	Letter to the editor

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript) 2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title) 3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive? 4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate? 5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct? 6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form. <p><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. While the article offers insights into the multifaceted nature of formaldehyde, its importance for the scientific community may be more limited. It does not present new research findings, experimental data, or groundbreaking discoveries. Instead, it primarily provides a historical overview and connects formaldehyde's origins with its use in pathology. However, the article may still hold value for the scientific community in terms of its ability to spark interest and discussion. It can serve as a platform for researchers and professionals to reflect on the historical context of formaldehyde's use as a fixative and explore potential connections with other scientific fields. Ultimately, the significance of the article for the scientific community will depend on the specific interests and research focus of individuals within the field of pathology and related disciplines. 2. Yes, the title "The Origins of Formaldehyde: From the Universe to the Pathologist's Table" effectively captures the main theme of the article by highlighting the origins of formaldehyde and its use in pathology. It also hints at the unique perspective presented in the article by connecting formaldehyde's origins in the universe to its application in pathology. 3. Letter to the editor does not typically have an abstract 4. Based on the provided content, it seems that the article does not have explicit subsections or a clear structure with distinct sections. Instead, it appears to be a single narrative or passage discussing the author's personal experiences with formaldehyde as a fixative in pathology and its historical origins. While the content is informative and engaging, it may benefit from a clearer organization and structure to enhance readability and facilitate the understanding of different aspects being discussed. Breaking down the text into sections or subsections could help guide the reader through the different topics covered, such as the author's personal experiences, the historical discovery of formaldehyde, its use as a fixative, and its cosmic origins. 5. The information presented in the excerpt appears to be generally accurate and in line with known scientific knowledge about formaldehyde's use as a fixative in pathology and its potential cosmic origins. The author mentions the historical discovery of formaldehyde, its role as a fixative in preserving tissues, and its compatibility with various histological techniques and stains. These are well-established aspects of formaldehyde in the field of pathology. Regarding the cosmic origins of formaldehyde, the author briefly refers to scientific discoveries suggesting the presence of formaldehyde in the early universe and its detection in comets and asteroids. While the specific references or studies supporting these claims are not provided, the general idea that formaldehyde can exist in space and be associated with the formation of our solar system is consistent with scientific knowledge. 6. The provided references in the article include a mix of older and more recent sources. Here is an evaluation of the references and some suggestions for additional references: Blum J. Formol als Konservierungs fluëssigkeit. Zool Anz 1893;16:450–452. This reference is quite old, dating back to 1893. While it represents the historical introduction of formaldehyde as a fixative, it may be beneficial to include more recent sources that discuss the properties and applications of formaldehyde as a fixative. Romano LA, Pedrosa VF. Re-claiming H&E: back to the future. Postgraduate Medical 	

[Review Form 1.7](#)

	<p>Journal, p. postgradmedj 2019;136955-2.</p> <p>This reference is more recent, from 2019, and appears to discuss the use of H&E staining in pathology. It provides some relevance to the discussion of formaldehyde as a fixative in the context of histological techniques. However, it would be valuable to include additional references that specifically address the preservation properties and compatibility of formaldehyde with different staining techniques.</p> <p>Armed Forces Institute of Pathology (U.S.). Manual of histologic staining methods of the Armed Forces Institute of Pathology. In: Luna LG, ed. 3rd ed. New York: Blakiston Division, McGraw-Hill, 1968.</p> <p>This reference is relatively old, dating back to 1968. While it may provide some insights into histological staining methods, it would be beneficial to include more recent references that reflect current practices and advancements in the field.</p> <p>Snyder LE, Buhl, D, Zuckerman B, Palmer P. Phys. Rev. Lett. 1969;22:679</p> <p>This reference is from 1969 and discusses the detection of interstellar formaldehyde. While it contributes to the discussion of formaldehyde's cosmic origins, it would be helpful to include more recent studies and references that provide further evidence and insights into this topic.</p> <p>Chen L, Woon DE. A theoretical investigation of the plausibility of reactions between ammonia and carbonyl species (formaldehyde, acetaldehyde, and acetone) in interstellar ice analogs at ultracold temperatures. J Phys Chem A. 2011;May 26;115(20):5166-83.</p> <p>This reference from 2011 explores theoretical investigations of reactions involving formaldehyde in interstellar ice analogs. While it contributes to the discussion of formaldehyde's cosmic origins, it may be helpful to include more recent studies and observational data that support the presence of formaldehyde in space.</p> <p>In addition to the existing references, here are some suggestions for additional references:</p> <p>A review article or textbook chapter on the properties and applications of formaldehyde as a fixative in pathology, published within the last 5-10 years.</p> <p>Recent studies or reviews that specifically address the compatibility of formaldehyde with different histological techniques and stains.</p> <p>Scientific articles or papers that discuss the detection of formaldehyde in interstellar space and its potential role in the formation of organic molecules.</p> <p>Including a mix of recent and relevant references will enhance the scientific accuracy and credibility of the article.</p>	
--	---	--

Review Form 1.7

<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The writing is clear and coherent, conveying the author's experiences and discussing the topic effectively. However, it is important to note that scholarly communications typically require a more formal and academic tone. While the excerpt is informative and engaging, it may benefit from some adjustments to align with the conventions of scholarly writing. For example: In the sentence "With time, you get used to it, and you only notice the smell of formaldehyde when someone visits the laboratory," consider rephrasing it to "Over time, one becomes accustomed to it, and the smell of formaldehyde is only noticeable when someone visits the laboratory."</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<p>The article titled "The Origins of Formaldehyde: From the Universe to the Pathologist's Table" provides an interesting perspective on the history and significance of formaldehyde as a fixative in pathology. The author begins by sharing their personal experience with the pungent odor of formaldehyde, which sets the stage for discussing the advancements in laboratory practices that have made working with formaldehyde safer.</p> <p>One weakness of the article is that it lacks a clear structure. While the personal experience and introduction of laboratory advancements are engaging, the transition to the discussion of formaldehyde's discovery and use as a fixative could have been smoother. The article would benefit from a more organized and logical flow to guide readers through the information presented.</p> <p>The article delves into the discovery of formaldehyde and its introduction as a fixative in tissue preservation. However, it would have been helpful if the author provided more details on the specific research and experiments that led to its discovery and subsequent use in pathology. This would have added depth to the historical aspect of the article and strengthened its overall credibility.</p> <p>Additionally, the connection between the origins of formaldehyde in the universe and its use as a fixative in pathology, while intriguing, feels somewhat forced. The article briefly mentions scientific discoveries regarding formaldehyde's presence in comets and asteroids, but fails to fully explore the implications of this connection. The inclusion of more scientific evidence and analysis would have enhanced this aspect of the article and made it more convincing.</p> <p>Despite these weaknesses, the article does have its strengths. The writing style is engaging, capturing the reader's attention and maintaining their interest throughout. The personal anecdotes add a relatable touch, allowing readers to connect with the author's experiences. Furthermore, the inclusion of references adds credibility to the information presented, although more detailed citations could have been provided.</p> <p>Overall, "The Origins of Formaldehyde: From the Universe to the Pathologist's Table" is an intriguing article that offers insights into the multifaceted nature of formaldehyde. While it could benefit from improvements in structure, depth of research, and exploration of the connection between formaldehyde's origins and its use in pathology, it still manages to provide an informative and thought-provoking read.</p>	

PART 2:

	<p>Reviewer's comment</p>	<p>Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</p>
<p>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</p>	<p><i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i></p>	

Review Form 1.7

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Bydaa Atron
Department, University & Country	Sivas Cumhuriyet University, Turkey