

## Review Form 1.7

Journal Name:	<b>Asian Journal of Agricultural and Horticultural Research</b>
Manuscript Number:	<b>Ms_AJHR_97450</b>
Title of the Manuscript:	<b>Evaluation of Garlic Genotypes Under Farmer's Field Condition of Jumla, Nepal</b>
Type of the Article	<b>Original Research Article</b>

### **General guideline for Peer Review process:**

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound. To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<https://www.journalajahr.com/index.php/AJHR/editorial-policy> )

## Review Form 1.7

### PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
<p><b>Compulsory</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Is the manuscript important for scientific community? (Please write few sentences on this manuscript)</li> <li>2. Is the title of the article suitable? (If not please suggest an alternative title)</li> <li>3. Is the abstract of the article comprehensive?</li> <li>4. Are subsections and structure of the manuscript appropriate?</li> <li>5. Do you think the manuscript is scientifically correct?</li> <li>6. Are the references sufficient and recent? If you have suggestion of additional references, please mention in the review form.</li> </ol> <p><b><u>(Apart from above mentioned 6 points, reviewers are free to provide additional suggestions/comments)</u></b></p>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The manuscript adepts to the scope of Asian Journal of Agricultural and Horticultural Research and its importance is based on the exploration of vegetable genotypes cultivation under field conditions.</li> <li>2. The title is suitable.</li> <li>3. The abstract is comprehensive and fits the limit of words proposed by the Journal.</li> <li>4. The subsections have an appropriate structure according to an original research article.</li> <li>5. The manuscript is scientifically correct.</li> <li>6. The references are sufficient and some of them are recent. <b>It is necessary to follow the Author's Guidelines structure:</b> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Hilly M, Adams ML, Nelson SC. A study of digit fusion in the mouse embryo. Clin Exp Allergy. 2002;32(4):489-98.</li> </ol> <p>Note: List the first six authors followed by et al. Note: Use of DOI number for the full-text article is encouraged. (if available). Note: Authors are also encouraged to add other database's unique identifier (like PUBMED ID).</p> <p><b>Key words – Keywords. Author's Guidelines suggests 4-8 words.</b></p> <p><b>2.0 Material and methods</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Describe how the statistical analysis was performed. What kind of tests did you use? (e.g. ANOVA and Tukey's test). Describe mean, F test, CV and Least Significant Difference (LSD).</li> <li>- Check the 'p value' session in Author's Guidelines.</li> </ul> </li> </ol>	
<p><b>Minor</b> REVISION comments</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Is language/English quality of the article suitable for scholarly communications?</li> </ol>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The language is suitable for scholarly communications.</li> </ol> <p><b><u>Below are comments and suggestions to improve the text.</u></b> <b>On formatting, put spacing between number and unity.</b></p> <p><b>Abstract</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- "Compost was used @20t/ha..." – was used at 20 t/ha.</li> <li>- "Selected cloves of garlic were planted with 15cm x 10 cm..." – spacing between number and unity.</li> </ul> <p><b>1.0 Introduction</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- "Garlic (<i>Allium sativum</i> L.) belongs to family <i>Alliaceae</i>..." – Family with no formatting in italics.</li> <li>- "...onion in the world [1]. It is propagated vegetatively." – "...onion in the world and is propagated.vegetatively".</li> <li>- "Garlic is monocotyledonous diploid (2n = 16) plant with rigid asexual life cycle. Garlic is primarily grown for its cloves used mostly as a food flavouring condiment" – "It is a monocotyledonous diploid (2n = 16) plant with rigid asexual life cycle, primarily grown for its cloves and mostly used as food flavouring condiment".</li> <li>- "...cooked in culinary globally. It is also consumed..." – "...cooked in culinary globally and is also consumed...".</li> <li>- "Nepal is a net spices importing country, garlic being a major component, a huge amount of which is imported every year from neighboring countries. This account for a large sum of money outflow from our economy" – "Nepal is a net spices importing country and garlic is being imported every year from neighboring countries in a huge amount, accounting a large sum of money outflow from the economy".</li> <li>- "Though garlic cultivation started years back..." – ago.</li> </ul>	

