

Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	International Journal of Plant & Soil Science
Manuscript Number:	Ms_IJPSS_99952
Title of the Manuscript:	Estimate of Grain Yield- Based Drought Tolerance Indices for some Rice Genotypes under Egyptian Conditions
Type of the Article	

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalijpss.com/index.php/IJPSS/editorial-policy>)

Review Form 1.7

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p>Compulsory REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</p> <p>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</p> <p>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</p> <p>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</p> <p>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</p> <p>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</p> <p>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</p>	<p>Since freshwater supplies are limited in Egypt and the population is increased at high rate, developing rice cultivars with acceptable yields and drought tolerance has become extremely important for food security and water scarcity reduction. This research therefore defined drought tolerance indices that can be used for screening drought-tolerant genotypes, and in the meantime screened for rice genotypes that characterized by the highest tolerance to drought, recommending some genotypes to be used in future rice hybridization programs in Egypt.</p> <p>The title is concise and rather informative. However, although the goals of this research were: (1) to determine drought tolerance indices, and (2) to examine drought-tolerance genotypes. The title did not include the two main goals of the research. Therefore, the authors must rewrite the title to include all the research objectives.</p> <p>The abstract of the article provides concise information on the objectives, procedure, results & discussion and final conclusions.</p> <p>The subsections and structure of the manuscript are formally appropriate.</p> <p>The manuscript is scientifically correct to a lesser extent. see optional comments,</p> <p>The references are selective and are contemporary to the article. However the scientific names of the plants should be in Italic. The page numbers are not stated in number of references. Some references include the month of publication and some other did not. The formate of the references should be consistent through out the manuscripte and should be in the formate of the Journal.</p> <p>The results and discussion section is quite long and in many cases the authors did not give a deep discussion and only presented their results and those of others. This part should be brief and take a shortcut way to the objectives. Researchers should not elaborate on the explanation, and they should focus on the two main goals. Prolongation makes the readers losing and not focusing.</p>	
<p>Minor REVISION comments</p> <p>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</p>	<p>The language needs big improvement and revises by native English speakers.</p>	
<p>Optional/General comments</p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. There are many topographic and grammatical errors recorded on the page margins. 2. The Soft Ware used in statistically analysis should include publisher, address of the company or main reference. 3. All references in the left column in Table 3 should be in the same format of the Journal. 4. The reference of the equations of Drought tolerance indices should be the original references. 5. The authors should give an interpretation for the minor influence of the environment on grain production and on all indices (Table 4 and Table 5), comparing to the previous studies which showed a significant effect [34-35, 38] 6. The authors should discuss why the other studies showed higher CV% for grain yield in rice [40] comparing to their study. 7. In Figure 1, replace asterisk with the value of correlation to be more visible to the reader to compare. 8. The MP, STI, GMP, and HM indices were separated in PCA on two different quarters, gave an interpretation. 9. Justify why drought indices of the other studies (SSI, TOL, and YSI [44], as well as TOL and SSI [46],) were different from the indices you find to be the best for screening for drought tolerance. Table 7 (MP, STI, GMP, and HM). 10. Write the values in table of the axes of PCA and delete this Table. to avoid repeating the results. 	

Review Form 1.7

	11. Based on Ranking methods, the author inferred that Giza 179, followed by Sakha 104, IET 1444, and GZ 6296-12-1-2-1 showed the best rank mean with an almost low standard deviation and sum of rank.. In the same Table the rank mean of Giza 178 was less than that of GZ6296. How can they justify that.	
--	---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--

PART 2:

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

Reviewer Details:

Name:	Reda Helmy Ahmed Sammour
Department, University & Country	Tanta University, Egypt