**Review Form 1.7**

	<p>- "...(POP), has led to it being not very popular for commercial cultivation in Nepal" – "...(POP) demonstrates few applicability in commercial cultivation in Nepal".</p> <p>- "...Egypt, Spain respectively and Nepal..." – "Egypt and Spain, sequentially, and Nepal..."</p> <p>- "...55 ha and the production is 330 ton..." – "...55 hectare (ha) and the production is 330 ton (t)..." (abbreviations must be described for the first time when they are cited).</p> <p>- "...9784 hectare with a total production of 72490 ton..." – "...9784 ha with the total production of 72490 t..."</p> <p>- "...is only 55 hectare and production is 330 ton..." – ha; t.</p> <p>- "However, the agro-climatic condition..." – agroclimatic.</p> <p>- "In the context of no any recommended, registered or released variety of garlic, an elaborate study of the same crop is must for germplasm selection, improvement and release as a new variety along with appropriate package of practices for commercialization of garlic" – "In the context of no recommendation, registration or release of garlic variety, an elaborated study of the same crop is necessary for germplasm selection, improvement and release as a new variety along the appropriate POP for garlic commercialization".</p> <p><b>2.0 Material and methods</b></p> <p>- "...above mean sea level. Its climate is temperate." – "...above mean sea level; with temperate climate".</p> <p>- "...garlic in Jumla. Soil is sandy loam..." – "...garlic in Jumla, which soil is sandy loam..."</p> <p>- "Maximum &amp; minimum average..." – and.</p> <p>- "...17°C to 27°C and -6°C to 17°C. Total rainfall during this year was 468 mm [7]. Similarly, during 2018/19 maximum &amp; minimum average temperature were 11°C to 26°C and -5°C to 16°C and total rainfall was 715mm [8]" – Separate number and unity; maximum and minimum.</p> <p>- "Randomized Complete Block Design (RCBD) was used. Each treatment..." – "...Randomized Complete Block Design (RCBD) was used and each treatment..."</p> <p>- "Observations were collected for plant height..." - Add the observations of bitterness and pungency data explored in the results.</p> <p>- "...longest leaf of 5 randomly selected..." – five.</p> <p>- "The number of leaves...5 randomly selected bulbs..." – replace all '5' presented in the sentences for 'five'.</p> <p>- "...each bulb was calculated. Height of bulb of 5 randomly selected..." – extra spacing; five.</p> <p>- "...converted into yield per hectare and expressed in ton" – ha; t.</p> <p><b>3.0 Results and Discussion</b></p> <p><b>3.1 Plant height</b></p> <p>- "...genotype ARM 01 followed by Arm 04..." – spacing.</p> <p><b>3.3 Length of leaf</b></p> <p>- "...the longest leaves (23.87cm)." - Separate number and unity.</p> <p><b>3.4 Width of leaf</b></p> <p>- "...followed by ARM 04 (2.05cm)..." - Separate number and unity.</p> <p><b>3.5 Diameter of bulb</b></p> <p>- "The result for the mean bulb diameter of genotype showed highly significant (p&lt;0.01) difference. The result indicated that..." – "Data indicated..." (avoid repeating 'the result').</p> <p><b>3.8 Number of bulbs</b></p> <p>- "Total number of bulbs were related..." – was.</p> <p>- "That means higher number of bulbs per hectare..." – ha.</p> <p><b>3.9 Bulb Yield and characteristics</b></p> <p>- "...per hectare. ARM 01 gave the highest bulb yield (29.73 ton) per hectare followed by Kathmandu local (19.4 t/ha), ARM 04 (18.51 t/ha) and Chinese (17.59 t/ha). The lowest bulb yield per hectare (12.34 t/ha)..." – ha; t.</p> <p><b>4.0 Conclusion</b></p> <p>- "...which is 2 to 3 times higher..." – two to three.</p>	
<p><b>Optional/General</b> comments</p>		

[Review Form 1.7](#)

**PART 2:**

	<b>Reviewer's comment</b>	<b>Author's comment</b> <i>(if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)</i>
<b>Are there ethical issues in this manuscript?</b>	<i>(If yes, Kindly please write down the ethical issues here in details)</i>	

**Reviewer Details:**

Name:	<b>Raul Victor da Cruz Apolinário</b>
Department, University & Country	<b>Federal Fluminense University, Brazil</b>